



Sustainability Task Force Agenda

A Committee of the Chico City Council
Mayor Ann Schwab, Chair

Meeting of June 4, 2012 – 5:30 p.m. to 7:30 p.m.
Conference Room No. 1 in the Council Chamber Building, 421 Main Street, Chico

1. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE 5-7-12 TASK SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE MEETING** (Exhibit “A”).

2. **CONSIDERATION OF THE INITIAL DRAFT OF THE CITY OF CHICO 2020 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN.**

The Task Force will continue its review of the initial draft of the 2020 Climate Action Plan (CAP). Written comments on the CAP received from Task Force members Luvaas and Chapman are attached in Exhibit “B” and a copy of the initial draft can be obtained on the City’s website at the following link:

http://www.ci.chico.ca.us/government/minutes_agendas/sustainability_task_force.asp.

3. **REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS** - No Action Required

- a. **Sustainable Business Program**: The Education and Outreach Ad-Hoc Committee will provide an update on the refinement of the logo design and the kick-off dates.
- b. **Plastic Bag Ordinance**: The City Council’s Internal Affairs Committee will consider the potential plastic bag restriction ordinance at its meeting at 8:00 a.m. on Tuesday, June 12, 2012. The meeting will be held in Conference Room 1 of the Council Chamber building at 421 Main Street.
- c. **Statewide Commercial Recycling Mandate**: Staff will update the Task Force on AB 341, which established a mandatory statewide recycling requirement on commercial businesses that generate 4 cubic yards or more of trash per week, and multifamily complexes with 5 or more units. One of the purposes of the mandate, which becomes effective on July 1, 2012, is to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

4. **BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR**

Members of the public may address the Task Force at this time on any matter not already listed on the agenda, with comments being limited to three minutes. The Task Force cannot take any action at this meeting on requests made under this section of the agenda.

5. **ADJOURNMENT** – The meeting will adjourn no later than 7:30 p.m. to a regular meeting scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Monday, July 2, 2012, unless otherwise noticed .

ATTACHMENTS:

Exhibit “A”: Minutes of 5/7/12 Meeting

Exhibit “B”: CAP comments from Luvaas and Chapman

Distribution available from the General Services Department or the City website at www.ci.chico.ca.us under **“Meetings/Agendas”**

Prepared: 5/30/12
Posted : 5/30/12
Prior to: 5:30 p.m.

*General Services Department
965 Fir Street, Chico, CA 95928
(530) 896-7800*



Please contact the City Clerk at 896-7250 should you require an agenda in an alternative format or if you need to request a disability-related modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting. This request should be received at least three working days prior to the meeting in order to accommodate your request.

Members:

Dwight Aitkens
Jon Luvaas
Jon Stallman

BT Chapman
Jim Pushnik
Krystle Tonga

Robyn DiFalco
Valerie Reddemann
Tammy Wichman

Tom DiGiovanni
Ann Schwab, Chair
Scott Wolf

Ken Grossman
Toni Scott
Julian Zener

Exhibit "A"
CITY OF CHICO
SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE (STF)

Minutes of
May 7, 2012 Regular Meeting

Member Present:				
Dwight Aitkens	BT Chapman	Robyn DiFalco	Tom DiGiovanni	Jim Pushnik
Valerie Reddemann	Ann Schwab	Toni Scott	Scott Wolf	Tammy Wichman
Julian Zener				
Members absent:				
Ken Grossman	Jon Luvaas	Jon Stallman	Krystle Tonga	
Staff present: Linda Herman, General Services Administrative Manager				

ITEMS REQUIRING ACTION:

1. **TASK FORCE MEMBERSHIP:** Chair Schwab introduced new member Tammy Wichman, who is Councilmember Gruendl's replacement for Scott McNall, and announced the resignation of Task Force member Chris Giampoali, who is a member at large.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE 4-2-12 TASK SUSTAINABILITY TASK FORCE MEETING**

General Services Administrative Manager (GSAM) Linda Herman indicated that a correction was needed to the minutes under the Climate Action Plan (Item 2). on page 1 where it indicated that the Task Force had completed its review of Chapter 3. Chapter 3 was not finished at the last meeting.

Action: *A motion to approve the minutes as corrected was approved (10-0-4).*

3. **RECOGNITION OF THE SEMI-FINALISTS AND WINNER OF THE SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS RECOGNITION PROGRAM LOGO CONTEST AND CONSIDERATION OF DRAFT APPLICATION PACKET**

Chair Schwab announced the Logo Contest first place winner Alex Coder and presented her with a \$100 gift certificate to Ellis Engineering. Schwab also announced that the logo contest vote was very close, within one vote between the top two designs, and recognized runner up, Andrea Chatfield with a \$50 gift certificate. Schwab also acknowledged and thanked Performing and Visual Arts chair Reta Rickmers and instructor Nancy Rickman for their assistance and guidance in the contest.

Business Outreach Ad-Hoc Committee members Aitkens and Wolf also updated the Task Force on the review of the application packet and comments received by Sierra Nevada Brewery, Enloe Hospital, Naked Lounge and a other businesses contacted to review the draft packet.

Action: *None*

4. **CONSIDERATION OF THE INITIAL DRAFT OF THE CITY OF CHICO 2020 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN.**

The Task Force continued its review and public comment on the initial draft of the Climate Action Plan, starting with the remaining Energy and Water Conservation section and the Solid Waste section of Chapter 3. In particular, the Task Force reviewed the written comments previously provided by Task Force member Luvaas and BT Chapman.

Discussion ensued under the Urban Forest Management Plan, with input from Task Force members Reddenmann, Wichman and the public, regarding the use of native and fruit bearing trees as City street trees. Task Force members DiFalco questioned whether this plan involved the existing shade

Exhibit "A"

tree requirements or if it was a plan to enhance these requirements.

Task Force member Wichman asked why the use of City land for community gardens was not an action listed. GSAM indicated that community gardens are addressed in the 2030 General Plan in regards to sustainability and that it would be difficult to measure greenhouse gas emission reductions from these gardens.

Task Force members Chapman, Wolf and Aitken had corrections to the Tables 3.3. and 3.4 and several grammatical revisions throughout the Chapter.

Task Force member DiFalco questioned why there aren't better recycling facilities in Bidwell Park and whether Solid Waste Action 1.2 included adding more containers in the park. She also inquired about food waste composting and staff responded that this action is in Phase II due to the lack of an existing food waste composting facility.

DiFalco also suggested that the City consider a major public outreach for the Sustainable Business Program using the News & Review, such as what Sacramento did with their program

Action: *The Task Force continued its review of the Climate Action Plan, which will start with Chapter 4, to its next meeting.*

5. CONSIDERATION OF SCHEDULING AN EXTRA MEETING ON 5/21/12 TO REVIEW AND COMMENT ON THE DRAFT SUSTAINABILITY INDICATORS REPORT

6.

At its 4/2/12 meeting, the Task Force scheduled an additional meeting on 4/23/12 to review and comment on the draft 2030 General Plan Sustainability Indicators Report. The 4/23/12 meeting was cancelled due to the lack of a quorum and Task Force member Luvaas requested another meeting be scheduled to review the Report before it is presented to the City Council on 6/5/12. Principal Planner Vieg was unable to attend today's meeting, so Chair Schwab requested direction on whether the Task Force wants to meet on 5/21/12 to discuss the draft Report.

Action: *It was the consensus of the Task Force to schedule an additional meeting on Monday, May 21, 2012 at 5:30 p.m. to discuss the Sustainability Indicators Report. The Task Force also directed staff to contact members the day of the meeting to ensure there is a quorum or cancel the meeting.*

NON ACTION ITEMS:

1. **REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS** - No Action Required

a. **"Spare the Air"/Air Quality Awareness Week:** The GSAM provided an update on the Education and Outreach Ad-Hoc Committee's efforts of working with BCAG to offer a free bus transportation day on May 3, 2012 and with the Institute of Sustainable Development Campos Sustainability Coordinator and interns to staff a booth at the Downtown Thursday Night Market on April 26, 2012 and May 10, 2012.

b. **Beverage Container Recycling Grant:** GSAM provided an update on the City's recent award of a \$38,912 grant from CalRecycle to expand the Right 2 Recycle multifamily recycling program. Staff noted that this is a cooperative program with Recology, Waste Management, Associated Students Recycling. Hignell Companies. and MSW properties have expressed interest in participating in the program.

3. **BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR:** None

4. **ADJOURNMENT** – The Task Force adjourned to an extra meeting scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Monday, May 21, 2012.

EXHIBIT "B"

ATTACHMENT "1" (CAP Comments from STF Task Force Member Jon Luvaas)

ADDITIONS TO DRAFT CLIMATE ACTION PLAN

1. Page 4, bottom: Add to the benefits list: “and greater resilience to the effects of climate change and potential energy shortages.”
2. Page 5, line 3, begin sentence with “Implementation” instead of “Adoption”.
3. Page 5, fourth paragraph, begin the last line as follows: “decreased *per capita* consumption...” (Total citywide consumption will continue to increase.)
4. Page 8, under Water Supply, final paragraph, last line, add “hydropower”
5. Page 8, under Water Supply, include a paragraph regarding groundwater, which Chico relies upon far more than surface storage. Diminished stream flows will reduce the primary source of groundwater recharge, while reduced surface storage will increase agricultural reliance on groundwater. This combination is likely to severely overdraft our groundwater supply, particularly during peak periods of drought and heat, and especially if Southern California water demands result in significant surface water transfers.
6. Page 9, under Ecosystems, include a paragraph regarding the impacts of decreased water supply on ecosystems which rely on consistent recharge of shallow aquifers from rain, snow melt, springs, and stream flow. This includes forests and their habitat, urban forests and their shade, and aquatic habitat and other species dependent on shallow aquifers to retain healthy streams, lakes, and ponds.
7. Page 9, under Economic Impacts, add that *diminished reservoir storage will reduce hydropower production, impacting the supply and cost of energy for business, industry, agriculture, and domestic use.*
Also amend a portion of the last line to read: “... increased food *and* lumber costs, ...”
8. Page 10, under International Climate Action, line 4, amend the third sentence and insert a new sentence as follows:
“~~It has been~~ *was estimated that, if the commitments outlined in the Kyoto Protocol are had been met, global GHG emissions could be would have been reduced by an estimated 7% from 1990 levels by 2012. However, due to international failure to meet the Kyoto commitments, the rate of U.S. and global GHG emissions accelerated during the target period.*”
9. Page 10, under Federal Climate Action, amend the first sentence to read:
“In lieu of the Kyoto Protocol’s mandatory framework, the United States has opted for a voluntary, incentive-based approach toward *reducing its 25% of the world’s global warming pollutants.*” (Note that the U.S. Mayors Climate Protection Agreement adopted by the City acknowledges this reality.)

EXHIBIT "B"

10. Page 33, 1.10.1, amend the third line to read:
“... impacts that various types of development have on City services, infrastructure costs, and efforts to reduce GHG emissions.”
11. Page 34, under 1.13, Corridor Management and Traffic Calming, add a provision to improve traffic flow by ceasing the use of stop signs as a traffic calming measure and to remove stop signs not needed for intersection safety.
12. Page 35, add a new item 1.18: “Enforce anti-idling policies for public and private vehicles.”
13. Page 35, under Transportation Objective 2, item 2.1, reconsider carte blanche support for biodiesel. Depending on its source, its production can require significant carbon fuel, produce significant GHGs, and drive up food costs and scarcity.
14. Transportation Sector goals lack a provision to reduce the size and fuel requirements for the City’s non-vehicular equipment, such as fire trucks and machinery, which are often vastly oversized, inefficient, and expensive for many of their uses. Larger fire trucks also require oversized residential streets, which add to construction, maintenance and housing costs, heat, and energy use.
15. Page 36, item 2.4, Electric Vehicle Charging Stations, add a provision requiring new larger residential and commercial projects to provide electric vehicle charging stations, including capacity for expansion.
16. Page 38, item 1.3, second paragraph, add a provision for information to residents and businesses regarding the availability of rebate or other cost-reduction programs.
17. Page 39, amend the top line to begin with: “businesses, *and contractors* to install ‘cool roofs’”
18. Page 41, under Energy Objective 5, amend the 3d line, to read: “... atmosphere, and by shading our homes ~~and~~, office buildings, *and streets*, thereby reducing air conditioning....”
19. Page 45, under 2.1, 3d line from bottom, insert “*education and*” after “provide” so it reads: “... to provide *education and* financial incentives”
On the next to the last line, insert a sentence after “yard waste recycling programs”:
“*Provide education to promote home and business composting practices.*”
20. Page 49, top line, instead of saying an evaluation will be “conducted during 2015”, it must be “*completed by early 2015*” to enable the rest of that year’s important work to be done that year.
21. Page 52, top line 2.2: Same caveat as above: the use of biofuels should depend on the availability of low energy, low GHG emissions production processes that don’t impact food costs.
22. Page 54, under 4.2, line 3, amend to read: “facilities by *at least 10%*....” And consider

EXHIBIT "B"

raising that modest figure to as much as 50-100% .

23. Page 54, item 5.2, amend the last line to read: “*projects, such as development impact fees, or requiring offsite tree planting or other measures to offset project-related transportation emissions.*”
24. Page 55, add to the last line of item 6.1, “*and may require grey water systems where appropriate for new development.*”
25. Page 57, under 1.1, 4th line, insert “least” before 75% so it reads “*at least 75%...*”
26. The CAP needs a Phase II program to develop Phase 3+ goals, policies and programs extending well beyond the 2020 25% goal.
 - a. General Plan Action SUS-6.2.3 commits the City to “Review and revise as necessary the Climate Action Plan to reduce greenhouse gas emissions consistent with the City’s 2020 emission reduction goal, and revisit the need for new goals beyond 2020.”
 - b. Step 5 of the Sustainability Task Force Work Plan commits us to design the CAP “to meet the 25% GHG emission reduction goal by 2020, *with the long term goal of achieving a greater percentage decrease by 2050.*”
 - c. More specifically, AB 32 requires an 80% statewide reduction of GHG emissions by 2050.
 - d. Since the CAP doesn’t yet address our larger goal of greater reductions by 2050, the CAP needs a Phase II program to develop Phase III goals, policies, and programs before 2020.

EXHIBIT "B"

From: BT Chapman <btc05@earthlink.net>
To: Linda Herman <LHERMAN@ci.chico.ca.us>
Date: 3/16/2012 1:26 PM
Subject: re: climate action plan

hi:

Maybe this document and one you may receive from jon luvaas could be used as a starting point for Monday's discussion.

Page 13 Chico committed to take 3 actions under the uscmcpa. Do we have a status on progress to the commitments?>

Page 14 cap and ceqa section. 1st sentence in paragraph 3; SB 226 what does this sentence say in english?

Page 15 last paragraph. Again, what does this sentence say in english?

Page 17, paragraph 2. What discipline allows a valid caparison of combined growth rate to population growth?

Page 19 - cap timeline and targets. Paragraph 2 sentence 2 if phase 1 has ended how do we go back and revise phase one action plans?

Page 21 sector goals. 1st sentence. Do we explain the methodology used to identify the 5 emissions sectors identified in the GHG inventory?

Page II. Paragraph 1.10.2 last sentence seems incomplete.

Page 34 paragraph 1.13 the paragraph after the 5 bullets; first sentence 10-20% reduction from what base point?

paragraph 1.145 can it be more specific about types of "new projects" that would include conditions for bike paths?

Page 35 top of page; last sentence. Is it possible to establish assigned given areas for haulers to serve? Doesn't that stifle competition? What do the haulers say?

1.16. Sentence 4 what is a "walking school bus"?

1.17 bullet #2 what does this say in english?
bullet #5 provide alternate modes of what?

bullet #6 what do pathways contribute to GHG emissions?

Page 37 energy sector actions. Paragraph 2 1st line. Is there a more common word for "evapotranspiration"?

Page 38. 1.3. Paragraph 1 last line. Energy use reduction of 30% from what baseline?

Page 39 2.3 paragraph 2. Define "income-qualified renters" and define "older homes" qualifying for retrofit.

2.5. Define "older middle-income homes.

EXHIBIT "B"

Page 45. 3.1 5th line. Downtown should be downturn.

Page 51 1.3 1st sentence. 8% reduction from what base point or compared to what?

B T CHAPMAN

EXHIBIT "B"

FURTHER ADDITIONS PROPOSED FOR THE CAP

Jon Luvaas, April 27, 2012

On the updated page 56 of the draft CAP, I suggest three additional actions under Objective 6: Water Conservation:

6.4 - Develop plans to replace turf and other irrigated landscape on City property with drought tolerant or xeriscape vegetation, except where recreational or gardening uses require more irrigation.

6.5 - Consider "scalping" installations to capture and treat excess water from sanitary sewer lines, upstream from the City's sanitation facility, for use in passive landscape irrigation and other appropriate uses.

6.6 - Maximize onsite retention and percolation of rainfall for shallow aquifer recharge and protection of the urban forest in new development, redevelopment, and infrastructure improvements.

6.7 - Promote use of on-demand water heaters in new development for water and energy conservation.

On updated page 58 of the draft CAP, objective 2: Expand Recycling Efforts, add two new items:

1.3 - Install recycling bins in all City parks and other City-owned locations wherever trash bins are installed.

1.4 - Incrementally increase requirements for commercial and industrial recycling of recyclable materials.