

**CITY OF CHICO PLANNING COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING OF
December 1, 2022
Minutes**

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Council Chambers

Commissioners Present: Toni Scott, Chair
Richard Ober, Vice Chair
Paul Cooper
Dennis Deromedi
Bryce Goldstein
Lindsay Poulin
Larry Wahl

Commissioners Absent:

Staff Members Present: Brendan Vieg, Community Development Director
Bruce Ambo, AICP, Principal Planner
Mike Sawley AICP, Principal Planner
Tina Wilson, Associate Planner
Nicole Acain, Administrative Assistant
Steve Standridge, Fire Chief
Leigh Ann Sutton, Public Works - Engineering Director
Marina Ramirez, Deputy City Attorney
Gloria V. Ramirez, Assistant City Attorney

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Scott called the meeting to order at 6:05 pm.

1.1 *Chair Scott led the Pledge of Allegiance.*

1.2 Commission members and staff were present as noted.

2. CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner Deromedi moved to approve the minutes from the November 3, 2022, meeting.

Commissioner Ober seconded the motion.

The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES: Scott, Ober, Cooper, Deromedi, Goldstein, Poulin, Wahl.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

3. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

4. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- 4.1 Planned Development Permit 22-01 (CCH Humboldt Road Apartments); APN 018-500-160: A proposal to construct 79 senior affordable residential units dispersed in fourplex building modules and 1 manager's unit and associated parking and landscaping improvements on 4.74 acres of an 11.26-acre parcel near the northwest corner of Humboldt Road and Yosemite Drive.** The site is currently designated Medium Density Residential on the City of Chico General Plan Land Use Diagram and is zoned R2 (Medium Density Residential) and within SD-2 (Humboldt Road-Foothill) and -FSDS (Foothill Development and Special Design considerations) overlay zones. The proposed project would include 80 single-story fourplex apartment modules, a clubhouse, parking and landscaping improvements on 4.74 acres on the southwest portion of the 11.26-acre parcel. The vacant portions of the parcel to the north and east would accommodate future development. Pursuant to the SD-2 (Humboldt Road-Foothill) requirement from Chico Municipal Code (CMC) Section 19.52.070(D)(2)(a), an application for a Planned Development Permit (PDP) has been submitted for the project. In accordance with CMC Section 19.28.050, the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board has reviewed the project's architectural design and forwarded a recommendation regarding the PDP application and provided a recommendation for approval to the Planning Commission. The project falls within the scope of the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) for the Oak Valley Subdivision, which was certified by the City Council on September 20, 2005. Pursuant to Section 15162 of the California Environmental Quality Act, no subsequent environmental review is necessary. **Questions regarding this project may be directed to Associate Planner Tina Wilson at (530) 879-6807 or tina.wilson@chicoca.gov.**

Announcement of Ex Parte communications: None.

Associate Planner Tina Wilson presented an overview of the project.

Chair Scott opened the public hearing and invited public comments.

Addressing the Commission on this item were:

Sidney Stone- Applicant

Sean Reese- Field Representative for Northern California Carpenters Union 1599

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Commission, Chair Scott closed the public hearing at 6:18 pm.

Commissioner Poulin moved that the Planning Commission Adopt Resolution No 22-09, approving Planned Development Permit 22-01 for the property Identified as APN 018-500-160 and determining that the project is within the scope of the FEIR prepared for the Oak Valley Subdivision pursuant to Section 15162 of the Guidelines for the California Environmental Quality Act, subject to the recommended conditions contained therein.

Commissioner Cooper seconded the motion.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

AYES: Scott, Ober, Cooper, Deromedi, Goldstein, Poulin, Wahl.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

4.2 **Valley's Edge Specific Plan, General Plan Amendment, Rezone and Development Agreement (SP 19-01, GPA 22-03, RZ 19-01, CA 22-02 and DA 22-01); located between the easterly terminus of East 20th Street and the intersection of Skyway at Honey Run Road within unincorporated Butte County, adjacent to the southeast quadrant of the City of Chico, AP Nos. 018-390-005, 018-390-007, 017-210-005, 017-210-006, 017-240-023, and 017-260-119:** The Valley's Edge Specific Plan (VESP) calls for a mixed-use community that includes a range of housing types, commercial uses, parks, trails, and recreational open space. A circulation plan and an infrastructure and public facilities plan is included. The VESP includes goals and policies for site development along with Design Guidelines that establish architectural, streetscape, landscaping, and lighting standards. Proposed land uses include: Very Low Density Residential (26 acres), Low Density Residential (465 acres), Medium Density Residential (100 acres), Medium-High Density Residential (9 acres), Commercial (56 acres), a 19-acre school site, Primary Open Space (46 acres), Secondary Open Space (687 acres), and street right-of-way on an approximately 1,448-acre site. The site is currently designated Agriculture by the County of Butte and zoned AG-20 (Agriculture with 20-acre minimum lot sizes). Implementation of the VESP will also require annexation of the site into City of Chico city limits, which is to be considered at a future date.

In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was prepared by the City to consider potential impacts associated with development of the VESP, and to provide mitigation measures that would avoid or reduce impacts to less than significant levels. The Draft EIR (State Clearinghouse Number 2019089041) was released for a 45-day public review period from November 1, 2021 to December 15, 2021. During the review period a public meeting was held by the Planning Commission on November 18, 2021 to receive verbal comments on the adequacy of the Draft EIR. A Final EIR was released on October 17, 2022, which included all comments received during the public review period, City responses to comments and issues raised regarding adequacy of the Draft EIR, and edits and clarifications to the Draft EIR. The Draft EIR determined that build-out of the project would result in significant and unavoidable impacts regarding changes to the visual character of the site and greenhouse gas emissions. **Questions regarding this project may be directed to Principal Planner Mike Sawley at (530) 879-6812 or mike.sawley@chicoca.gov.** The EIR is available on the City's website at: <https://chico.ca.us/post/valleys-edge-specific-plan>.

Announcement of Ex Parte communications: Each member of the Commission, except Commissioner Poulin, stated that they received non-city emails from the public for this item and that they did not review those emails. Commissioners Cooper and Deromedi visited the project site. Commissioner Goldstein noted that she submitted comments in November 2021 when the Draft VESP EIR was published. Her comments have been made available to the public. Chair Scott, and Commissioners Deromedi and Wahl spoke with the Applicant, Bill Brouhard.

Principal Planner Mike Sawley presented an overview of the project.

Chair Scott called for a brief recess at 7:28 pm. The meeting was reconvened at 7:44 pm. and all members were present.

Chair Scott opened the public hearing and invited public comments.

Addressing the Commission on this item were:

Bill Brouhard- Applicant, Noah Zoppi, Elizabeth Devereaux, Joshua Pierce, Greg Melton, Marty Dunlap, Suzanne Bresina-Hutton, Sarah Salisbury, Gabrielle Broche, Jacquelyn Chase, Gayle Womack, Gracie Marvin, Brian Spilman, Ken Sobon, Austin Barron, Susan Tchudi, Nancy McCune, Eric Nilsson, Ann Ponzio, John Howlett, and Leonard Gundert.

Chair Scott called for a brief recess at 8:56 pm. The meeting was reconvened at 9:03 pm. and all members were present.

Addressing the Commission on this item following the recess were:

Steven Cismowski, Steve Rockwell, Anne Anderson, Julian Zener, Bill Loker, Brent Silberbauer, Alora Flucard, Jesica Giannola, Jared Geiser, Maggie Scarpa, Jeff Glatz, Brian Kress, Mary Kay Benson, Emily Alma, Mark Stemen, Courtney Casey, Allen Harthorn, Pamela Posey, Karen Laslo, Mike Trolinder, Nichole Nava, Ann Bykerk-Kauffman, Bill Brouhard - Applicant.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Commission, Chair Scott closed the public hearing at 10:04 pm.

Commissioner Wahl moved that the Planning Commission Adopt Resolution No 22-10, recommending that the City Council certify the EIR, adopt the Statement of Overriding Considerations, and approve the Valley's Edge Specific Plan and related applications (SP 19-01, RZ 19-01, CA 22-02, GPA 22-03, and DA 22-01).

Commissioner Cooper seconded the motion.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

AYES: Scott, Cooper, Deromedi, Poulin, Wahl.

NOES: Ober, Goldstein.

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: None.

5. REGULAR AGENDA

None.

6. REPORTS AND COMMUNICATION

None.

7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:47 pm. to the following regular meeting of Thursday, December 15, 2022.

Date Approved

Bruce Ambo, Principal Planner
Community Development Department /
Planning Commission Secretary