



**CITY OF CHICO
BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)
POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE
(Haar (Chair), McReynolds and Nickell)**

Regular Meeting Agenda
April 18, 2018, 6 p.m.

Old Municipal Building - 441 Main Street, Upstairs Small Conference Room

Materials related to an item on this Agenda are available for public inspection in the Park Division Office at 965 Fir Street during normal business hours or online at <http://www.chico.ca.us/>.

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. REGULAR AGENDA

2.1. UPDATE ON THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD MITIGATION AND MONITORING

At the 3/26/18 BPPC meeting, Staff provided an update on the Peregrine Point Disc Golf/Trailhead Area located on the southside of Upper Bidwell Park on Highway 32. The Committee will further discuss the status of the mitigation/ monitoring and implementation revisions proposed by Staff.

Recommendation: *The Committee is requested to review and provide comments or recommendations to Staff and the BPPC.*

3. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Members of the public may address the Committee at this time on any matter not already listed on the agenda, comments are limited to three minutes. The Committee cannot take any action at this meeting on requests made under this section of the agenda.

4. ADJOURNMENT

Unless otherwise noticed, adjourn to the next regular meeting on May 16, 2018 at 6:00 p.m. in Conference Room 1, Chico Municipal Center Council Chamber Building located at 421 Main Street, Chico, California.



Please contact the Park Division Office at (530) 896-7800 if you require an agenda in an alternative format, or if you need to request a disability-related modification or accommodation. If possible, this request should be received at least three (3) working days prior to the meeting.



DATE: April 14, 2018
TO: BPPC Natural Resource Committee (Haar, McReynolds, Nickell)
FROM: Linda Herman, Park & Natural Resource Manager
SUBJECT: UPDATE ON THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD MITIGATION AND MONITORING

REPORT IN BRIEF:

At the 3/26/18 BPPC meeting, Staff provided an update on the Peregrine Point Disc Golf/Trailhead Area located on the southside of Upper Bidwell Park on Highway 32. The Committee will further discuss the status of the mitigation/monitoring and implementation revisions proposed by Staff.

Recommendation: *The Committee is requested to review and provide comments or recommendations to Staff and the BPPC.*

BACKGROUND:

As part of the update of the Bidwell Park Master Management Plan (BPMMP), a Disc Golf/Trailhead Area (which was later named the Peregrine Point Disc Golf/Trailhead Area) Concept Plan was developed for the pre-existing disc golf course and trails located on the site. The proposed Concept Plan included a disc golf beginner short course, a more advanced long course, restrooms, a developed parking lot, and shaded and unshaded picnic areas. Peregrine Point also serves as trailheads to many Upper Bidwell Park trails, and is a popular destination for hikers, mountain bikers, and nature enthusiasts. During the environmental review process for the BPMMP, a Master Mitigation and Monitoring Program (MMMP) was also developed for the full Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan.

In 2009, the BPPC and Chico City Council directed Staff to work with ORAI to establish an agreement for the closure and relocation of the disc golf short course (9-holes), construction of improvements to the long course (18 holes), and the installation of mitigation measures, and ongoing operation and monitoring for the Peregrine Point Disc Golf course area.

In January, the BPPC received a report reflecting the mitigation and monitoring activities, or lack thereof, performed at the Peregrine Point Disc Golf site during 2016 and 2017. In the report, the following was noted:

1. The MMMP originally identified 79 mitigation measures that addressed potential environmental impacts concerning Air Quality, Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Hydrology, Noise, and Traffic. Most of the mitigations were required during construction only, or were not applicable, which narrows the current mitigation measures down to 20.
2. Many of the current mitigation measures center around the need for annual biological monitoring and protection of sensitive species which includes Butte County Checkerbloom, Bidwell Knotweed, Wildflower Fields, and the Oak Woodlands, particularly Blue Oaks.
3. The use of the area has increased to include not only disc golfers, but many mountain bikers, hikers, and nature enthusiasts, further impacting the area.
4. Weather, lack of staff resources, mechanical challenges, and other contributors delayed ORAI's and City's implementation of the following mitigation and maintenance items:
 - a. Better tree protection measures
 - b. Installation of mulch
 - c. Better delineation/decommissioning of trails
 - d. Installation of alternative target/pole locations
 - e. Installation of tees signs and other signs
5. Staff recognized the lapse in proper mitigating and indicated the need for the City to play a greater role in managing the Peregrine Point Disc/Golf Trailhead Area. Because the cost of the studies is steadily increasing,

and there are other users impacting the area, Staff also proposed that the City take responsibility for conducting the biological studies.

6. Staff also indicated that there may be a need to modify the mitigation and monitoring plan using the Adaptive Management Approach.

DISCUSSION:

A. ORAI Agreement Compliance:

Staff reviewed the ORAI's Operating Agreement and determined that ORAI has fulfilled its obligations under the Agreement. The full details regarding the Agreement provisions and ORAI's compliance are depicted in the table in Attachment A, and are summarized below:

1. Closed and removed the disc-golf short course at the Hwy 32 site in 2010, even though the Agreement allowed the short course to remain in place until 2014.
2. Developed the 18-hole disc golf course and complied with all applicable mitigation measures required during construction.
3. Installed alternative disc golf targets in local neighborhood and community parks.
4. Provided approximately \$42,000 (50%) of the construction costs of the 18-Hole course through cash, and sponsorships. ORAI members and its volunteer partners also contributed nearly 2,000 hours to construct the course.
5. Although approved by Council and provided in the Agreement, ORAI chose not to exercise the provision to re-establish the short course at the Hwy 32 site even though a suitable alternate location had not been determined by Council by 2014.
6. Funded the biological studies every year in 2011-2016 at a total cost of \$24,036, even though the Agreement only required that they fund the studies every other year. The survey costs for every other year would have resulted in ORAI only having to pay \$14,481.
7. ORAI also provided additional cash and in-kind contributions (2,690 hours of volunteer labor at an average value rate \$24 per hr.) in the amount of \$85,611, for a total overall contribution including the studies of \$109,647.
8. Continues to indemnify the City and provide insurance coverage for use of the course since 2010.
9. Continues to monitor and maintain the course to the best of their abilities and resources.

B. Master Mitigation & Monitoring Plan Implementation

1. Tree Protection - ORAI installed tree protection measures as part of development of the course, but the design did not protect the trees as intended. A new design using two-sided screens was developed and installed in 2016. After reviewing Arborist reports from other disc golf courses, it appears that protecting the trunks will be more effective than protecting the branches as well. So, a new design using a plastic mesh wrap around the trunk of the tree is proposed.
2. Mulch – Mulch has been delivered on site. The mulch will be applied to the tee pads, using straw waddles to help keep it in place where needed, and on appropriate targets. Chips will also be used to help delineate trails.
3. Snake rail fencing – additional snake rail will be installed to designate “out of bounds” areas for all users where Knotweed (KG 3) and other wildflowers are located.
4. Trail realignment and delineation – snake rail fencing, and wood chips will also be used to reduce the multiple trails that exist between Holes 3 and 4 into one main trail, and in other areas where needed.

5. Biological Studies – Staff will schedule a consultant to conduct the biological studies for the knotweed and Checkerbloom this Spring. An oak assessment will also be conducted this year. Staff is proposing that the City cover the costs of the studies this year since ORAI paid for studies that they did not have to in past years. There are adequate funds in the contractual line item in the 2017-18 Parks Budget for these studies.
6. Signage/education – signs will be installed in the new out of bounds areas to identify and inform users of the knotweed and wildflower sensitive areas. Tee pad signs will also be installed once Park Staff drills the holes with jack hammers. This task will be completed by Fall 2018.
7. Loop trail – Staff has looked at possibly realigning portions of the South Rim Trail near Hole 4. The establishment of the longer proposed loop trail back to the parking lot will be evaluated further and implemented where feasible. Staff will continue to update the BPPC on the status of this trail.
8. Alternative Pin location – Staff would like to see how the new tree protection measures work before installing all of the alternative pins. Some pins may be relocated anyway because it would further protect the most impacted trees and provide for better disc golf play. This task will be done at the same time the Tee pads are installed.

A work day to apply mulch and work on tree protection and snake rail fencing was scheduled for March 24th but was cancelled due to pending rain. Future work days will be scheduled soon.

C. CEQA Compliance

Typically, a MMMP is adopted to mitigate impacts and monitor conditions in association with the development of a given project during construction and sometimes for a limited time after construction. Unless required by a permit or EIR stipulation from a regulatory agency (e.g. Army Corp or CA Fish and Wildlife Agency), rarely is on-going annual mitigation and monitoring required. This requirement for the Peregrine Point MMMP was decided by the City Council and not from a regulatory agency.

The MMMP states that the City is the responsible party for the mitigation and monitoring measures. As allowed under CEQA Section 15097 (a) of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations (CCR), the City can delegate this responsibility to another public or private agency, which the City chose to do by executing the Operation Agreement with ORAI.

However, it should be noted that many of the mitigation measures in the Agreement indicate a shared responsibility between the City and ORAI (see table in Attachment B). Furthermore, CCR Section 15097 (a) states that until all mitigation measures are complete, the City remains ultimately responsible. It is for these reasons and because impacts are generated by multiple user groups, that Staff recommends the City play a larger role in managing the area and fund the biological studies to ensure compliance with the MMMP.

Attachments:

- A: ORAI compliance table
- B MMMP Compliance table

ATTACHMENT A

STATUS OF COMPLIANCE WITH ORAI DISC GOLF AGREEMENT

The City and ORAI entered into an Agreement for the construction, maintenance, and monitoring of the Disk Golf site on June 18, 2010. The following table summarizes the sections from the Agreement and ORAI's compliance as of March 2018.

Section	Category	Requirement	Performance/Observations
2	SCOPE OF USE	<p>The Disc Golf area may be occupied and used by ORAI solely to conduct the following Recreational Services in Bidwell Park limited to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 18-hole disc golf long course consistent with City Council approval on May 19, 2009, the BPMMP, EIR, and MMMP. 2. 12-hole disc golf short course. ORAI understands that City Council approved the 12-hole disc golf short course for a period of up to five-years from the date of City Council approval during which time a search for a replacement short course will be conducted; 3. All Recreational Activities and availability of the premises shall be subject to weather conditions based on the City of Chico Bidwell Park Wet Weather Policy; and 4. Operator may sell non-food items including, but not limited to, hats, T-shirts, and discs, for the benefit of Operator's non-profit organization at games and exclusive use days. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. ORAI developed and operated the 18-hole disc golf long course consistent with City Council approval on May 19, 2009. Course was completed in February 2011. 2. Instead of operating the 12-hole disc golf short course on the Hwy 32 site for the approved 5-year period, ORAI and the City closed the short course in 2010. 3. Although approved by Council and provided in the Agreement, ORAI has chosen not to exercise the provision to re-establish the course at the Hwy 32 site even though a suitable alternate location for the 12-hole short course has not been determined. As an alternative, Sherwood Forest in Hooker Oak Park is also being heavily used and maintained by CARD and ORAI <p>1. The long course is subjected to wet-weather policies and the City has observed general compliance by ORAI club members, but the course is also used by a lot of out of town guests that may not know the rules.</p>
4	PERMISSION NOT EXCLUSIVE (TOURNAMENT LIMITATIONS)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Permit other persons to conduct Recreational Services. 2. Exclusive use of each course for up to 10 days/yr. ORAI will: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Limit the number of players to 90 during tournaments; b. End tournaments by 5:00 p.m. c. Not hold tournaments during state holidays; and d. Ability to reschedule tournaments that are cancelled due to weather 3. Submit a list of the exclusive use dates to City on an annual basis on or before February 1 of each year. 	<p>ORAI is in compliance with these provisions. Rangers contacted ORAI on only one scheduled event on a closed trail day to redirect the event to another site. City has not received permit applications from other users to use the facility.</p>

ATTACHMENT A

STATUS OF COMPLIANCE WITH ORAI DISC GOLF AGREEMENT

5	CONSIDERATION	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Implement the MMMP 2. Submit annual report 3. Publicize availability. 	ORAI has conducted maintenance of infrastructure and submitted annual reports each year. ORAI has continued to fundraise and promote proper use of the Disc Golf Course. These activities can be found in the ORAI annual reports.
6	GENERAL PUBLIC AVAILABILITY REQUIREMENTS	The premises shall available to the general public for recreational purposes at all times, except on Operator's exclusive use days.	The premises remain available to all members of the public, which include mountain bikers, hikers, bird and native plant enthusiasts, etc..
11	IMPLEMENTATION AND CONSTRUCTION	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Construct 18-Hole Disc Golf Long Course and 18 Disc Golf Targets 2. Relocate Disc Golf Short Course by 2014. 	Completed. ORAI complied with the terms and conditions of the Long Course Planning and Construction. ORAI also removed the targets on the Short Course in 2010.
12	MITIGATION AND MONITORING REQUIREMENTS	Prior to construction and annually thereafter, City agrees to collect data pursuant to Mitigation Measure BI0-1B-F, Mitigation Measure BI0-1D-E, and Mitigation Measures BI0-3C-F and -K, required by and in accordance with the MMMP. However, Operator agrees to reimburse City for costs associated with annual data collection of Checkerbloom, Knotweed/Wildflowers, and Blue Oaks for Years 1, 3 und 5 and every other year thereafter in an amount not to exceed \$5,000/year . During the initial, or any extended term of this Agreement, the "not to exceed amount" shall be increased annually by three percent (3%), currently at \$5,970/yr.	In progress. Despite only being required to fund the surveys every other year, ORAI funded the detailed botanical and oak monitoring surveys from 2011-2015. The costs of the studies have increased each year. In 2016, the P&NRM requested that only knotweed data be collected and with no detailed report. ORAI paid for this data collection. ORAI's total contribution toward surveys from 2011-2016 is \$24,036, while the required amount that should have been paid under the Agreement should have been \$14,481 (2011, 2013, and 2015). In April 2017, Interim P&NRM contacted Northern Land Trust to conduct the botanical studies, but was told they were unavailable. Studies will be conducted in 2018.
13	REUMBURSEMENT	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. City Council authorized reimbursement to ORAI for up to \$52,000 (approximately 50% of Hwy 32 site development cost of \$84,000, plus installation of disc golf targets in local parks) of Prop 40 grant funds for construction of the 18-hole disc golf long course and placement of disc golf targets at alternative locations outside of Bidwell Park. \$7,200.00 of grant funds was to be used to install targets at the park locations. 2. ORAI to provide up to \$52,000.00 in matching funds, in money, or equivalent value of supplies, materials, services, and volunteer time. Volunteer time shall be valued at a per hour rate based on the current or revised rate for California set fort at www.independentsector.org. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. ORAI was reimbursed \$41,997 (50% of total costs) for the construction of the 18-hole course and the installation of baskets at the following locations: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. In 5 Neighborhood Parks b. 20th Street Community Park c. Hooker Oak Park 2. ORAI, through local sponsors and volunteers, donated nearly 2,000 volunteer hours toward the development of Hwy 32 site and the park targets, in addition to providing its 50% share of the construction costs. From 2011-2017, ORAI also provided cash and in-kind contributions in the amount of \$109,647. This includes the cost of the mitigation studies, maintenance supplies, insurance, and an additional 2,690 hours of volunteer labor at an average value rate \$24 per hr.

ATTACHMENT A

STATUS OF COMPLIANCE WITH ORAI DISC GOLF AGREEMENT

14	MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR	ORAI shall, at its sole cost and expense, maintain the premises and all disc golf improvements thereon and appurtenances thereto in good repair and in at least as good condition as that in which they were delivered, ordinary wear and tear excepted.	ORAI has completed ongoing repairs to infrastructure, removed graffiti, installed signage, and encouraged users to pick up trash on a regular basis. The infrastructure is in good shape, except for the need for better tree protection designs, installation of mulch, installation of alternative pin locations, and decommissioning of rogue trails/erosion caused by all users. Due to the increased multi-use of the site and based on the Mitigation & Monitoring Plan, maintenance responsibilities lie with both the City and ORAI.
17	ALTERATIONS OR ADDITIONS	All improvements and modifications to the premises made by ORAI will be done in accordance with City approved plans.	ORAI has implemented improvements according to City approved plans and in compliance with the BPMMP as approved by the City.
18/19	INDEMNIFICATION/INSURANCE	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. ORAI shall indemnify City, its boards, commissions, and members, its officers, agents, and employees, against all liability or damages, costs, losses, and expenses, including, but not limited to, attorneys' fees, arising out of or in any way connected with construction, alterations or additions to premises performed by Operator, and any injuries caused by or related to Operator's equipment on premises, and any injuries. 2. ORAI shall, at its sole cost and expense, obtain commercial general liability insurance which provides coverage for bodily injury, personal injury and property damage liability in the amount of at least \$1,000,000 per occurrence, and \$2,000,000 in the aggregate, with a maximum policy deductible of \$5,000. 	ORAI has continued to provide the required insurance and indemnification provisions every year from 2010 to 2018 per the ORAI agreement.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

Mitigation Measure	Implementation Responsibility	Funding Responsibility	Implementation Trigger or Date	Frequency	Implementation Status
AIR QUALITY	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	During construction activities.	Weekly during construction	11 measures Complete. No further action required.
BIOLOGY					
Mitigation Measure BIO-1b: Implement Measures to Protect Butte County Checkerbloom in the Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan Area The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate potential direct and indirect effects on populations of Butte County checkerbloom from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan:	ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	Before ground-disturbing activities and during ongoing operation,	Varies (See Below)	See Below
a. As provided in Appendix H of the BPMMP, the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to avoid direct and indirect impacts on known locations of Butte County checkerbloom on the site. All disc golf structures (e.g., tees, targets, fairways) and trails shall be placed a minimum of 50 feet from locations that currently support Butte County checkerbloom wherever possible. Where this cannot be accomplished due to physical site constraints, the buffer may be reduced, but shall remain at a minimum of 25 feet.	ORAI	N/A	During construction	Monitor monthly during construction	Complete. When construction of the Disc Golf long course was completed by ORAI, all disc golf features and trails were placed a minimum of 50-25 feet from known Checkerbloom locations. Any current trails not meeting this requirement are the result of the presence of checkerbloom not identified in the initial 2005 survey and from activities, such disc golf, hiking, and mountain biking, that have occurred over the past 7 years of use.
b. Before construction... Butte County checkerbloom, exclusionary fencing	ORAI	ORAI	During construction.	Monitor monthly during construction.	Completed. No further action required.
c. The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall restrict foot traffic to clearly defined trails and disc golf features. Trails shall be constructed as narrow as possible to avoid degradation of suitable habitat for Butte County checkerbloom (and other special status plant species). Where existing disc golf structures and trails in the vicinity of existing locations of Butte County checkerbloom will be decommissioned, barriers (such as boulders) shall be placed to discourage use of these trails and structures.	ORAI with qualified botanist	ORAI	During construction.	Monitor monthly during construction	Completed. Monitoring required during construction only. When construction of the Disc Golf long course was completed by ORAI, all trails within the vicinity of Checkerbloom and other special status species were decommissioned. Any current trails not meeting this requirement are the result of the presence of checkerbloom not identified in the 2005 survey and from activities, such disc golf, hiking, and mountain biking, that have occurred over the past 7 years of use.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

Mitigation Measure	Implementation Responsibility	Funding Responsibility	Implementation Trigger or Date	Frequency	Implementation Status
d. Permanent signage at the trailhead/rest area shall be installed to inform Park users of the presence and sensitivity of Butte County checkerbloom (and other sensitive resources) on the site.	ORAI	ORAI	After construction.	Monitor signage annually.	Initial Installation complete. Requires on-going monitoring and upkeep of signs. Scheduled Action: City will drill holes, and ORAI will proceed with installation of the tee signs by Fall 2018.
e. As provided in Appendix H of the BPMMP, alternate pin locations for Holes 3 and 4 of the long course shall be used from March 1 through July 1 to provide further assurance that potential disturbance of nearby checkerbloom plants during the active growth and blooming period of the plants is minimized.	ORAI	ORAI/ CITY	After construction.	Implement and Monitor Seasonally (March 1 – July 1)	Alternative pin installation complete for Holes 3 and 4. Requires on-going monitoring of seasonal pad changes and use. Scheduled Action: Staff and ORAI will prioritize the alternative pin relocations and relocate the top 3 locations by Fall 2018.
f. Per Plant Objective O. P-8 of the BPMMP, an adaptive management program shall be implemented that relies on periodic data collection on the distribution of Butte County checkerbloom at the Disc Golf/ Trailhead site. The goal of this adaptive management program shall be to document and monitor changes in the existing population of Butte County checkerbloom over time. The adaptive management plan is intended to address the fact that, notwithstanding the buffers and signage, the CITY cannot guarantee that the use of the park will not disturb Butte County checkerbloom.	ORAI	ORAI	After construction.	Monitor annually	Adaptive Monitoring Plan complete. Implementation in progress. The Monitoring Plan lays out the sampling protocol, which includes the GPS locations of wildflower fields and checkerbloom. Scheduled Action: See g. below.
g. If data collection indicates a decline in existing populations after implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan and Plant Objective O. P-8 of the BPMMP, relocation of trails or disc golf structures in the vicinity of these populations, or other management strategies that would benefit the plants based on the data collected, shall be implemented. This strategy would implement Plant Objective O. P-7 and Plant Implementation Strategies and Guidelines I. P-3 and I. P-4 of the BPMMP. The overall goal of the adaptive management strategy shall be the long-term maintenance of the same number and approximate extent of occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom as documented during the 2005 surveys.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI to reimburse CITY for surveys of checkerbloom, wildflower fields (Years 1, 3 and 5 and every other year thereafter – cost estimated to be \$2,000 per survey)	After construction.	Monitor annually, develop program as needed.	Detailed surveys were completed and paid for by ORAI in 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, and 2015. The 2015 survey reported 96 individual units identified despite ongoing drought, thereby meeting the goal of the same number and approximate extent of the 76 occurrences found in 2005. Scheduled Action: Botanical studies will be conducted in 2018. Staff will also have the consultant evaluate the need/frequency of future surveys.

ATTACHMENT B
IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES
FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

Mitigation Measure	Implementation Responsibility	Funding Responsibility	Implementation Trigger or Date	Frequency	Implementation Status
<p>Mitigation Measure BIO-1d: Implement Measures to Protect Bidwell’s Knotweed at the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area</p> <p>The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate for potential direct and indirect effect to Bidwell’s knotweed at the Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan area:</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	During construction of Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Plans, and during ongoing operation	Varies (See Below)	
<p>a. The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to minimize direct and indirect impacts on Bidwell’s knotweed habitat on the site. Because Bidwell’s knotweed is an annual plant species, population sizes may fluctuate greatly from year to year. Therefore, simply avoiding plants that are present in a given year would not ensure that great numbers of individuals would not be affected in subsequent years. Therefore, a habitat approach shall be taken to minimize impacts on this species. This approach would entail minimizing impacts to wildflower fields, the native plant community that supports Bidwell’s knotweed.</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	Prior to and during construction;	Monitor weekly during construction	Complete - The course alignment addressed many of the negative impacts from foot traffic. Monitoring required only during construction.
<p>b. Consistent with the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, trails shall generally be placed outside of wildflower fields. The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to restrict foot traffic to clearly defined trails and disc golf structures. The number of trails dissecting wildflower fields shall be minimized to the fewest number necessary to facilitate reasonable access to the disc golf course and scenic viewpoints, and trails shall be as narrow as possible and have clearly marked edges to reduce widening and discourage users from wandering off the path. Existing trails through wildflower fields that will not be retained as part of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be decommissioned, and barriers (such as boulders) shall be placed just outside any points where trails enter the wildflower field community to discourage use of these trails.</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	Prior to and during construction.	Monitor monthly during construction	Complete – monitoring required during construction only. The pathways were defined during construction of the course in 2011, with many features placed to guide users to trails. The snake rail fencing also aids in narrowing and defining trails.
<p>c. Exclusionary fencing... construction ... wildflower field ... Bidwell’s knotweed....</p>			During construction.		Complete. No further action required.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

d. Permanent signage at the trailhead/rest area shall be installed to inform Park users of the presence and sensitivity of Bidwell's knotweed and wildflower field habitat and to deter users from disturbing the species.	ORAI	ORAI	After construction.	Monitor signage annually	Sign installation complete. On-going monitoring and maintenance of sign. Scheduled Action: Interpretive signs and trail head signs will be installed by City once snake rail fencing is installed. QR codes with more information on the sensitive species will also be used on the signs and through a new Park Watch mobile app.
e. Per Plant Objective O. P-8 of the BPMMP, an adaptive management program shall be implemented that relies on periodic data collection on the distribution of Bidwell's knotweed at the Disc Golf/ Trailhead site. The goal of this adaptive management program shall be to document and monitor changes in the existing population of Bidwell's knotweed over time.	CITY	CITY	After construction	Monitor annually	In progress. Adaptive management program described as part of monitoring plan and will be revised as necessary. Scheduled Action: Botanical studies will be conducted in 2018. Staff will also have the consultant evaluate the need/frequency of future surveys.
f. If data collection indicates a decline in the number or extent (i.e. square feet) of existing populations after implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, relocation of trails or disc golf structures in the vicinity of these populations, or other management strategies that would benefit the plants based on the data collected, shall be implemented. Seasonal and annual variation of the plants in response to environmental conditions such as rainfall shall be taken into consideration when determining if a decline is occurring. This strategy would implement Plant Objective O. P-7 and Plant Implementation Strategies and Guidelines I. P-3 and I. P-4 of the BPMMP.	ORAI	ORAI to reimburse CITY for surveys of Bidwell's knotweed, wildflower fields (Years 1, 3 and 5 and every other year thereafter – cost estimated. at \$2,000 per survey)	After construction	Monitor annually; develop program as needed	In progress. Detailed surveys were completed and paid for by ORAI in 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015. Only physical data was collected in 2016, which was also paid by ORAI. Scheduled Action: Additional snake rail fencing will be installed around the most impacted Knotweed Group 3 and other sensitive areas by June 30, 2018.
Mitigation Measure BIO-2d (1): Protect Tree-Nesting Raptors and Burrowing Owls. The measures required	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	Before and during construction during breeding season of tree-nesting raptors ...	Implement prior to construction	Complete – The 3 measures were either not applicable or implemented prior to construction. No further action required.
Mitigation Measure BIO-2d(2): Protect Peregrine Falcon	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	During the breeding season of peregrine falcons known to nest below the South Rim	During construction.	Complete - the 2 measures implemented during construction. No further action required.

ATTACHMENT B
IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES
FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

<p>Mitigation Measure BIO-2f: Implement Measures to Protect Other Special-status Nesting Birds</p>	<p>ORAI/CITY</p>	<p>ORAI/CITY</p>	<p>During the breeding season of yellow warbler, yellow-breasted chat and loggerhead shrike.</p>	<p>Prior/during construction.</p>	<p>Complete - the 2 measures implemented during construction. No further action required.</p>
<p>Mitigation Measure BIO-3c: Implement Measures to Protect Oak Woodland</p> <p>The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate potential impacts on oak woodlands resulting from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan:</p>	<p>ORAI</p>	<p>ORAI</p>	<p>Before and during construction activities in the immediate vicinity of oak woodland habitat. Some activities are ongoing during site management of the Area.</p>	<p>Varies See below</p>	<p>See Below</p>
<p>a. Where possible, trails, improvements, and facilities shall be constructed outside of oak woodlands. The number of trails dissecting oak woodlands shall be minimized to the fewest number necessary to accomplish the goals of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects. The width of trails through oak woodlands shall be minimized and trails shall have clearly marked edges that discourage trail widening and deter users from straying off the designated trail.</p>	<p>ORAI – biologist</p>	<p>ORAI</p>	<p>Start of construction</p>	<p>During construction</p>	<p>Complete. All trails through oak woodlands were constructed under the advice of a trained consultant and met the conditions of this mitigation requirement. Any existing trails occurred after construction from multiple users over the past 7 years.</p>
<p>b. Trails through oak woodlands that are decommissioned as part of a site-specific Park Improvement Project shall be reclaimed using barriers (such as boulders) to discourage continued use of these trails.</p>	<p>ORAI/CITY</p>	<p>ORAI/CITY</p>	<p>During and following construction</p>	<p>Monitor annually</p>	<p>In progress. Some barriers (i.e. fencing, rocks, and boulders) initially installed during construction have been moved or deemed ineffective after increased use by all users.</p> <p>Scheduled Action: The City and ORAI are working together to use delineation methods, such as wood chips, waddles, signage and other methods, and reseeded to reclaim the trails</p>
<p>c. Grading, trenching, equipment storage, and other soil-disturbing or compacting activities shall not occur within the drip lines of oak trees. New structures and impervious-surface materials shall not be placed in the drip lines of oaks, except where deemed necessary to reduce the footprint size of tees as part of the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan and to reduce soil compaction.</p>	<p>ORAI</p>	<p>ORAI</p>	<p>During and following construction</p>	<p>Monitor monthly during construction</p>	<p>Completed. No grading, trenching, equipment storage occurred on site. The construction access route avoided wildflower fields, drip lines, and tall grass areas to the best extent possible. Concrete tee pads were installed to reduce the footprint size of tees.</p>

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

<p>d. To ensure that the drip lines of oaks are not disturbed during construction, protective fencing shall be installed, under the guidance of a qualified botanist, certified arborist, or Registered Professional Forester, at least 1 foot beyond the outer edge of the drip lines of all oaks that grow within the construction zones of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects, and no project activities shall be allowed within these exclusion zones, unless specifically required as part of project construction.</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	Prior and during construction	Monitor monthly during construction	Completed. No further action required.
<p>e. The oak woodland management guidelines contained in Section 3 of the NRMP (Appendix C of the BPMMP) shall be implemented. These guidelines include recommendations for sustaining oak woodlands, initiating a burning program, and maintaining the oak landscape.</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	Start of construction	Following construction	On-going. Measures to plant acorns, conduct prescribed burns where feasible, and to reduce soil compaction continue.
<p>In addition to the measures outlined above, the following additional measures shall be implemented in connection with development and ongoing maintenance of the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan to protect oaks and to mitigate for any unavoidable loss resulting from mortality over time. These measures are based on site observations, oak woodland management guidelines provided by DFG, and measures recommended in the tree assessments</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	During and following construction	See below	In progress.
<p>f. Any modification to the proposed design and layout of the site shall be subject to the same impact avoidance and minimization criteria as the initial design;</p>	ORAI/CITY	ORAI/CITY	During and following construction	On-going	Modifications to the course design and layout were made with the intent of the mitigation measures. Hole 8 was shortened to avoid a wildflower field which also shortened the overall footprint of the Project. Holes 15 and 16 were swapped to improve the route and minimize trails. Hole 14 was placed in a new location to minimize damage and the need to import additional material to make the tee pad level. Other modifications to the course may be made as part of the adaptive management program for the Project and to minimize impacts.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

<p>g. Information describing the value of native oak trees and the importance of the preservation and protection of oak woodland for wildlife habitat and the aesthetic values of Bidwell Park shall be provided at the informational kiosk at the Disc Golf/Trailhead area site. The information shall discuss the importance of avoiding direct impacts resulting from bark and limb damage as well as indirect effects such as soil compaction/root damage and shall encourage site users to act responsibly and prevent adverse effects.</p>	ORAI/CITY		Following construction	Inspect signage annually	<p>Installation Completed. City reviewed and approved ORAI sign in 2011. Follow-up monitoring required so that sign remains pertinent.</p> <p>Scheduled Action: Interpretive signs and trail head signs will be installed by City and ORAI. QR codes with more information on the sensitive species will also be used on the signs and through a new Park Watch mobile app.</p>
<p>h. In cases where disc golf pins are located within groves of oak trees or oak trees are within fairways, measures to protect the tree trunks such as the installation of shielding pole structures shall be implemented. Installation shall be implemented without damage to the root zone, and in a manner that preserves the visual character of the site.</p>	ORAI - CITY	ORAI - CITY	During and following construction	Monitor annually	<p>Monitoring and placement on-going. Moveable wood pole structures in a concrete base were placed on site and were adjusted before the course opened. Alternative structures using wider screens were implemented in 2016.</p> <p>Scheduled Action: A new protective method of wrapping trees in plastic mesh will be implemented by June 30, 2018.</p>
<p>i. In cases where tees or trails are located within drip lines of oaks or in the immediate vicinity of drip lines, a 6-inch layer of woodchip mulch shall be applied to a 20' radius around the tees and on the trails to minimize soil compaction; this layer shall be maintained on an ongoing basis, as needed, to ensure continued protection of the root zones.</p>	CITY	CITY	During and following construction;	Monitor annually	<p>During construction, 6-inch requirement modified to 3-4 inches based on UC Davis recommendation. On-going monitoring and action required.</p> <p>Scheduled Action: Mulch will be provided by City and installed by ORAI and volunteers by June 30, 2018.</p>
<p>j. Periodic monitoring of the oaks at the site shall be conducted to determine if any unavoidable impacts are occurring as a result of site use, in spite of the impact minimization measures.</p>	ORAI	<p>ORAI to reimburse CITY for surveys of oaks (Years 1, 3 and 5 and every other year thereafter – cost est. to be \$1,000 per survey)</p>	After construction	Monitor at least twice yearly	<p>Visual inspections will be conducted in Spring and Fall by Staff or ORAI.</p> <p>Scheduled Action: Visual inspections by City and ORAI will be conducted studies will be conducted in 2018. Staff will also have the consultant evaluate the need/frequency of future surveys.</p>

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

k.	Any unavoidable impacts to oaks resulting from construction, or tree mortality resulting from ongoing use of the site shall be mitigated by replanting oak woodland habitat at the Disc Golf/Trailhead site in areas located outside of the footprint of facilities and trails in areas not currently occupied by other sensitive resources and suitable to support blue oak woodland.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	After construction	Implement if and as needed	ORAI collects on site acorns to be used for any future plantings. ORAI has planted approximately 50 acorns per year, more than the 5:1 required mitigation (see attached map for planting locations)
l.	Oak planting should be from seeds (acorns) or seedlings that are obtained from the local genetic stock and should be of the same species as those targeted for replacement. Replacement ratios shall be at least 5:1 for trees lost/replaced that are greater than 5 inches diameter at breast height.	ORAI / CITY	To be accomplished above B10-3c-f	After death of trees > 5" DBH in Disc Golf footprint area only	Implement if and as needed	Two trees have died since the course opened in 2011. Two reference trees have also died, indicating drought and other factors may have played a part in the death of the trees. As a result, ORAI has planted approximately 50 acorns per year, more than the 5:1 required mitigation.
m.	Oak plantings shall be protected from browsing, planted on the north and east side of existing trees, and irrigated during the first few years as outlined in the oak assessment (Appendix E4) to enhance their chance of survival.	ORAI / CITY Relating to disc golf facilities only.	ORAI/ CITY	After construction	Implement and monitor as needed	ORAI has continually monitored the oak tree plantings, using milk cartons and other methods to protect the sprouts.
n.	Replacement plantings shall be monitored for their success for a period of five years or until the desired performance criterion of 5:1 is achieved, whichever is longer. If planting does not succeed, remedial actions such as replanting shall be implemented.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	After planted	Monitor yearly after planting for five years or until success criteria are achieved	Approximately 20 sprouts are a foot high after 3 years of initial planting Scheduled Action: City and ORAI will continue to monitor the plantings over the next 2 years.
o.	If requested, community/user group stewardship of the plantings shall be allowed to contribute to restoration/revegetation efforts under guidance and supervision by CITY staff.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	After construction	As needed	Complete - Butte Environmental Council provided guidance to ORAI on oak tree planting and establishment.
Mitigation Measure BIO-3d: Implement Measures to Protect Wildflower Fields The following measures shall be implemented to minimize potential disturbances to wildflower field communities resulting from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan:		ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	Before and during construction of the Disc Golf concepts that occur within the immediate vicinity of wildflower fields	See below	See Below
a.	Mitigation Measure BIO-1d shall be implemented to minimize adverse effects on wildflower fields resulting from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI/ CITY	During construction;	MONI	Complete – course was constructed to avoid these areas to the best extent possible.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

b.	Whenever possible, trail segments, site improvements, facilities and other design features shall be located to minimize impacts to wildflower fields.	CITY	CITY	Prior to and during construction;	Inspect monthly during construction	Completed. Monitoring required during construction only.
c.	Exclusionary fencing shall be installed before construction to keep workers and equipment from disturbing wildflower field habitat. intended to be preserved on the project site (some areas may be lost, consistent with site design)..	ORAI	ORAI	Prior to and during construction	Inspect monthly during construction	Completed. Monitoring required during construction only..
d.	The number of trails dissecting wildflower fields shall be minimized to the fewest number necessary to accomplish the goals of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects.	ORAI	ORAI	Prior to construction	Implement prior to and during construction	Completed during construction.
e.	Trails through wildflower fields shall be as narrow as possible and shall have clearly marked edges that discourage trail widening and deter users from straying off the designated trail.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI / CITY	Start of construction	Implement prior to and during construction	Completed during construction.
f.	Existing trails through wildflower fields that will not be retained as part of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects shall be reclaimed using barriers (such as boulders) to discourage use of these trails. If these reclaimed trails fail to revegetate on their own over time, re-seeding may be considered.	ORAI / CITY	ORAI / CITY	Prior and during construction	Monitor annually	Complete. All trails through wildflower fields were decommissioned under the advice of a trained consultant and met the conditions of this mitigation requirement. Any existing trails occurred after construction from multiple users over the past 7 years. Scheduled Action: Additional snake rail fencing will be installed around the most impacted Knotweed Group 3 and other sensitive areas by June 30, 2018.
g.	Permanent signage shall be installed at kiosks located at the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan site to inform Park users of the presence and sensitivity of the wildflower field community and discourage visitors from off-trail use and trampling of vegetation.	ORAI	ORAI	After construction	Monitor annually	Installation completed. On-going monitoring of signs required. Scheduled Action: Interpretive signs and trail head signs will be installed by City and ORAI. QR codes with more information on the sensitive species will also be used on the signs and through a new Park Watch mobile app.
Mitigation Measure BIO-4: Implement Measures to Protect Jurisdictional Wetlands		CITY	CITY	NA	NA	Measures (6) not applicable. No wetlands found (Galloway, 2009). No further action required.

ATTACHMENT B

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS (AS OF MARCH 2018) OF ACTIVE MITIGATION AND MONITORING MEASURES FOR THE PEREGRINE POINT DISC GOLF/TRAILHEAD AREA. (SEE MONITORING PLAN FOR ENTIRE LIST).

CULTURAL RESOURCES	CITY	CITY	During final design and construction activities	Monitor monthly	Measures (9) completed through planning or construction. No further action required.
HYDROLOGY	CITY	CITY	Before commencement of construction activities	NA	Completed - No Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) required.
NOISE	CITY	CITY	During construction	NA	Measures (3) completed during construction. No further action required.
TRAFFIC					
Mitigation Measure Traffic-4: Coordinate with Caltrans a. To address the potential increase in traffic hazards resulting from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, the CITY shall coordinate with Caltrans to obtain an encroachment permit for construction of the site access and parking lot for the Disc Golf/Trailhead area. As part of the consultation with Caltrans, the CITY shall address the potential need for additional signage and/or a left turning lane to address traffic safety along SR 32. The CITY shall implement any measures deemed necessary by Caltrans as a condition of the encroachment permit or as a result of the consultation on safety.	CITY	CITY	Prior to construction of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan	NA	To be determined. This mitigation will be implemented if the remainder of the full Concept Plan (e.g. improved trailhead access, construction of parking lot, restrooms etc.) is contemplated.

Notes: NA – Not Applicable, TBD – To Be Determined.