



Sustainability Task Force

A Committee of the Chico City Council
Vice Mayor Schwab, Chair

Meeting of July 21, 2008 – 3:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.

Council Chamber Building, 421 Main Street, Conference Room No. 1

AGENDA

1. **Report from the Ad-Hoc Committee Regarding Establishing a Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions Reduction Target and Climate Action Plan.**

At its 6/2/08 meeting, the Task Force approved recommending a GHG emissions reduction target of 25% from 2005 levels by 2020. The Task Force also formed an Ad Hoc Committee to further review potential actions that may be needed to achieve this target before forwarding this recommendation to the City Council. The Ad-Hoc Committee met on 6/25/08 and 7/16/08 and will report on their discussions. ***The Committee recommends that the Sustainability Task Force forward the draft greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions inventory and the recommendation to establish the 25% reduction of 2005 GHG levels by the year 2020 emission reduction target to the City Council. The Committee also recommends that the Task Force request that the City Council authorize the Task Force to pursue the preparation of a Climate Action Plan to achieve this reduction target.***

2. **Consideration of the Draft Local Government Operations and Urban Forest Project Reporting Protocols.**

The Task Force will review the Draft Local Government Operations and Urban Forest Project reporting protocols recently released by the California Air Resources Board, ICLEI, and the California Climate Action Registry. The following website link to copies of these protocols was previously provided to the Task Force. <http://www.climateregistry.org/tools/protocols/protocols-in-progress.html>.

3. **Reports and Communications:**

a. **Request from Butte County Air Quality Management District and Dr. Incaudo Regarding Air Quality** - This item was referred to the Task Force by the City Council and will be agendized for the Task Force's 8/4/08 meeting.

4. **Business from the Floor** – Members of the public may address the Committee at this time on any matter not already listed on the agenda, with comments being limited to three minutes. The Committee cannot take any action at this meeting on requests made under this section of the agenda.

5. **Adjournment** – The meeting will adjourn no later than 5:00 p.m. The next meeting of the Sustainability Task Force will be on August 4, 2008 - unless cancelled. All meetings are held from 3:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m. in Conference Room No. 1 in the Council Chamber Building.

Distribution available in the office of the City Clerk:

Prepared: 7/18/08
Posted : 7/18/08
Prior to: 5:00 p..m.

Chico City Clerk's Office
411 Main Street, Chico, CA 95928
(530) 896-7250



Please contact the City Clerk at 896-7250 should you require an agenda in an alternative format or if you need to request a disability-related modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting. This request should be received at least three working days prior to the meeting in order to accommodate your request.

Members:

Jason Bougie
Jim Goodwin
Dr. Scott G. McNall
Jim Stevens

Kristin Cooper - Carter
Ken Grossman
Jim Pushnik
Scott Wolf

Tom DiGiovanni
Amelia Gulling
Tami Ritter
Julian Zener

Chris Giampaoli
Jon Luvaas
Ann Schwab, Chair



Sustainability Task Force Agenda Staff Report

Meeting Date: 7/21/08

DATE: July 17, 2008
TO: SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE
FROM: AD-HOC COMMITTEE
RE: ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REGARDING GREENHOUSE GAS INVENTORY

RECOMMENDATION:

The Ad-Hoc Committee recommends that the Sustainability Task Force forward the draft greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions inventory and a recommendation to establish a GHG emission reduction target of a 25% reduction of 2005 GHG levels by the year 2020 to the City Council for consideration at its 9/2/08 meeting. The Committee also recommends that the Task Force request that the City Council authorize the Task Force to pursue the preparation of a Climate Action Plan to achieve this reduction target.

BACKGROUND:

At its 6/2/08 meeting, the Task Force approved (9-1-5, five absent) recommending a GHG emissions reduction target of a 25% reduction from 2005 levels by 2020. The Task Force also formed an Ad Hoc Committee to further review potential actions that may be needed to achieve this target before forwarding this recommendation to the City Council. In particular, Task Force members were interested in obtaining more specific information regarding whether a 25% reduction was achievable and feasible.

DISCUSSION:

The Ad-Hoc Committee, which included Task Force members Bougie, Guilling, Luvaas, Ritter, Schwab and Zenner, met on 6/25/08 and 7/16/08. The Committee discussed the different emission reduction measures listed in Appendix C of the greenhouse gas inventory prepared by CSU, Chico Research Foundation (attached as Exhibit A). Because the transportation sector represents most of the greenhouse gas emissions generated, the Committee concentrated on this sector and identified potential action items that may help the City achieve the 25% reduction. The Committee's notes on action items are attached as Exhibit B.

The Committee also discussed two protocols, one to assist local governments in conducting GHG inventories and in quantifying emissions, and another to provide standards in determining carbon sequestration from urban forest projects, that were recently prepared and released in collaboration by the California Air Resources Board, ICLEI and the California Climate Action Registry. Website links to copies of these protocols were previously provided to the Task Force and can be found at <http://www.climateregistry.org/tools/protocols/protocols-in-progress.html>.

The Committee also reviewed GHG emission reduction actions being proposed by other cities, and most recently a list of actions submitted in a letter to the County of Tulare by the State Attorney Generals Office commenting on its draft General Plan Update. Excerpts of this letter with the list of measures are attached for the Task Force's information (Exhibit C). The website link to the entire 20-page letter as well as links to other communities' climate action plan information can be found on the attached email provided by Committee and Task Force member Luvaas (Exhibit D).

Based on their discussions and review of potential actions, the Committee believes that a GHG emissions reduction target of 25% from 2005 levels by the year 2020 is viable. The Committee also recommends obtaining City Council approval of the GHG inventory and emissions reduction target prior to developing a Climate Action Plan. If approved by the Task Force, the Committee will continue to meet over the next month to develop a strategy and potential funding sources to prepare a Plan to be provided to the Task Force at its 8/18/08 meeting and to Council on 9/2/08.

ATTACHMENTS:

- Exhibit A: GHG Inventory Action List
- Exhibit B: Ad-Hoc Committee meeting notes
- Exhibit C: Sample actions listed in Tulare County Attorney General Letter
- Exhibit D: Email from Jon Luvaas

8. Appendix C: Emissions Reduction Measures by Sector

8.1. Community Emissions Reduction Measures

Community Reduction Measures	
Residential and Commercial Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Renewable energy	Residential and Commercial renewable energy projects will decrease the amount of purchased electricity and resulting emissions.
Green/reflective roofing	Roofs are black, which absorbs the hot summer sun and creates higher cooling costs. Adding green or reflective coating on roofing material minimizes heat absorption and diminishes cooling costs in summer.
Housing/Building retrofits	Increasing efficiency in older Chico homes and buildings will decrease the amount of purchased electricity and resulting emissions. Examples of retrofits may include increased insulation, double pane windows, insulated window coverings, sealing air leaks, etc.
Water conservation through residential and commercial ordinances	Every gallon conserved is one less gallon pumped, resulting in less purchased electricity. Examples of water conserving ordinances may include volume pricing, time of use restrictions, xero-landscaping, etc.
Water conservation through technological means	Encourage use of water conservation through technological improvements. (i.e., water catchment systems, low flow toilets (dual flush toilets), shower head replacement, drip line irrigation, water/energy efficient washing machines, etc.)
Lighting retrofits	More efficient lighting results in less purchased electricity and resulting emissions. Examples include converting incandescent light bulbs to compact fluorescents or fluorescent tube lighting (T8's and T5's).
Appliance retrofits	Replacing older, less efficient appliances with Energy Star appliances will result in less purchased electricity and associated emissions.
Go beyond title 24	Promote residential and commercial construction to exceed Title 24 energy efficiency standards.
Solar hot water	Solar hot water heaters will reduce electrical and natural gas usage and resulting emissions.

Energy audits	Require energy audits at time of sale of residential and commercial properties.
Specific Residential Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Woodstove retrofits	Replacing older woodstoves and fireplaces with EPA /BQAQMD approved woodstoves will reduce residentially generated particulate matter.
Christmas lights exchanged	Offering a LED Christmas light trade-in to Chico residents.
Specific Commercial Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Energy tracking	Promote commercial establishments to use energy tracking and management systems (i.e., sub-metering, TEDs™, Energy Manager position.)
Occupancy sensors	Promote and educate about occupancy sensors in low use areas.
Lights out at night policies	Implement a lights out at night policy for all commercial buildings.
HVAC retrofits	Promote or provide HVAC incentives for commercial buildings.
Promote LEED certified or Green Buildings	Provide technical assistance, financial assistance, or other significant incentives to commercial development.
Purchase RECs	Reward commercial business for purchasing renewable energy certificates.
Waste Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Improved compost facility	In 2005, the City of Chico diverted 1,296 MTCO ₂ E by composting 7,084 tons of plant debris at the Cohasset Compost Facility. This facility is nearing capacity and is not equipped to handle food waste. The same year, over 11,000 tons of food waste was taken to landfills. By diverting this portion of the waste stream to a composting facility the community could drastically reduce its carbon footprint, create new jobs, and turn a profit as demonstrated by Jepson Prairie Organics (see inset below).
Restructure fee rates	Currently, on a per ton basis commercial businesses that waste more pay less. This current fee rate structure does not offer incentive for commercial business to reduce its level of waste.

Re-franchising	If the two waste disposal companies within the City were to bid for exclusive sales rights by neighborhood, this would not only reduce the City's waste but also reduce the level of air pollution, noise pollution, costs associated with road maintenance, and the level of emissions that are created from the two companies covering the same neighborhoods. The City could divide areas up, so that each company could have complete control over specific blocks. This would reduce the need to have both waste disposal companies driving down the same blocks twice.
Recycling coordinator	Appoint recycling coordinator to oversee all community waste-related programs. This position could also include government waste programs.
Compost wastewater sludge	Utilize sludge material from the WPCP as nutrient rich compost for community athletic recreation fields.
Plastic bags	Ban plastic bags.
	Bring your own bag campaign.
Recycling programs	Establish or expand recycling programs in the community (i.e., education, pamphlets).
Transportation Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measures	Description
Time traffic control lighting	Timing traffic control lights can reduce idling and decrease commute time, reducing GHGs and CAPs.
Community bio-diesel purchasing co-op	Forming a biodiesel co-op can reduce diesel generated emissions and allow local restaurants to save on used oil disposal fees.
Gas tax	By implementing a local gas tax the City could generate revenue that could be put toward sustainable projects.
Promote public transit	Improve public transit and rideshare facilities.
	Increasing bus route frequency would make the public transit system more convenient and could increase ridership.
	Provide high school students with complimentary bus tickets.
Low emitting vehicle Privileges	Electric fueling station—provide free or low-cost electric fueling stations for E.V.s
	Preferential parking—provide free or low-cost prime parking locations for L.E.V.s, E.V.s, and hybrids
Community bicycle programs	Synchronize bicycle trails with transit.
Promote purchase of	Improve bicycle infrastructure (i.e., routes, parking, etc.).

LEVs	Provide community (shared) bikes in high use areas.
	Promote community purchases of low emitting vehicles (i.e., electric vehicles, compacts and hybrids).
Alternative fuels	Promote alternative fuel vehicles and conversions for community residents. (i.e., CNG, biodiesel, LPG, ethanol, etc.)
Online services	Encourage local buses and taxis to use alternative fuels by subsidizing conversion equipment.
	Offer services online and/or via phone at reduced rates to encourage trip reduction.
Pedestrian traffic	Slow street traffic, improve sidewalks and safety, and develop pedestrian only areas.

8.2. Government Emissions Reduction Measures

Government Reduction Measures	
Vehicle Fleet Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Police officers on bicycles	Assigning a small contingent of police officers would reduce emissions, increase police presence, and promote a healthy lifestyle.
Office bicycles	If government facilities had “office bikes” employees could run local errands without using emissions generating vehicles.
Alternative fuels	Both LPG and CNG are available in the Chico area and are barely utilized as a fleet fuel. Converting or purchasing vehicles to run on LPG or CNG fuels would cut emissions as they emit less GHGs and CAPs
Driver efficiency training	Trip Planning—City employees should take the time to plan out their routes in the most efficient manner possible.
	No idling—reducing idling reduces emissions, as an idling engine gets zero MPG.
Electronic conferencing	When possible, meetings (especially out of town meetings) could be held over the phone or video conference.
Efficiency standards	Purchasing policy for future vehicle purchases should meet a predetermined MPG and emissions rating.
“Plug-in Chico”	The city could join the “Plug-in Partners” campaign and make a “soft order” to show the auto industry that there is a municipal fleet market for plug-in vehicles. Visit http://www.pluginpartners.org for more information.

Building Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Lighting retrofits	Lighting retrofits such as switching from T-12s to T-8s, T-5s, or Super T-8s can result in large energy savings; there are many rebates for this.
Energy audits	Conduct an energy audit for each building, starting with the older ones. PG&E can provide this service.
Thermostat changes	Change thermostats to a few degrees warmer in the summer and a few degrees cooler in the winter. Implement a policy on the temperature changes.
Windows	Implement a policy that all new windows installed must be double-paned.
Sub-metering for all buildings	Sub-metering is very important when tracking the energy consumption of a building in order to monitor usage. Specifically, this needs to be done in the 901 Fir Building group.
Government building Energy Manager	Appoint an energy manager to monitor buildings and continuously retrofit the buildings.
Old Municipal Center	Even though this building is not in use it cost the City \$9,021 in electrical usage and \$1,888 in natural gas usage from 2005 to 2007.
Water/Sewage Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Co-generation	Use methane produced from the digesters as an alternative fuel source.
Compost sludge/cake	Use tested sludge/cake as a fertilizer rather than sending it to the landfill.
Water reclamation	Use treated water for irrigation.
Equipment improvements	Purchase most efficient pumps and other treatment facility equipment.
Additional solar	Increase the size (capacity) of current solar array.
Waste Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Recycling coordinator	Appoint recycling coordinator to oversee all waste-related programs. This position could also include community waste programs.
Environmentally preferable purchasing	Purchase products or services that have a lesser or reduced effect on waste, human health, and the environment.

Facility waste analysis	Assess each government facility for waste reduction potentials.
Recycling containers	Increase the number, quality, and signage of recycling containers in parks, buildings, and other government facilities.
Reusable mugs/canteens	Provide or promote the use of reusable beverage containers for city employees.
Refillable ink cartridges	Purchase/lease printers and copiers that use refillable ink cartridges.
One-sided printing	Reload printers and copiers with reused paper.
Street Light Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Reduce usage time	Reduce the amount of time streetlights operate by setting times or adjusting light sensors.
Reduce number of lights	Remove unnecessary lights.
Lighting retrofits	Convert Traffic Control Lights to light emitting diode (LED) technology.
	Convert street and highway lighting to either LED or high pressure sodium vapor (HPS).
Policies	Implement a policy standard for all new streetlights and traffic lights.
Employee Commute Reduction Measures	
Reduction Measure	Description
Parking spot rebates	City employees could receive payment in exchange for the parking spot.
Bike/Walk incentives	While the City already offers gift certificates for those who bike or walk, they could increase the amount or offer cash incentives.
Low emitting vehicle Privileges	The city could offer those who solely drive LEV's to work prime parking locations.
Van pools	The city could offer a service where employees living in adjacent neighborhoods ride to work in van pool vehicles.
Bus ridership incentives	Flexible work schedule for those utilizing the transit bus service.
Free EV filling stations	For employees who own electric vehicles the City could provide prime parking locations that offer free electric filling stations.

SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE AD-HOC COMMITTEE
6/25/08 MEETING NOTES

Emissions Reduction Measures By Sector

- Residential and Commercial Reduction Measures
 - Green Building Codes
 - Green Roofs
 - City Demonstration on top of Council Chamber Building
 - Reflective Coating Roofs
 - Bond/CBDG funds to pay for property owners to make energy reductions/solar/retrofits

- Transportation Reduction Measures
 - Encourage community car-sharing (run a program as municipality/support for-profits that give care-sharing service, eg Zipcar)
 - Low emitting vehicle privileges
 - Legalize electric golf carts
 - Reduced fee or free parking for electric/hybrid vehicles
 - Promote car pools
 - Preferential (reduced fee or free parking) parking for car pool vehicles (register with City, preferential parking spots, similar to ADA parking.
 - Schools
 - Public Parking
 - Employers
 - Advisory to University regarding car prohibition for first year students, lottery or priority for students to receive residential dormitory placement
 - Expand local or regional bus service in range and/or frequency
 - Increase head times
 - Meet with citizen advisory groups (comprised of those who currently don't ride the bus)
 - Identify routes that would benefit from increased head times
 - Downtown trolley
 - Provide schedules in bus shelters
 - Provide countdown timers at bus stops
 - Refer to Boulder, CO bus system
 - Increase Bicycle use
 - Finish connections to current system
 - Safe routes to schools
 - Bicycle valet
 - Yellow bike program
 - Promote safe bike riding by more enforcement at beginning of semester

- Bike preference lights
 - Quicker response to bike light buttons
- Increase Pedestrian Traffic
 - Countdown times on traffic signals
 - Quicker response to bike light buttons
- Reduce idling
 - Ban new drive-throughs
 - Education/signing requirement for existing drive-throughs
 - Improve traffic signal synchronization/decrease stop rate and time
- Garbage service
 - Divide City into zones, so that garbage services aren't duplicated in same neighborhood
- Leaf pick up
 - No City pick up of leaves from landscape companies
- Reduce City employee commute trips
 - 4-day work weeks
 - Telecommuting
 - Increased use of technology
 - Driver education classes to promote energy efficiency



The California Environmental Quality Act
Addressing Global Warming Impacts at the Local Agency Level

Under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), local agencies have a very important role to play in California's fight against global warming – one of the most serious environmental effects facing the State today. Where local agencies undertake projects directly, they can and should design sustainable projects from the start, incorporating global warming related considerations into their projects at the earliest feasible time. Further, local agencies can encourage well-designed, sustainable private projects by analyzing and disclosing to the public the environmental benefits of such projects in any required environmental documents. And where projects as proposed will have significant global warming related effects, local agencies can require feasible changes or alternatives, and impose enforceable, verifiable, feasible mitigation measures to substantially lessen those effects. By the sum of their decisions, local agencies will help to move the State away from "business as usual" and toward a low-carbon future.

This document provides information that may be helpful to local agencies in carrying out their duties under CEQA as they relate to global warming. Included in this document are various measures that may reduce the global warming related impacts of a project. As appropriate, the measures can be included as design features of a project, required as changes to the project, or imposed as mitigation (whether undertaken directly by the project proponent or funded by mitigation fees). The measures set forth in this package are examples; the list is not intended to be exhaustive. Moreover, the measures cited may not be appropriate for every project. The decision of whether to approve a project – as proposed or with required changes or mitigation – is for the local agency, exercising its informed judgment in compliance with the law and balancing a variety of public objectives.

The first section of this document lists examples of measures that could be applied to a diverse range of projects where the lead agency determines that the project under consideration will have significant global warming related effects. In general, a given measure should not be considered in isolation, but as part of a larger set of measures that, working together, will reduce greenhouse gas emissions and the effects of global warming.

The second section of this document lists examples of potential greenhouse gas reduction measures in the general plan context. This section is included both to suggest how the measures set forth in the first section could be incorporated into a general plan, as well as to identify measures that are general plan specific. The measures in the second section may also be appropriate for inclusion in larger scale plans, including regional plans (e.g., blueprint plans) and in specific plans. Including these types of measures at the larger planning level, as appropriate, will help to ensure more sustainable project-specific development.

The third section provides links to sources of information on global warming impacts and emission reduction measures. The list is not complete, but may be a helpful start for local agencies seeking more information to carry out their CEQA obligations as they relate to global warming.

The endnotes set forth just some of the many examples of exemplary emission reduction measures already being implemented by local governments and agencies, utilities, private industry, and others. As these examples evidence, California at every level of government is taking up the challenge, devising new and innovative solutions, and leading the charge in the fight against global warming.

(1) Generally Applicable Measures

Energy Efficiency¹

- Design buildings to be energy efficient. Site buildings to take advantage of shade, prevailing winds, landscaping and sun screens to reduce energy use.²
- Install efficient lighting and lighting control systems. Use daylight as an integral part of lighting systems in buildings.
- Install light colored “cool” roofs, cool pavements, and strategically placed shade trees.³
- Provide information on energy management services for large energy users.⁴
- Install energy efficient heating and cooling systems, appliances and equipment, and control systems.⁵
- Install light emitting diodes (LEDs) for traffic, street and other outdoor lighting.⁶
- Limit the hours of operation of outdoor lighting.
- Use solar heating, automatic covers, and efficient pumps and motors for pools and spas.⁷
- Provide education on energy efficiency.⁸

Renewable Energy

- Install solar and wind power systems, solar and tankless hot water heaters, and energy-efficient heating ventilation and air conditioning. Educate consumers about existing incentives.⁹
- Install solar panels on carports and over parking areas.¹⁰
- Use combined heat and power in appropriate applications.¹¹

Water Conservation and Efficiency¹²

- Create water-efficient landscapes.¹³
- Install water-efficient irrigation systems and devices, such as soil moisture-based irrigation controls.
- Use reclaimed water for landscape irrigation in new developments and on public property. Install the infrastructure to deliver and use reclaimed water.
- Design buildings to be water-efficient. Install water-efficient fixtures and appliances.
- Use graywater. (Graywater is untreated household waste water from bathtubs, showers, bathroom wash basins, and water from clothes washing machines.) For example, install dual plumbing in all new development allowing graywater to be used for landscape irrigation.¹⁴
- Restrict watering methods (*e.g.*, prohibit systems that apply water to non-vegetated surfaces) and control runoff.
- Restrict the use of water for cleaning outdoor surfaces and vehicles.
- Implement low-impact development practices that maintain the existing hydrologic character of the site to manage storm water and protect the environment. (Retaining storm water runoff on-

site can drastically reduce the need for energy-intensive imported water at the site.)¹⁵

- Devise a comprehensive water conservation strategy appropriate for the project and location. The strategy may include many of the specific items listed above, plus other innovative measures that are appropriate to the specific project.
- Provide education about water conservation and available programs and incentives.¹⁶

Solid Waste Measures

- Reuse and recycle construction and demolition waste (including, but not limited to, soil, vegetation, concrete, lumber, metal, and cardboard).
- Provide interior and exterior storage areas for recyclables and green waste and adequate recycling containers located in public areas.
- Recover by-product methane to generate electricity.¹⁷
- Provide education and publicity about reducing waste and available recycling services.¹⁸

Land Use Measures

- Include mixed-use, infill, and higher density in development projects to support the reduction of vehicle trips, promote alternatives to individual vehicle travel, and promote efficient delivery of services and goods.¹⁹
- Educate the public about the benefits of well-designed, higher density development.²⁰
- Incorporate public transit into project design.
- Preserve and create open space and parks. Preserve existing trees, and plant replacement trees at a set ratio.
- Develop “brownfields” and other underused or defunct properties near existing public transportation and jobs.
- Include pedestrian and bicycle-only streets and plazas within developments. Create travel routes that ensure that destinations may be reached conveniently by public transportation, bicycling or walking.²¹

Transportation and Motor Vehicles

- Limit idling time for commercial vehicles, including delivery and construction vehicles.
- Use low or zero-emission vehicles, including construction vehicles.
- Promote ride sharing programs *e.g.*, by designating a certain percentage of parking spaces for ride sharing vehicles, designating adequate passenger loading and unloading and waiting areas for ride sharing vehicles, and providing a web site or message board for coordinating rides.
- Create car sharing programs. Accommodations for such programs include providing parking spaces for the car share vehicles at convenient locations accessible by public transportation.²²
- Create local “light vehicle” networks, such as neighborhood electric vehicle (NEV) systems.²³
- Provide the necessary facilities and infrastructure to encourage the use of low or zero-emission vehicles (*e.g.*, electric vehicle charging facilities and conveniently located alternative fueling

stations).

- Increase the cost of driving and parking private vehicles by, *e.g.*, imposing tolls and parking fees.
- Build or fund a transportation center where various public transportation modes intersect.
- Provide shuttle service to public transit.
- Provide public transit incentives such as free or low-cost monthly transit passes.
- Incorporate bicycle lanes and routes into street systems, new subdivisions, and large developments.
- Incorporate bicycle-friendly intersections into street design.
- For commercial projects, provide adequate bicycle parking near building entrances to promote cyclist safety, security, and convenience. For large employers, provide facilities that encourage bicycle commuting, including, *e.g.*, locked bicycle storage or covered or indoor bicycle parking.
- Create bicycle lanes and walking paths directed to the location of schools, parks and other destination points.²⁴
- Work with the school district to restore or expand school bus services.
- Institute a telecommute work program. Provide information, training, and incentives to encourage participation. Provide incentives for equipment purchases to allow high-quality teleconferences.
- Provide information on all options for individuals and businesses to reduce transportation-related emissions. Provide education and information about public transportation.

Carbon Offsets

If, after analyzing and requiring all reasonable and feasible on-site mitigation measures for avoiding or reducing greenhouse gas-related impacts, the lead agency determines that additional mitigation is required, the agency may consider additional off-site mitigation. The project proponent could, for example, fund off-site mitigation projects (*e.g.*, alternative energy projects, or energy or water audits for existing projects) that will reduce carbon emissions, conduct an audit of its other existing operations and agree to retrofit, or purchase carbon “credits” from another entity that will undertake mitigation.

The topic of offsets can be complicated, and a full discussion is outside the scope of this summary document. Issues that the lead agency should consider include:

- The location of the off-site mitigation. (If the off-site mitigation is far from the project, any additional, non-climate related benefits of the mitigation will be lost to the local community.)
- Whether the emissions reductions from off-site mitigation can be quantified and verified.
- Whether the mitigation ratio should be greater than 1:1 to reflect any uncertainty about the effectiveness of the offset.

Linda Herman - Attorney General's Requirement to Comprehensively Address Climate Change in General Plans

From: "Jon Luvaas" <jonluvaas@gmail.com>
To: "Steve Peterson" <SPeterso@ci.chico.ca.us>, "Holly Keeler" <hkeeler@ci.chico.ca.us>, "Brendan Vieg" <bviég@ci.chico.ca.us>
Date: 7/17/2008 9:01 AM
Subject: Attorney General's Requirement to Comprehensively Address Climate Change in General Plans
CC: "Linda Herman" <lherman@ci.chico.ca.us>, "Dave Burkland" <dburklan@ci.chico.ca.us>, "Debbie Presson" <dpresson@ci.chico.ca.us>

This letter is to provide information for the benefit of City staff, consultants, and decision makers as we begin the process of evaluating growth area alternatives and policies for our updated General Plan and prepare our Climate Action Plan. Please include this in the Council and Commission packets for our August 5 joint workshop. This should also be helpful to the Sustainability Task Force as it begins considering policy recommendations, so please provide a copy to its members as well. Thankyou.

As you probably know, the California Attorney General is closely monitoring new city and county general plans and their EIRs to assure that local policies will lead to quickly ending local increases in the greenhouse gas emissions (GHGs) contributing to climate change, and help to significantly reduce emissions, statewide, within the short time frame established by AB 32. AB 32 designates these proliferating gas emissions as a critically significant and urgent environmental impact and establishes a firm state policy that they must not be allowed to further accumulate in the environment as a result of human activity. Since the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires elimination or mitigation of such significant impacts, the Attorney General has determined that California law now requires all General Plans to include strong and specific policies and timelines to ensure early reduction of these emissions. Their GP monitoring is designed to assure that. You are probably aware that San Bernardino County was sued by the AG to require a very comprehensive rewrite because they failed to resolve these concerns.

Our City Council has also committed Chico to meet the goals of the U.S. Mayors Climate Protection Agreement, which are even more aggressive than AB 32. Our updated General Plan must include sufficient policies to assure that we will at least meet the goals of AB 32 and the expectations of the Attorney General, and perhaps approach the goals of the U.S. Mayors Agreement. Since the Agreement, the Attorney General, and the EIRs prepared for other general plans all identify suburban sprawl and its associated auto-dependent traffic as primary local contributors to GHG emissions, the City will need to select growth areas and adopt firm policies designed to make Chico much less auto-dependent, stop the further accumulation of local GHG emissions, and rapidly reduce them.

To help us avoid the shortcomings of many other new General Plans reviewed by the Attorney General, I'm sending links to AG letters sent to various cities and counties critiquing their updates and EIRs. See <http://www.ag.ca.gov/globalwarming/ceqa/comments.php> for a complete list. The inadequacies of General Plans and EIRs in other communities, which the AG requires significant further analysis and rewriting to correct, include imprecise and advisory policies (rather than mandatory), vague implementation plans and timelines, insufficient EIR analysis of emissions from growth alternatives, unconvincing proof that the selected alternative will result in the lowest emissions, and inadequate overriding concerns to justify failing to reduce GHG emissions. (Given the seriousness of the impacts, it appears likely that no overriding concerns will be considered sufficient to justify continued buildup of emissions.)

Even Petaluma's forward-looking General Plan, which includes goals and policies for significant greenhouse gas reductions, was found to lack sufficient specificity, adequate mandates, and clear implementation plans and timelines. The AG's letter at http://ag.ca.gov/globalwarming/pdf/comments_Petaluma_plan.pdf can be very useful to us by providing concrete suggestions for policies they will consider adequate under California law, as well as informative factual and legal background we could (and should) include in our General Plan to support strong emissions reduction policies.

(The introduction to sustainability in Marin County's Countywide Plan

Exhibit D-1

http://www.co.marin.ca.us/depts/cd/main/fm/cwpdocs/CWP_CD2.pdf (pages 15-24) also provides well-illustrated educational materials about the urgency for communities to combat climate change. Including detailed rationale and illustrations like Marin's and the AG's in our General Plan and Climate Action Plan would help inform decision makers and the public about the environmental, human health, economic, and legal necessity for strong GHG emissions reduction policies.)

Solano County as well, with innovative new policies to reduce sprawl, auto travel and ghg emissions, was required to make its policies, EIR, and implementation plans more explicit and mandatory in order to assure that their goals for aggressive emissions reductions are actually met. The AG's letter provides detailed policy language and EIR requirements to make Solano's (and our) General Plan adequate under California law: http://ag.ca.gov/globalwarming/pdf/comments_Solano_general_plan.pdf.

Finally, the letters to Tulare County and San Diego also provide useful and detailed suggestions for GP policy and EIR analysis. The letter to Tulare includes an excellent attachment listing specific measures and implementation steps we should consider for our General Plan and Climate Action Plan. See: http://ag.ca.gov/globalwarming/pdf/comment_tulare_county_general_plan.pdf. http://ag.ca.gov/globalwarming/pdf/comments_SanDiego_General_plan.pdf.

We need not reinvent the wheel. These letters and attachments can save our planners, consultants, and decision makers considerable time and effort in preparing adequate policy, greenhouse gas reduction measures, and the rationale and environmental analysis to support them. If the AG requires us to make significant General Plan and EIR changes late in the adoption process, as others have, it will add significant delays and costs to Plan adoption. Making use of the AG's proposals now should help assure that our Plan and EIR are strong and legally adequate before the Attorney General reviews them.

Thank you.

Jon Luvaas

2525 Dominic Drive, Suite J
Chico, CA 95928
(530) 891-2882
(530) 891-2878 Fax



W. James Wagoner
Air Pollution Control Officer
Robert McLaughlin
Asst. Air Pollution Control Officer

April 9, 2008

David Burkland, City Manager
City of Chico
411 Main Street
Chico, CA 95927

Dear Mr. Burkland:

The Butte County Air Quality Management District staff and Dr. Gary Incaudo would like to request an opportunity to address the Chico City Council concerning the air pollution that Butte County and, in particular, the City of Chico is experiencing. Increasingly, health studies in recent years have indicated both ozone and particulate pollution is more hazardous to our health than previously thought. For many years, we have received a grade of "F" for ozone air pollution in the summer months from the American Lung Association State of the Air reports. The Chico area regularly exceeds a new Federal standard for small respirable air pollution particles during the winter months.

We would like to present the health concerns with these pollutants, what are the major contributors, discussion of District air quality programs and offer the Council suggestions on how Chico can help to mitigate this major health risk and bring us into compliance with mandated Federal and State standards.

We appreciate your time and effort in processing this request. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact Gary Incaudo at 864-0841 or Jim Wagoner at 891-2882.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Gary Incaudo", written over a circular stamp.

Gary A. Incaudo, M.D.

CM	1	ACM	1	ASD		FILE	1
CLK	1	ED/RDA		CA	1	ACA	
COUNCIL	7	ISD		O&M			
HRD/RM		FD		GSD		BDS	1
CPSD	1	PSD		HNSD			
PROJ M		COF		FE		MA	
AA		OTHER					

W. James Wagoner, Air Pollution Control Officer
Butte County Air Quality Management District

6-GA-1-15