

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**  
Minutes of  
January 27, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:** None

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager), Ruben Martinez (General Services Director), Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant)

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT – NONE**

**2.1. Minutes from the 12/16/13 meeting were incomplete and will be provided at the 2/24/14 meeting.**

**2.2. Permit to allow Helicopter Staging Area at Parking Lot B (Summit Line Construction)**

Construction requests a permit to use Parking Lot B for 1-2 days during 2014 as a landing and staging area related to inspection and addition of wires of the existing Cottonwood-Roseville 230 kV transmission line. An easement exists for the line.

**MOTION:** Approve the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Moravec. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 0.

**3. NOTIED PUBLIC HEARINGS – NONE**

**4. REGULAR AGENDA**

**4.1. Conceptual Approval for a Community Rose Garden at the CARD Community Center (545 Vallombrosa Avenue, Chico, California)**

The Chico Area Recreation District (CARD) requests input and conceptual approval of a proposed Rose Garden. CARD leases the property from the City of Chico and any improvements need City approval. Conceptual approval will allow the applicant to develop a more detailed design and solutions to concerns that would return to the BPPC for review and approval.

CARD has recently received a proposal for a rose garden and has explored some options with their Board and subcommittee. The proposed site is located at the back of the CARD center, adjoining lower Bidwell Park. It would extend into the area in the back. This area would provide an opportunity for a new venue for weddings and other events. CARD requests conceptual approval. This would give CARD a go ahead and explore some options. The Commission would receive input as the project moved along and the final design would come back to the Commission

The Master Management Plan (MMP) would be used as a guide for framework for new activities in the park. One of the items in our MMP is to provide alternative enhanced uses in the park. This area is already developed and there would be no change in use.

Jake Preston, CARD Superintendent of Parks and Facilities gave his perspective on the project. Mr. Preston wanted to start the dialog to show intent and continue the process of planning, and indicated the desire to have the Commission consider the available information and weigh in on the project before any more resources were invested into the project, as part of the lease agreement.

The conceptual drawing is simply a scale of the project and the general concept. Nothing is set in stone at this point. This is a long standing project and CARD is just now able to have a discussion on the project and move forward. There are a lot of reservations from the CARD staff and Board on the long term impacts and they are working to address those items. He stressed that when CARD makes a commitment, they will follow thru with what they say. Mr. Preston stated that CARD's goal is to bring recreational opportunities in conjunction with this rose garden and there are design guidelines to do that.

Mr. Preston restated the history of the project. This was first brought to Council in 2001 and was brought to the CARD board numerous times. We need to look at the maintenance impacts. CARD is working with Ms. Warrens to mitigate the ongoing maintenance as well as coordinate with the Butte Rose Society which would need to go to their board. Roses are high maintenance as a landscape feature but have great benefits. The initial start of capital funds by Ms. Marilyn Warrens has dedicated to the project, we are looking at setting up an account to offset the maintenance costs.

A lot of time and care was put in when narrowing down location possibilities.

Emmerich – Is CARD envisioning the rose garden would be built simultaneously with the amphitheater?

Preston – the Board would decide on the priority decisions but Mr. Preston thought the rose garden would be first and it would be phased in. He believed that the rose garden would be a priority.

Chair Emmerich asked if they would be receiving a timeline of the project.

Mr. Preston stressed that communication with the Park Commission is crucial.

Dan Efseaff stated the rose garden would be kept on the outer part of the property near the bike path as reflected in the conceptual drawing

Commissioner Moravec asked if the rose garden would be solely on the bike side of the path and not the Creekside.

Brentwood was concerned it would be too close to the creek when it comes to pesticide runoff.

Preston – the plan is to do non-impact types of landscaping. As the planning developed, so would the maintenance plan.

Commissioner Herrera stated the Bidwell Park and Playground Commission has guidelines for herbicide applications. He recommended stricter guidelines.

FROM THE PUBLIC:

Woody Elliott – stated he approved of the rose garden but he did not approve of the wall area noted on the conceptual drawing.

Marilyn Warrens – spoke about her vision of this project and how she started it in 2001. She noted that Chico has been good for her family so she wanted to do something for Chico in return. Ms. Warrens said she would appreciate any consideration for the project and that there was money available at North Valley Community Foundation.

Chair Emmerich expressed sincere appreciation for Ms. Warrens coming forward with her generous offer.

Jan Sneed, Chair of CARD board, stated that the board enthusiastically embraced this project. The Committee believes the increased revenues received from the weddings and events, would help offset the maintenance costs.

Chair Emmerich asked if CARD would be able to charge more for the use of this facility and how it would offset the costs. Ms. Sneed said regardless, it is a beautiful addition to the community.

Mr. Preston noted that there is a cap on what residents will pay for rentals. While there may potentially be an increase, the revenue really comes from their programs. They are trying to bring in positive enhancements to the community.

Commissioner Ober stated that in addition to the controlling of herbicide and pesticide applications, he would like to see consciousness about water use when designing this project.

**MOTION:** Move to approve conceptual plan of a rose garden at the CARD center. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 0.

#### 4.2. Selection of Chair, Committee Assignments, and Approval of Revised Meeting Schedule

Annually, the Commission selects a Chair and a Vice-Chair. BPPC members serve on the Policy Advisory, Natural Resources, Street Trees Committees and the City's ad hoc Bicycle Advisory Committee. These committees meet on an as-needed basis.

Staff recommended no changes to the current Commission structure.

**MOTION:** Moved that Emmerich serve a second term as Chair of the Commission. **MADE BY:** Brentwood. **SECOND:** Rood. **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSTAINED:** 1. (Emmerich)

**MOTION:** Moved that Moravec to serve a second term as Vice-Chair of the Commission. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Brentwood. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 0.

*There was no public comment on the selection of Chair and Vice-Chair.*

The BPPC meets on the last Monday of the month and so the 2014 calendar presents two potential conflicts:

Staff recommended the following changes to the annual schedule:

1. Move the May meeting from May 26<sup>th</sup> (Memorial Day) to Tuesday (May 27<sup>th</sup>) at 6:30 p.m.
2. Move the December meeting from December 29<sup>th</sup> (between the Christmas and New Year's Day holidays) to the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday in December (December 15<sup>th</sup>) at 6:30 p.m.

**MOTION:** Moved to accept Staff recommendations for meeting dates. **MADE BY:** Rood. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 0.

With regard to the Committee structure and current assignments, Commissioner Brentwood, current Chair of the Natural Resources Committee, offered the post to any of the other Commissioners if they were interested.

The Chair noted that existing Committee assignments will remain the same:

1. Natural Resource Committee - 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday – Brentwood (Chair), Morovic and Rood
2. Policy Advisory Committee - 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday – Herrera (Chair), Ober and Traulsen
3. Tree Committee – 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday – Ober (Chair), Emmerich, and Rood
4. Bicycle Advisory Committee – meets as needed – Moravec / Rood (Alternate)

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR – NONE

## 6. REPORTS

### 6.1. Special Report: 2013 Park Division and Street Trees Annual Report –

Dan Efseaff presented the report and noted that a draft version was included in the packet. A revised version is available on line and was handed to Commissioners. Commented on the challenges this year, staffing being one of them. They were still able to continue with service and move forward with the workplan.

Herrera – inquired about the timeline of the Urban Forest Management Plan and if not having an Urban Forester is a barrier to that being fast tracked. Also, wanted to know if an Urban Forester would be hired any time soon.

Ruben Martinez – Regarding the Urban Forest Plan, he said the language was being refined. There is no specific timeline. It is on our workplan. The goal is to complete it by the end of this year. We were close when Denise was here.

He is in the process of a reorganization report that affects a lot of the divisions. It will help spread the workload amongst staff. The exact timeline is not yet known but we have not lost sight of that goal.

We have been adding planting trees. It is unknown at this point if we will be getting an Urban Forester. Part of the salary is being used to fund an hourly employee to perform low level tree work. So far, a close look shows it is a very efficient use of the money. We do still have two contracts to complete. That will incur some of that money.

We have an arborist on board who has been providing our tree reports and assisting with Risk Management in relation to trees.

There are landscape services contracts we are looking at that was part of the Urban Forester position.

Herrera – commended staff for continuing to spear head this. He would like to see it move forward as soon as possible.

Dan Efseaff– mentioned we haven't always had an annual report like this but feels it is a good way to share information with the public. It gives them a chance to see all the work that goes on in the park. The report includes comparisons of expenditures and how it compares with other urban areas.

An estimated 1.9 million annual visits occurred in 2012 year. No figure is available for 2013, as traffic collection efforts were suspended with the budget cuts, but we hope to start back up this year.

With the changes, we've had to look at other resources such as the Sheriff's Work Alternative Program (SWAP) and Alternative Correctional Sentencing (ACS) program which has allowed us to do encampment clean ups and to keep Caper Acres open on a regular schedule since December.

In-kind services and donations – We exceeded 19,000 hours for this year. Our dollar value from donations went from \$8,600 last year to over \$20,000 this year. This can be attributed to the Birthday Bash new event which provided for event fees and Jake Early t-shirt sales.

Commissioner Ober – expressed concern about the Volunteer Coordinator position remaining vacant. He urged the City to not let the Volunteer Coordinator position go unfilled and urged the community to get behind the City to encourage that to happen.

Dan Efseaff – When you look at the limited resources we have, certainly 19,000 hours is valued at over \$400,000 worth of work by volunteers. It is hard to look at that and not have someone steward it along. Also, the donations, the more we can engage them, the more likely that will support us. There is a high value for us.

Ruben Martinez– the Volunteer Coordinator position has actually changed names three times. The most recent name is Park Services Coordinator. The Volunteer Coordinator function has always been very important asset. He is doing a comprehensive look at reorganizing some things. Besides work load leveling, it would allow us to make the case for this position. We will definitely not be letting our Volunteer Coordinator position disappear.

Moravec – Regarding the Volunteer Coordinator position, who sets the timeline as to when that goes before Council?

Martinez – It's a combination of being prepared to answer all the questions and having all the background information. The report is close to being done, but I needed answers to a few more questions before bringing it forward. The Volunteer Coordinator will only be a portion of the new position.

The Commission will be notified when it will be coming before Council.

Mary Rooney - spoke about tree issues on Cromwell Drive. She and neighbors have submitted requests to remove the hazardous trees on their street. While she has heard back from the City, other neighbors have not. They are anxious to get the trees out before they start budding again.

Chair Emmerich emphasized that the Commission simply cannot do their job effectively without an Urban Forester and while the City is having financial issues, it would be a shame to use that rationale to undercut the very good work done by the Commission, through the Tree Committee and by Denise on creating the Urban Forest Plan. We cannot do our work without the position

that replicates what Lise did for us. This position has proved to be a wonderful financial boon to the city. It will be increasingly difficult to continue to manage volunteer activities without someone who has hands on activity on a regular basis. We simply cannot do our work without those core positions. Whatever the Commission can do to support moving forward with these positions, they will.

Shane Romain – gave an overview of what the park rangers have been dealing with and the challenges with limited resources and staff.. Over the past six months, they have working with only two rangers. In addition to overseeing Bidwell Park, they are also looking after greenways and open spaces.

There is an exceptional amount of transient activity. The park rangers have been taking care of these issues on their own due to staff reductions in other departments.

Commissioner Ober – you are describing about 9,000 acres and as of now, we have about 2.5 FTE rangers. He recognizes the challenges Shane is describing. He inquired about how other City parks around the country compare.

Shane – Even without a Volunteer Coordinator, we are moving forward with volunteer services and training. Information can be found on the City's website and at upcoming Farmers' market.

**6.2. Parks and Street Trees Divisions Report – Dan Efseaff, Park and Natural Resource Manager** – This report was postponed until the February meeting.

**7. Adjourn to the next regular meeting on February 24, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).**

Date Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ / \_\_\_\_\_ / \_\_\_\_\_  
Prepared By: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**

Minutes of  
February 24, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:** None

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager), Linda Herman (General Services Administrative Manager).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

All matters listed under the Consent Agenda are to be considered routine and enacted by one motion.

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes for the December 2013 and January 2014 Meetings**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 12/16/13 and 1/27/14.

**2.3 Permit for Bidwell Bark Fun Run & Festival (9/27/14).**

The Butte Humane Society requests use of the One Mile Picnic Area and standard race course for a 5-K run and 2-K walk. Other dog-oriented activities will also occur in this area. This permit requires BPPC action because the applicant requests the setup of a fenced area that will be used for demonstrations of dogs off-leash. **Recommendation:** Conditional approval.

**2.6 Approval of Tree Removal Permits**

Various applicants would like to remove 1 sycamore (Yarwood variety) at each of the locations listed below because of multiple broken limbs during the growing season (hazard to people and property), and damage to infrastructure (sidewalk lifting). **Recommendation:** Staff recommends approval of removal permits for: 1) 1605 Ridgebrook Way; 2) 652 Cromwell Drive, 3) 660 Cromwell Drive, and 4) 669 Cromwell Drive.

**MOTION:** Moved to approve Items 2.1, 2.3, and 2.6 of the consent agenda as submitted and recommended by Staff. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood. **SECOND:** Jim Moravec. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** None

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT**

Commissioner Emmerich requested the removal of items 2.2 and 2.4:

## **2.2 Permit Application for a Wedding at North 5 Mile (9/20/14).**

Applicant (Lindsay Pernell) requests use of the north side of the Five Mile Picnic area for a wedding. While this area is intensively managed and appropriate for a variety of activities it is not identified as a reservable area and therefore requires BPPC action.

Commissioner Emmerich inquired about the fees charged for weddings and whether a damage deposit is required. General Services Administrative Manager (GSAM) Herman responded that the Chico Municipal Code requires a \$100 damage deposit and insurance for private events with over 100 people attending or if amplified sound is used, and for all public events regardless of the attendance numbers. Herman continued that this wedding did not meet these criteria, but that the Commission always has the authority to put additional conditions on an applicant, if so desired.

Emmerich further questioned whether the City should consider requiring a damage deposit and possibly increasing fees for weddings. Commissioner Ober concurred that the \$30 fees charged are too low for these types of events. GSAM Herman responded that staff is looking at the cost of all reservations to possibly revise the fees and amend the Chico Municipal Code where applicable if needed.

**MOTION:** Moved to approve the permit application with conditions for the wedding at North Five Mile Picnic Area on 9/20/14. **MADE BY:** Rich Ober. **SECOND:** Janine Rood. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0.  
**ABSENT:** None

## **2.4 Permit for the Making Strides 5K Walk (10/17-10/18/14)**

American Cancer Society requested the use of One Mile Recreation Area Oak Grove Picnic Site for a 5-K walk and fundraiser. The applicant requests BPPC action as they plan to have someone stay overnight for security purposes.

Commissioner Emmerich asked whether the overnight camping request was an unusual request. Park and Natural Resource Manager (P&NRM) Efsaaff responded that this event has had someone stay over night to guard equipment and supplies in previous years without incident.

**MOTION:** Moved to approve the application with conditions for the Making Strides 5K Walk as submitted. **MADE BY:** Lisa Emmerich. **SECOND:** Mary Brentwood. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0.  
**ABSENT:** None

Commissioner Moravec requested the removal of item 2.5:

## **2.5 Consideration of Chico Area Recreation District's (CARD) request to waive reservation and vendor fees for 2014 permits.**

CARD requests a waiver of the reservation and vendor fees for the Spring Jamboree; Movies in the Park; 4th of July Community Celebration; and Pastels on the Plaza events.

Commissioner Moravec asked if it was prudent based on the City's current budget situation to waive fees for events. P&NRM Efsaaff responded that the Municipal code allows for the reservation and vendor fees to be waived for public agencies and non-profit organizations. Moravec commented that there are other well-served events held by non-profit organizations that do not get their fees waived. Moravec also questioned whether CARD charges its vendors to participate in the event, and if so, the City should not waive the vendor fee. Staff responded that they will check into this and report back to the Commission.



Commissioner Brentwood asked if the fees had always been waived for these CARD events. GSAM Herman replied that she believed that the City is listed as a sponsor of these long-standing events and that the waiver of the fees facilitates this sponsorship.

Commissioners Ober and Rood supported approving the waiver this time, but agreed that the fees and the waiver policy should be reviewed. Commissioner Brentwood added that revising the fees should be a priority.

Commission Chair Emmerich stated that the discussion regarding revising the fees is something that should probably be forwarded to the Policy Advisory Committee.

**MOTION:** Moved to approve CARD's request to waive the reservation and vendor fees for the Spring Jamboree, Movies in the Park, 4h of July Community Celebration and Pastels on the Plaza events this year, and that the larger issue regarding revising fees by forwarded to the BPPC Policy Advisory Committee. **MADE BY:** Jim Moravec. **SECOND:** Lisa Emmerich. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** None

### 3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS - NONE

### 4. REGULAR AGENDA

#### 4.1. Consideration of Application to the Coca Cola/Keep America Beautiful Recycling Bin Grant Program.

The Coca-Cola Foundation and Keep America Beautiful (KAB) have partnered together to support local communities in their recycling efforts through an annual competitive grant program that provides free bins for the collection of beverage containers in various public settings.

GSAM Herman reported that recycling bins are made available to public agencies at no cost through this grant program and that staff would like to submit an application for bins to be used in the major picnic areas in Bidwell Park. Due to their durability and design, Staff is recommending that the Commission approve requesting eight to ten of the blue outdoor metal recycling bins with the Keep America Beautiful logo for use in the One Mile Recreations Area, Caper Acres, Cedar Grove, and the Five Mile Picnic Area.

Herman further reported that the City currently contracts with the non-profit Work Training Center for the collection of the downtown recycling bins, and that these bins could be added to this contract. Herman stated the cost of the recycling collection is funded by another Beverage Container Recycling grant that the City receives from CalRecycle.

Commissioner Ober concurred that the Keep America Beautiful (KAB) logo is preferred over the commercial Coca-Cola brand, and that these bins will provide better visibility and ease of use for recycling. He also asked if the Work Training Center had been contacted about taking over the collection of these bins in which staff replied yes.

In response to Commissioner Brentwood question whether it was possible to order more recycling bins for use in the park, GSAM Herman said that there is no limit stated in the grant guidelines and that staff will request additional bins in its application.

Commissioner Rood also supported the use of the recycling containers with the KAB logo.

#### FROM THE PUBLIC

Park Watch member Carla Moreno asked if the bins were easily to get into since she often picks up trash from people taking out recyclables from the existing open barrel recycling bins in the park. Herman responded that the bins have a locking cable that secures the dome lid to the

container. Ms. Moreno also stated that the location and proper use of the bins should be publicized.

Commissioner Herrera cautioned about making the containers too secure based on CSU, Chico's experience that the containers may be vandalized and damaged from people trying to pry open the lids to get to the recyclables.

Commissioner Ober agreed that if the City is awarded the grant that it should be publicized. GSAM Herman responded that publicizing the bins is actually a requirement of the grant.

**MOTION:** Moved to approve the submittal of an application to the Recycling Bin Grant Program to obtain recycling bins for Bidwell Park. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood. **SECOND:** Rich Ober. **AYES:** 7 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** None

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Members of the public may address the Commission at this time on any matter not already listed on the agenda; comments are limited to three minutes. The Commission cannot take any action at this meeting on requests made under this section of the agenda.

Public member Mark Stemen, who is the Chair of the City's Sustainability Task Force, addressed the Commission regarding the need to move forward with the Urban Forest Management Plan and how the BPPC Tree Committee has not been able to meet due to the lack of staff. He suggested forming an Ad-Hoc Committee to review the Plan. He cited that ad-hoc committees are not subject to the Brown Act and can be held without agendas, public noticing, minutes, and City staff.

In response to Commissioner Brentwood's question whether it is true that the meeting could occur without staff, Stemen said yes under the Brown Act, but that the requirements for agendas, minutes, and staff attendance is a City policy. Stemen continued that not holding public meetings due to this policy stalls the approval of the Urban Forest Management Plan and other work, and is in essence resulting in the City not governing.

Commissioner Ober said that he would be interested in agendizing this idea at a future meeting.

Commissioner Emmerich questioned if an Ad-Hoc committee will meet the City's intent to publicly sunshine policy decisions, and stated that staff may need to get a legal opinion regarding this.

Commissioner Herrera added that, although not required, public notification of the Ad-Hoc Committee meeting could still occur.

Also as Business from the Floor, Commissioner Emmerich asked if the City is still going to have an Earth Day event in Bidwell Park this year, and if so, who will be doing it. P&NRM Efseaff stated that the volunteer intern Heidi Ortiz and the other volunteer team leaders are working on the event. He added that this year's event will probably be less centralized and that the volunteers will meet directly at the work sites.

Commissioner Brentwood asked whether the recent trail grant work in Upper Park helped combat erosion during the recent storms. Efseaff responded that it did and the trails seem to be holding up pretty well.

## 6. REPORTS

Items provided for the Commission's information and discussion. No action can be taken on any of the items unless the Commission agrees to include them to a subsequent posted agenda.

### 6.1. Parks and Street Trees Division Report (January and February) - Dan Efseaff, Park and Natural Resource Manager.

P&NRM Efseaff provided a verbal report on his Manager's Report highlighting the following:

1. That there have been more park citations issued than previous years, with the top three being parking, alcohol, and no smoking violations.
2. The Street Tree Summary, noting that despite having over 3,600 vacant tree planting sites that the City still has a 90% tree occupancy rate.
3. Tree plantings that have occurred in the right-of-way through developments.
4. Announcement of Park Watch and Volunteer Training on March 13, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber.

Commission Herrera asked if the parking violations have increased due to the closing of the park gates. In response, P&NRM stated that not too much in the Lower and Middle park areas, but to some degree in Upper Park.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 7:40 p.m. to the next regular meeting on March 31, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

---

Date Approved:    /    /   .

Prepared By:

---

Linda Herman, General Services Administrative Manager

---

Date

Distribution: BPPC

U:\Parks\_Templates\BPPC\_templates\BPPC\_Minutes\_Template\_10\_0615.doc  
5/21/2015

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**  
Minutes of  
March 31, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Vice Chair Moravec called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Lisa Emmerich

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager (PNRM)), and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA – Items 2.3 and 2.4 were removed from the Consent Agenda for further discussion.**

**MOTION:** Approve items 2.1, 2.2 and 2.5 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Mary Brentwood **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 2/24/14.

**2.2. Permit Application for a Sunrise Service in Middle Park on Easter (4/20/14)**

Vineyard Christian Fellowship of Chico requests a permit to hold an Easter sunrise service at the cross near Parking Area B in Middle Park. The request to host a public event in a non-intensive use area requires BPPC approval. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

**2.5 Permit Application for the Jack Frost 10K (12/14/14)**

Fleet Feet Sports requests to host a race that starts in Lower Park and extends into Middle Park. Applicant has hosted similar events for the past 5 years. Much of the route is along paths or trails that can accommodate use during wet weather conditions. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

Items 2.3 was removed from the consent agenda by Commissioner Ober for further discussion.

**2.3. Permit Application for the 22<sup>nd</sup> Annual Hooked on Fishing Derby at Horseshoe Lake (5/31/14)**

Applicant requests a permit to host a fishing derby in Middle Park at Horseshoe Lake. BPPC approval is required for public event at intensive use areas and to allow the stocking of the lake with approximately 10,000 lbs. of catfish. **Recommendation:** *Approval of permit with conditions.*

Commissioner Ober stated concern of the low lake levels for the event. However, PNRM Efsseff stated since the time of the application, storms have allowed the lake levels to rise (over 2 feet since January), therefore able to sustain the fish for this event.

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.3 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

Item 2.4 was removed from the consent agenda by Commissioner Herrera for further discussion.

**2.4 Permit Application for Chico Music Bicycle Festival (6/7/14)**

The Butte Environmental Council requests a permit to host the 6th Chico Music Bicycle Festival at Camellia Way. This free event supports "Bike Chico Week" and promotes the use of bicycles. The application requires Commission consideration because the area is not designated as an intensive use area. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

Commission Herrera pulled item to recuse himself because of a conflict of interest. Commissioner Rood recused herself as her employer is a sponsor of the event.

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.4 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood **SECOND:** Richard Ober **AYES:** 4 (Brentwood, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Emmerich). **RECUSED:** 2 (Herrera and Rood)

3. **NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS** – None.

**4. REGULAR AGENDA**

**4.1. Appeal of Tree Removal Permit (2273 Bloomington Ave)**

On March 4, 2014 Staff received an application for a permit to remove a Shingle Oak (*Quercus imbricaria*), a medium sized shade tree located at 2273 Bloomington Ave., within City right-of-way. At the time the application was filed, the young tree appeared to be in good condition with no root impacts to the sidewalk. The tree is not dead, dying, or dangerous. Staff denied the request. The applicant wrote an appeal letter (received on March 20, 2014) to the BPPC.

**Recommendation:** *Rejection of appeal.*

PNRM Efsseff provided an overview of the appeal filed by Ms. Angela Vanella. The applicant requested removal for the reason that it is very messy. Acorns populate the yard and sidewalk, posing a slip hazard. In addition, the applicant didn't care for the fact that the leaves turn brown and remain on the tree long after the leaf pickup program ends for the season. Staff evaluated the tree (the subdivision developer selected and planted the tree) and found the tree (approximately 15 years old) at this time in good condition with only minor defects and with no damage to the curb or sidewalk.

Efsseff stated there are quite a few bur oaks in that area. This tree in particular has good structure to it. These are moderately size trees, in good condition and should be a solid tree for years to come. Shedding trees have advantages and drawbacks; however, from the City's perspective (infrastructure, maintenance, etc.), it is a tree worth keeping.

Ober asked about an estimate on the typical lifespan of this tree. PNRM Efsseff stated probably a maximum of 70-80 years in this setting, but likely less depending on the circumstances over time.

Brentwood asked if it was at its full size. Efseaff concluded it was about half way to its full growth potential.

Ober stated he was very familiar with the tendencies of this species of tree and how the leaves stay brown and on the tree. However, that same feature also provides shade for a longer period of time. He asked if there was enough history on this tree, and if sidewalk lifting would happen at some point. Efseaff stated that at some point there it might, but that is reduced as it is a relatively slow growing tree and root guards are in place and appear sufficient. These trees are noted to be good urban trees. They are tough, drought resistant and would definitely be on our Urban city tree list.

Rood asked Efseaff if this tree is on our native tree list. Efseaff confirmed it is native to North America but not native to California. Ober confirmed that this tree is listed on the approved tree list.

Moravec asked about the size of the tree and if there were any estimates on the diameter of the tree at breast height at maturity. Efseaff stated that depending on the soil conditions, it could be upwards of 30 inches for a large tree.

Moravec asked if in the long term does a potential problem exist, or could the space available accommodate the tree. Efseaff responded that it is a relatively narrow space so any tree, even a moderately sized tree could present problems at the end of its life cycle. It could take a few decades. Its current location could present a problems maybe ten years or more down the road.

Moravec reiterated that the tree is on the approved street tree list and will continue to be on the list because it is a good urban tree.

Herrera asked Efseaff to reiterate the City's criteria for removing a tree. Efseaff stated that per the City code, trees that are safety or health issue related are an administrative decision so staff could have those removed and report back to the Commission. Other trees that are deemed for the convenience for the landowner and have safety concerns but not an eminent one, has to be considered as a discretionary tree. Discretionary trees are removed and replaced at the expense of the landowner.

Public comments on this item:

The appellant, Ms. Angela Vanella, was not in attendance.

Charles Withuhn and Woody Elliott spoke in favor of denying the appeal.

Ober stated another reason why he would not support the appeal was that he felt there was a need for a variety in age and size of trees. Brentwood echoed what Commissioner Ober said and that we need to be careful of following the criteria when trees are not damaged. Herrera stressed the need to respect the tree for its intrinsic value. Moravec – concur with the two public speakers and the fact that it continues to be an approved street tree.

**MOTION:** To deny the appeal at 2273 Bloomington Avenue. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** (Emmerich).

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Charles Withuhn stated that he was sorry the Tree Committee did not have a quorum at the last meeting and looks forward to the Committee meeting again. He is hopeful of public input about the refinement and the adoption of the Urban Forest Management Plan.

Ober brought up the topic of quorums and committees. With Commissioner Emmerich out of town indefinitely, he asked about appointing a temporary replacement to the Tree Committee.

Efseaff stated that staff was rescheduling the meetings so a quorum of committee members could attend for the April meeting, and that Committee assignments are at the Chairs prerogative (or interim Chair in this case). Herrera mentioned he would be happy to step in since he is familiar with the Tree Committee until Commissioner Emmerich returns. Chair Moravec assigned Commissioner Herrera to the Tree Committee while Commissioner Emmerich is away.

## 6. REPORTS

6.1 PNRM Efseaff provided a verbal report on his Manager's Report highlighting the following:

1. Park & Street Trees Division Report – In regards to ad-hoc committees, the PWD provided a memo addressing creation of standing committees which are directed thru the City Council. The procedures are discussed in AP&P 10.1.
2. Staff is working with volunteers at doing some maintenance work and improvements at the observatory. The work will replace the crushed granite path and make the observatory more ADA accessible.
3. Chico has been named for the 30<sup>th</sup> year as a Tree City USA. There will be a couple of Arbor Day plantings with a proclamation at the next Council meeting.
4. Progress is being made on the Caper Acres project. Ideas for design have been solicited from some elementary school classes.
  - a. A preliminary conceptual design will be presented at the next Natural Resource Committee meeting. Caper Acres Design Principals and Guidelines has been provided in draft form.
  - b. Working with Chico State, students will be developing history on Caper Acres along with a questionnaire. That class will be providing an informational presentation at the next meeting.
  - c. A donation of \$1,000 has been received from Omegu Nu for Caper Acres.
5. PNRM provided an explanation of park trail closures as related to rainfall and temperatures.
6. A tree list was provided for Grafton Park landowners to select from for tree replacements.

## 2 ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 7:35 p.m. to the next regular meeting on April 28, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved: \_\_/\_\_/\_\_

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**

Minutes of  
April 28, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Vice Chair Moravec called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Lisa Emmerich

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager), Ruben Martinez (Public Works Director, and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant)

**1.3. Special Presentation – CSUC Geography 428 Site Planning class, Spring 2014**

Pam Figge's class presented: *The Cultural and Historic Background of Caper Acres and User Study: A Component of the Caper Acres Master Plan* (Lower Bidwell Park, Chico, California)

**2. CONSENT AGENDA** – Items 2.2 and 2.3 were removed from the Consent Agenda for further discussion by Commissioner Ober.

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.1 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Herrera. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

**2.1. Approval of Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 3/31/14.

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA**

Items 2.2 and 2.3 were removed from the Consent Agenda for further discussion by Commissioner Ober.

**2.2. Permit Application for Tree Removal (1960 Zachary Court)**

Applicant (Jesus Arredondo) submitted a permit to remove a 12" diameter European hackberry tree because of damage to the sidewalk (past damage to a water main) associated with the invasive roots. **Recommendation:** *Approval of removal and replacement permit.*

Commissioner Ober pulled both permit applications for tree removal to state that a procedure for an expedited process for obtaining a tree removal permit is still being worked out.



**MOTION:** Approve item 2.2 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Brentwood. **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

### **2.3. Permit Application for Tree Removal (28 San Ramon Drive)**

Applicant (Carol Gilmore) submitted a permit to remove a 17" diameter zelkova tree because it is lifting the sidewalk and driveway. This tree was planted without root barriers and was installed too close to the sidewalk. **Recommendation:** *Approval of removal and replacement permit.*

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.3 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

## **3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None**

## **4. REGULAR AGENDA**

### 4.1 Permit for Rock Climbing

CSU Chico, Department of Kinesiology has requested taking a group of students from a rock climbing class to Upper Park. The request includes both bouldering and top rope climbing and rappelling. The request is for three days in the fall and another three days in the spring.

Park and Natural Resources Manager Efseaff stated that rock climbing is an approved activity in the park. However, it is considered to be one of the passive uses of the park. The park does not have an official designated area for rock climbing. Within the Master Management Plan, there will be a rock climbing plan eventually.

There were two types of climbing that were considered: Top roping or rappelling which would require hardware on top such as rock anchors; and bouldering. Erosion and thin soil issues were raised by staff in regards to bouldering. However, bouldering within the flood zone of the creek would have very few impacts on soils, plants and cultural artifacts. Staff had less confidence in bouldering on top without further review.

It was recommended to the Commission to split the two activities and to work through the details. . Since they are only requesting three days for each class session and there would only be two groups of six students, it would be a manageable sized group to observe and decide what to do in the future for a rock climbing plan.

The rock climbing plan would require a lot more: cultural resources, botanical survey, and possibly CEQA compliance.

Conditions have been added: no use or installation of permanent hardware, no removal of soil, and a higher insurance coverage could also be required. In the past, unsanctioned hardware was removed at the City's expense.

The applicant has proved to be willing to work with staff.

Herrera asked why since rock climbing is an approved use, then why did they need approval? Efseaff stated that once it is an organized activity, it requires a permit.

Ober asked if the Park Commission would need to approve the higher limits of insurance requirements.

Efseaff responded that it can be part of the acceptance of conditions. The City is shifting towards a different model of variable insurance – requirement of more for higher risk activities.

From the Public:

DG Laurie – asked about how the climbers would access the climbing areas.

Efseaff stated the applicant is trying to demonstrate an environmental ethic with the students in the class. They have a “no-trace” ethic. They are able to access the park via bicycle even with the gates closed.

DG Laurie – was concerned about the procedure if there was an accident or injury.

Ober – asked about the procedure for response and the costs associated with it.

Efseaff stated it would be a regular response of a ranger, fire personnel, EMT, etc. as appropriate. The high rate of insurance would cover those costs.

Dr. Jonathan Clark – he is the applicant for this permit. Some of the goals of this basic rock climbing course is to teach students to set up natural anchors and to find a spot to boulder that doesn't take a long time to get there.

Herrera – asked if he felt he had time to work with staff to iron out any ideas involved with the top rope climbing before next semester. Dr. Clark stressed a work together relationship and stressed that even a year from now be adequate.

Moravec – the applicant's willingness to work with the Commission on creating protocol for that type of top roping is very much appreciated.

**MOTION:** To approve the bouldering request with conditions and delay authorization of top rope climbing request until an additional investigation and recommendation can be made. **MADE BY:** Herrera.  
**SECOND:** Rood. **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0.  
**ABSENT:** Emmerich.

#### 4.2. Review and Provide Input on Public Works Reorganization and Urban Forest Manager

At the March 25, 2014 City Council meeting, the Council reviewed a proposed reorganization of the Public Works Department and a recruitment for a Parks Services Coordinator. The Council requested the BPPC to consider, review, and provide additional input to Public Works staff on the proposals related specifically to the duties associated with the Urban Forest Manager and the salary of the Parks Services Coordinator.

Public Works Director Martinez provided an overview of the recent changes in personnel, the shortfalls in staff coverage and the proposed reorganization.

Brentwood questioned that the Park Services Coordinator would keep the same duties but at a lower pay level. She was interested in the justification.

Martinez stated that Council asked it to be looked at.

Brentwood questioned whether the monies were being distributed in a fair way. She feels we need a Certified Urban Forester; therefore, that is her recommendation.

Herrera – questioned why the BPPC Commission wasn't allowed to weigh in on this issue previously. Would like to be able to provide input on any future vacancies.

Ober – Appreciates the opportunity to weigh in on this.

Moravec - Was not prepared to endorse the entire reorganization but is prepared to discuss specifics of some of the positions in the context of the reorganization. Expanded the time period for the public to speak from three minutes to five minutes.

From the Public:

Lise Smith-Peters, former Volunteer Coordinator/Park Services Coordinator - does not agree with the proposed reorganization. She is concerned with the current staff situation and the overwork load of staff. She doesn't believe one person can handle both the park management and handle the needs of the Urban Forest program. She questioned when he would be able to become a Certified Arborist which is what an Urban Forester needs to be. She questioned why other line staff are not included in this reorganization. Concerned that once the Urban Forest position is gone, that it will not come back. She strongly encouraged that the Park Services Coordinator position be filled as soon as possible and not balance the City's budget on the back of Bidwell Park.

Susan Mason – Is concerned that if the Urban Forester position is eliminated, it would never get funded in the future. She questioned the fact that former City tree maintenance worker is now paid on an hourly basis and are not receiving benefits. She strongly feels we need an experienced Urban Forester and a Park Services Coordinator.

Scott Gregory, biologist – Concerned that the Urban Forester position is being considered for removal. He conducted the street tree inventory for the City of Chico for his master's thesis. He inventories uplifted sidewalks due to tree roots. There are over 1,500 incidents of uplifted sidewalks which poses an ADA problem. He feels it will be difficult to reinstate the Urban Forester position if it is eliminated. Suggested keeping it vacant or staff it part time but do keep the position. Feels the position offers opportunities to apply for grants.

Karen Laslo – She was under the impression that the purpose of eliminating these positions was to save money but now she hears it is not to save money. Feels the citizens of Chico feel it is to save money. She is in support of filling the Urban Forester position and the Urban Forest needs to be maintained regularly and properly.

Woody Elliott – supports keeping the Park Services Coordinator. Regarding the Urban Forester position, as an interim measure, he supports contracting out for a Registered Professional Forester. This is a state license and can help the Commission adopt the Urban Forest Management Plan.

Renee Buchan – Feels the volunteer program thrives with a Volunteer Coordinator. Also feels the Urban Forester position is key and should be filled.

Commissioner Ober asked about current staffing levels for various positions. Staffing levels for FTE Euseff stated that rangers are currently down to 2.75 compared to two full time and two seasonal rangers three years ago. In regards to the maintenance workers, the current staffing level is about half of its peak in 2008. Martinez stated that in regards to the tree crew, there used to have be three 3-man crews, including a field supervisor. We are now down to one field supervisor and one hourly tree worker. As a negotiated item, we will bring that person back full time with benefits as of July 1. This will amount to two people.

Ober – this doesn't really put us in recovery mode. There is such a gap between where we were, where we are now, and where we want to be.

Herrera – we haven't ever seen upper management salary levels this high and park staffing levels this low. Does not feel he can support, in good faith, support a recommendation that adds tasks to an already overworked staff. Fewer staff doesn't support a healthy Bidwell Park

Brentwood – would like to keep the Urban Forester position because our urban forest identifies our city and would like to immediately fill the Park Services Coordinator position at the existing salary level. He would also like to see Public Works Director Martinez educate the Council on what these positions entail. Feels salaries should be more fairly distributed between managers and workers.

Traulsen – would struggle voting the recommendation down, but has a problem reducing salary ranges.

Rood – applauds any efforts to improve processes and be more efficient, but agrees with all the voices heard today that it would be wrong to get rid of the Urban Forester position as well as the Park Services Coordinator position.

Moravec – in regards to the Park Services Coordinator position, believes there is a tremendous return on investment and believes the position should be filled. However, in regards to the urban Forester position, he appreciates the creativity Martinez put into it, and agrees that many of the duties can be done by current staff and others contracted out to another party to maintain the urban forest.

Ober – believes there are certain core things that the City is responsible for (urban forest, parks, greenways, etc.) and believes the City should not abandon those responsibilities or should assume that they can be performed equally well by contracting them out.

**MOTION:** That the BPPC recommends to the City Council, the retention of the following full time positions: the Park Services Coordinator and the Urban Forester positions. These positions should be filled as soon as possible and compensated at appropriate competitive levels. **MADE BY:** Ober.  
**SECOND:** Brentwood.

A friendly amendment by Rood to support a full time Park Services Coordinator and a part time Urban Forester.

Commissioner Ober felt the Commission should make as clear and strong endorsement for these positions as possible. He would like to provide staff with support that they need so that they can do their job.

Does not accept the friendly amendment. Would like the recommendation to be very clear and very strong.

The first motion was restated.

**MOTION:** That the BPPC recommends to the City Council, the retention of the following full time positions: the Park Services Coordinator and the Urban Forester. These positions should be filled as soon as possible and compensated at appropriate competitive levels. **MADE BY:** Ober. **SECOND:** Brentwood. **AYES:** 5 (Brentwood, Herrera, Ober, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 1 (Moravec). **ABSENT:** Emmerich.

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

D G Laurie - stated he would like to see the Upper Bidwell Park access road properly maintained and open year round, with weather permitting.

Woody Elliott – suggested asking for an added monetary donation when someone signs up for and pays fees for an activity in the park. This could help to fund staffing in the park.

Mark Herrera – would very much like to have a discussion at the Committee level about the City’s landscape contract and would like to see it on a future agenda.

## 6. REPORTS

- 6.1. **Tree Committee Report** – Chair Ober reported on the idea of a programmatic tree removal permit to expedite the process. A conceptual approach has been provided and the feedback was positive. Also, the conversation continued about the Urban Forest Management Plan. It is getting close to being actionable.
- 6.2. **Natural Resources Committee Report** – Chair Brentwood reported that they met about the design for Caper Acres. Greg Melton provided a presentation on the design based on comments received thus far. The conceptual plan will be available on the City’s website for further comments from the community. We will soon get the community involved in fundraising and volunteering.
- 6.3. **Parks and Street Trees Division Report** – Commissioner Ober asked about the grading of Upper Park Road. Efseaff reported that the road needs to be engineered and brought up to modern forest road standards.

From the Public:

DG Laurie stated that there are conflicting signs designating when the park road is closed.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 9:43 p.m. to the next regular meeting on Tuesday, May 27, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved: \_\_/\_\_/\_\_

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**

Minutes of  
May 27, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Vice Chair Moravec called the meeting to order at 6:35 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Janine Rood

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager) and Linda Herman (Administrative Manager).

**1.3. Special Presentation:** Award to the Mount Lassen Chapter California Native Plant Society (CNPS) for a Keep American Beautiful Waste Management grant to support invasive plant removal on City of Chico parks and other areas.

Waste Management District Manager Ryan West presented CNPS representative Susan Mason with a large check in the amount of \$4,000 for disposal and other costs to remove invasive plants on City parks and greenways and other areas.

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

Items 2.2 and 2.3 were removed from the Consent Agenda for further discussion by Commissioner Ober.

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of the BPPC meeting held on 4/28/14.

**MOTION:** Approved Item 2.1 – Minutes of the 4/28/13 BPPC meeting as submitted. **MADE BY:** Brentwood. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 4 (Brentwood, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 3 (Emmerich, Herrera and Rood).

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT** – 2.2 and 2.3 removed by Commissioner Ober.

**2.2. Tree Removal Permit for 534 Mission Santa Fe Circle**

Applicant (Phyllis Lindberg) requests approval of a permit to remove a 20" diameter sycamore tree growing within the City ROW. Landowner is concerned that the tree's proximity to existing gas and electrical lines will pose a future hazard to public health and safety. **Recommendation:** Approval of removal permit.

### **2.3. Tree Removal Permit for 1609 Ridgebrook Way**

Applicant (Judy Hemstalk) requests approval of a permit to remove and replace a 12" diameter sycamore tree growing within the City ROW. Landowner requests removal because the invasive root system is lifting the sidewalk and driveway (>1"). **Recommendation:** Approval of removal permit.

Commissioner Ober pulled both tree removal permit applications to receive Staff's confirmation that the Sycamore trees being requested to be removed fit under the new proposed Programmatic Tree Removal policy.

Commissioner Traulsen asked whether the permits would require the homeowners to plant replacement trees. In response, Park and Natural Resource Manager (P&NRM) Efsseff said that for the location on Item 2.2 – Mission Santa Fe Circle there is no room for a replacement due to the location of underground utilities and safety concerns. For the permit in Item 2.3 the homeowner is required to plant another more suitable replacement tree.

**MOTION:** Approved Tree Removal Permit Items 2.2 and 2.3 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** OBER. **SECOND:** Traulsen. **AYES:** 4 (Brentwood, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 3 (Emmerich, Herrera, and Rood).

### **3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None**

### **4. REGULAR AGENDA**

#### **4.1. Permit Application for a Music Concert to show appreciation and acknowledgement to the Downtown Ambassadors (6/5/14)**

Applicant (Ronald Reed) applied for a permit for a music concert at Children's Playground to acknowledge the efforts of the Downtown Ambassadors to "make downtown Chico a cleaner, safer, better place to live". **Recommendation:** Conditional approval.

Efsseff stated that this permit application is coming before the Commission because the Chico Municipal Code limits amplified sound to 20 minutes at the Bidwell Bowl Amphitheater. Efsseff continued that the DCBA Friday Night Concerts were held in Children's Playground during the reconstruction of City Plaza with little or no problems and that Staff will review this time restriction for a possible code amendment request in the future.

Ober concurred that perhaps it is time to review the restrictions since Bidwell Bowl is a good and appropriate venue for these types of events.

**MOTION:** Approved Park Permit Application Item 4.1 of the regular agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Brentwood. **SECOND:** Ober. **AYES:** 4 (Brentwood, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 3 (Emmerich, Herrera, and Rood).

#### **4.2. Permit Application for the Primal Endurance X (9/6/14)**

Charity 5K and 10K Run/Walk to help raise awareness and money for the Downtown Chico Business Association and Clean and Safe Chico. Application is to reserve City Plaza. The event will require street and/or encroachment permits. **Recommendation:** Conditional approval based on Applicant receiving appropriate permits for street and Right of Way issues.

P&NRM Efseaff stated that the BPPC is considering this permit application because the applicant is requesting that this 5K/10K Run/Walk is not utilizing the standard regular race route because it starts at City Plaza, encompasses parts of downtown streets, and ends in lower Bidwell Park.

Ober – asked whether this applicant has conducted other events and was present to ask questions. Staff replied no to both questions.

Moravec – expressed concerns about the applicant not being at the meeting and not knowing anything about this organization. He referenced the problems and damages that occurred from the Neon color run held in Bidwell Park in the past.

Ober and Brentwood - concurred with Moravec's concerns, but clarified that because the regular and standardized race route will be used while in Bidwell Park that the BPPC's only real purview was whether to allow them to reserve City Plaza.

Moravec – asked if there is any downside of approving the permit, if the applicant fails to get the appropriate street and right-of-way permits. Particularly he referred to tying up the September 6<sup>th</sup> date and how it could affect other potential reservations at the Plaza for this date. Staff replied that it is common practice for applicants to come in right after their annual event to book a venue for the following year.

#### FROM THE PUBLIC:

Steve Rooney – Stated that he has reserved the City Plaza for over 24 years and for over 40 years at the Silver Dollar Fairgrounds for his semi-annual Artisan's Faire. He said he has been a long-time permit applicant with a good track record, and is concerned about having to pay all of the reservation and other fees up front before he can reserve the venue. He continued that his fees total approximately \$700/yr. and that sales from the Faire have been down due in part to the panhandlers approaching attendees. He stated that the policy of requiring advanced payment of fees is a hardship for him.

P&NRM Efseaff responded that the policy to require advanced payment of fees was put in place several years ago and has saved staff time in processing park permits.

**MOTION:** Approved Park Permit Application Item 4.2 of the regular agenda subject to the Conditions 1 through 5 in the Staff Report, plus a 6<sup>th</sup> Condition that if the applicant does not obtain the approved street closure and encroachment permits for the event then the Park Application Permit is also denied. **MADE BY:** OBER. **SECOND:** Brentwood. **AYES:** 4 (Brentwood, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSENT:** 3 (Emmerich, Herrera, and Rood).

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Steve Rooney continued his discussion regarding the difficulty of having to come up with all of the fees a year in advance.

## 6. REPORTS

Items provided for the Commission's information and discussion. No action can be taken on any of the items unless the Commission agrees to include them to a subsequent posted agenda.

### 6.1. Tree Committee – Richard Ober, Committee Chair

Committee Chair Ober reported that at its 5/14/14 meeting, the Committee discussed two items. One was a proposal from Staff for a public/private partnership program that would establish a protocol and procedure to allow volunteers to plant street trees in the City Right-of-Way. Efseaff



added that staff will be coming forward with an Administrative Policy and Procedure for the program at a future BPPC meeting.

Ober said that the second item was continued discussions regarding the Urban Forest Management Plan. Ober stated that the Committee will focus on the objectives of the Plan at its next meeting.

**6.2. Parks and Street Trees Division Report - Dan Efseaff, Park and Natural Resource Manager.**

P&NRM Efseaff provided a summary of the Report by outlining the following:

1. The City is having difficulty finding trained and certified lifeguards this year, delaying the formal opening of the Sycamore Pool. He stated that they are trying to advertise in the media to get more applicants.
2. There will be a ribbon cutting and opening of the new assessable trail at Horseshoe Lake on Friday, June 6, 2014.
3. A design concept for the renovation of Caper Acres will be posted on the City website for public comment, and will also be discussed at the next BPPC Natural Resource Committee meeting.
4. The City's tree pruning contractor is conducting safety pruning of City trees within the major traffic corridors around Chico.
5. Two successful Arbor Day events were held on National Arbor Day on 4/25/14 in which CSU, Chico students, fraternity members, and staff planted five Maple trees at 3<sup>rd</sup> and Chestnut Streets, and another citizen volunteer group from Chico Tree Advocates planted five Purple Ash trees on El Dorado Street.
6. Another successful Earth Day event was held from 9 am to 12 pm on Saturday April 19, 2014, in which over 150 volunteers worked at the Comanche Creek Greenway, North One-Mile Area, and in the Cedar Grove/Chico Creek Nature Center area.

**7. ADJOURNMENT**

Adjourn to the next regular meeting on June 30, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved:    /    /   .

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Linda Herman, Administrative Manager

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

M:\PARK\Admin\BPPC\BPPC\_Meetings\2014\14\_0527\BPPC\_Minutes\_14\_0527.doc  
5/21/2015

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**

Minutes of  
June 30, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Richard Ober

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager), Shane Romain (Senior Park Ranger) and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA –**

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.1 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Jim Moravec **SECOND:** Janine Rood **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** Ober.

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 5/27/14.

**3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None.**

**4. REGULAR AGENDA**

**4.1. Train Run (10/12/14) – Applicant – Chico Running Club**

Efseaff provided an overview of the event application. The trail run would begin at Hooker Oak Park and go to the end of the road in Upper Park and then return back on the Yahi trail.

Public comments on this item:

Woody Elliott (Friends of Bidwell Park) - would like to see a check off box for donations on event applications. These monetary donations would be for helping to cover the costs of park maintenance. He would like to eventually see it become a part of the registration fee.

Efseaff stated it is common for a question on the application to ask for a donation or ask their applicants to donate. Soon there will be an option to donate through the North Valley Community Foundation.

**MOTION:** To approve the Chico Running Club trail run event on 10/12/14 with the conditions as outlined in the permit. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Ober).

#### **4.2. Run the Bump (8/30/14) – Applicant – Ready2Run**

Efseaff – this is also using upper and middle park trails. The original event request was for the south side of the park. This is this applicant's first event so staff is recommending using the north side as trails on the south side tend to be narrower and there are fewer options for getting off the route. The north side had greater access to emergency services if necessary.

Condition No. 3 should be corrected to read 100 or below participants.

Traulsen asked why this race was being limited to the north side but not the Bidwell Bump race. Efseaff stated that this is partly due to a long standing tradition with very minimal issues from this applicant in the past. This does point to having an overall policy in the future rather than looking at each individual event.

The applicant, Shawna Hambleton, explained where the water/aid stations would be set up. The race would start at Five Mile where the event staging area would be held. She is also in the process of researching and looking for an insurance policy that covers search and rescue incidents. The event does not appear it will impact the day users of the park.

Emmerich asked that if the Commission limited this race to the north side, would she still be interested in holding the race and the applicant reaffirmed this. The applicant asked if it was possible to go up the North Rim and come back on Middle Trail and Efseaff confirmed this.

#### Public Comments on this item

Woody Elliott (Friends of Bidwell Park) – spoke again on donations to the park by applicants. The applicant stated she would gladly donate time and/or money to the park.

**MOTION:** To accept the application for the Run the Bump event as long as conditions stipulated in the staff report are met including using designated trails on the north side of the park. **MADE BY:** Janine Rood **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Ober).

#### **4.3. Special Report: 2013 Year End Monitoring Report for the Peregrine Point Disc Golf Long Course**

Under the direction from the BPPC and City Council, staff worked with Outdoor Recreation Advocacy, Inc.(ORAI) toward the construction of a disc golf long course and installation of mitigation measures at Peregrine Point. The course opened in February, 2011. As per the adaptive management model adopted for the project, the Annual Report is the mechanism to document monitoring and recommendations for additional work and changes.

Efseaff provided monitoring data as well as recommendations for additional tasks and changes to improve the course. He reported:

- A lot of the mitigation measures to implement the project have been satisfied.
- Signage was added since last year. A stop sign will go up on a bollard when the conditions are unfavorable, making it clear when the course is closed.
- The trends of the course being open is improving. This is due to enforcement, education and compliance.

- The Outsiders provided their annual report and are recommending pole signage at each hole that includes information, along with a map and an opportunity for sponsorships:
- Efsseff noted a correction on Table 3 – It should state the number of tee pads that require mulch is seven. Mulch is recommended on six targets as well.
- There is a new wet weather assessment route.
- Summary of ranger vehicle observations: Open day observations are up.
- There is some mountain biking activity going on that is impacting the botanical monitoring on the Bidwell Knottweed, Checkerbloom and Blue Oaks. Staff will be working with the land owner to educate and enforce the rules.
- Blue Oak – this is the third year collecting data, so patterns are starting to become noticeable.
- Bare ground – impacts are different at each hole.
- Outsiders have formed a committee dedicated to course cleanup. Improvement connection between target and tee pads would help minimize foot traffic and damage.
- There are 12 holes being recommended for an alternative target placement to help minimize the impact on the oak trees. Everything is within the existing fairway.

Adam Filippone (President of the Chico Outsiders) reported the following:

- There was a significant increase in usage of the course.
- Peregrine Point disc golf course has been named the No. 7 destination course in all of California. This is out of 273 courses. It made the top 40 courses out of 8,000 in the U.S.
- New group has been formed to provide public education. *Preserve, Protect and then Play* is their motto.
- Showed a prototype of a tee sign that would provide educational information, fun facts, a map and sponsorship information.
- Over 300 volunteer hours were logged by the Outsiders.
- Will be setting up some work days that will include seeded straw laying to help with erosion, acorn planting, and alternate positions on the course.
- Monthly newsletters will include tips on keeping the spot alive.
- Working with staff on sustainable tree guards.

#### Commission comments

Emmerich asked about the frequency of the monitoring of the relocated 12 holes and will they be in the permanent locations.

Efsseff stated that part of the adaptive management model is to have staff maintain options for monitoring and to make changes when necessary. The monitoring of the relocated holes would be tied in with our regular monitoring as well as our annual monitoring of the oaks. During the winter the course may be contracted down and in the spring it may expand out. Tree guards are being researched that may offer full protection. A reasonable placement could not be found for hole #15.

Emmerich asked if the Commission recommends the reorganization of the course as suggested, how long will it take? She wanted to require that the Outsiders bear the costs associated with the reorganization.

Efsseff – this is our workplan for next year and we would report back to the Commission.

Adam – If agreed, he could probably have a group together and have the changes made by September before the recovery part of the year.

Emmerich asked if this ties in with the monitoring of the wet weather policy.

Efsseff – the shortened course will give the area a chance to recover - there will be a smaller area for people to play on. There would be enforcement out there.

Moravec asked Adam of his overall thoughts on the report.

Adam agrees with the report but realizes there is a small issue with the Oaks that he wants to deal with before the issue grows.

Public comments on this item:

Woody Elliott – has been monitoring Peregrine nesting activity in the area and for the first time since 2005 they have found successful activity; commented on the noticeable amount of bare ground on the course and recommended blue oak chips.

Emmerich appreciated the report and the collaborative approach with the BPPC and the Outsiders. She stressed the need to take on the protection of the Blue Oaks and the relocation of the course to facilitate this; liked the idea of signage in general as an educational tool but, would like to have it come back to the Commission for approval prior to placement in the park.

**MOTION:** To accept the 2013 report and encourage both staff and the ORAI to continue to work together to mitigate the issues pointed out throughout the report to alleviate those to the greatest extent possible. **MADE BY:** Jim Moravec **SECOND:** Mary Brentwood **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Rood and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Ober).

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Woody Elliott – inquired about the Commission’s 2013-14 work plan (Item “C” – the status of the preservation of Bidwell Ranch; and item “D” – the development options of Lost Park.

Efseaff stated staff is working with the consultant on the ratios of butte county meadow foam areas in Bidwell Ranch. In regards to Lost Park, the Natural Resources Committee will be discussing a trail plan and vegetative management plan.  
Re Lost Park,

Charles Withuhn – felt the Tree Committee meeting was very productive.

## 6. REPORTS

### 6.1 Tree Committee – Lisa Emmerich.

Commissioner Emmerich reported that at its 6/11/14 meeting, the Committee discussed two items.

A. Problematic Tree Removal permit that would help expedite the removal of problem trees based on a list of species identified by the City as undesirable. The Commission will be provided with quarterly reports on the process. The policy will be brought before the full Commission for discussion and assessment.

B. Continued discussion of the Urban Forest Management Plan – tasks, timeline, goals and objectives were discussed.

### 6.2. Parks and Street Trees Division Report – Park & Natural Resource Manager Efseaff

A. Efseaff reported the Hwy 32 widening project is underway. The public can get on a list to receive updates on the project by contacting the Public Works Department.

B. At its meeting of 6/17/14 Council directed staff to hire an Urban Forest Manager on a contract bases and also hire a Park Services Coordinator.

C. Senior Park Ranger Romain reported that as of 6/19/14 there are three City of Chico employee lifeguards, supplemented by four California Conservation Core lifeguards. These four are temporary until the City can fill those positions with City employees. The goal is to have a total of 12-13 lifeguards, allowing a six day-a-week schedule.

- D. Efseaff reported on volunteers helping with the removal of Arundo along Little Chico Creek. There are plans for a more aggressive approach to Ailanthus within our City greenways.
- E. Efseaff referred to a picture of a large Eastern Sycamore on Esplanade with roots that are causing the sidewalk to lift. They will be working with Planning staff in determining other options such as cutting the curb and expanding the planting area or possibly even retiring a parking space to allow a healthy tree to continue to grow. This would be part of the sidewalk improvement program.
- F. Efseaff reported on the concerns of Ranger safety in the field. They are looking at rangers carrying Tasers. A policy will likely go forward to Council for review but wanted to ask the Commission for any comments related to this.

Emmerich wanted to note just how import the Volunteer Coordinator position is. Efseaff stated that Council has approved the request to hire that position.

## 2 ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m. to the next regular meeting on July 28, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved: \_\_/\_\_/\_\_

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC



CITY OF CHICO  
BIDWELL PARK AND  
PLAYGROUND COMMISSION

***NOTICE OF CANCELLATION OF MEETING***

The July 28, 2014 meeting of the Bidwell Park and Playground Commission has been cancelled.

The next regular meeting of the Commission is scheduled for Monday, August 25, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber at 421 Main Street, Chico unless otherwise noticed.

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**

Minutes of  
August 25, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Lisa Emmerich  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Mark Herrera  
Janine Rood

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager) and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

Item 2.3 was removed from the Consent Agenda for further discussion by Commissioner Moravec.

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 6/30/14.

**2.2. Love on the Rocks – 5K/10K Run at Five Mile and Upper Bidwell Park (9/6/14)**

Love on the Rocks is a team challenge run in which there will be a minister present to renew vows. The event will use the Five Mile Picnic Area and run out and back on the North Rim Trail with use of the pedestrian bridge on the return. **Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*

**2.4. Permit Application for Earthdance – Music Festival in Cedar Grove (9/21/14)**

Eartha Shanti requests a permit to host the Chico Earthdance, an international music festival for peace, proposed for Cedar Grove. This is the 8<sup>th</sup> year for the event. The application requires BPPC consideration because the event will exceed 10 hours. **Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*

**2.5. Permit Application for the Bidwell Bump – Mountain Bike Race in Middle and Upper Bidwell Park (9/13/14)**

Katherine Ketterer is requesting a permit to host a mountain bike race in Middle and Upper Park. The event requires BPPC consideration as the race will use trails in Bidwell Park that are not considered intensive use areas. **Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*



**2.6. Permit Application for the Annual Z-Rock Pumpkin Head – Contest in City Plaza (10/25/14)**

Results Radio LLC is requesting a permit to hold its annual Pumpkin Head contest in City Plaza. This is the 18<sup>th</sup> year for this event, the second year in City Plaza. The event requires BPPC consideration as the reservation is for more than 10 hours in length. **Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*

**MOTION:** Approve items 2.1, 2.2, 2.4, 2.5 and 2.6 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** Herrera and Rood.

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT –** Item 2.3 was removed by Commissioner Moravec.

**2.3. Permit Application for the Almond Bowl – 5K, ½ and Full Marathon in Lower, Middle and Upper Bidwell Park (9/13/14).**

Chico Running Club requested a permit to host a run in Lower, Middle and Upper Park. This is the 40<sup>th</sup> year for the event. The event requires BPPC consideration as the run will use trails in Bidwell Park that are not considered intensive use areas. **Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*

Commissioner Moravec pulled this item to clarify the date of the event. The date of the Almond Bowl was misstated in the agenda but accurate in the staff report which is 11/2/14.

**MOTION:** Approve item 2.3 of the consent agenda with an event date of 11/2/14. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** Herrera and Rood.

**3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None.**

**4. REGULAR AGENDA**

**4.1. Acceptance of Donation for Oak Planting Program**

The Butte Environmental Council (BEC) was recently awarded a grant from the California Wildlife Association and is proposing an oak planting project in Upper and Middle Bidwell Park. The four year project will plant oaks, engage citizens, develop education material, and protect previously planted oaks. Plantings will be restricted to developed or impacted areas of the park. While the City Charter authorized the BPPC to accept in-kind donations (Section 1006.2), Staff believes that this project warranted the Commission's consideration. **Recommendation:** *Approval of project with conditions.*

Efseaff provided an overview of the opportunity presented by BEC. BEC has put together an oak planting program for regeneration purposes and an education plan.

Staff reviewed the program and suggested looking at impacted areas that would match up with the Bidwell Park Master Management Plan. They suggested looking at parking areas which could benefit from shade. They also suggested working with other partners such as Bidwell Golf Course and the Disc Golf Course

The applicant was receptive and thought it best to bring it before the Commission. Brentwood asked about the species of oaks that would be planted. Efseaff stated they only wanted to use Bidwell Park as a seed source and would plant appropriately to the location. The focus on the parking areas would most likely be the Blue Oaks.

Efseaff stated staff would report back to the Commission as details evolve.

Moravec asked about conditions outlined in 5A – work with at least one other park lessee on a planting program.

Efseaff stated that since it is not just to put trees in the park but also an education program, staff felt it would be a great opportunity to work with Chico Equestrians or the Bidwell Park Municipal Golf Course. It would be an opportunity to work with and train them as to how to take care of the tree and create some long term efforts.

Ober feels the program is fantastic and he fully supports it.

Nani Teves (BEC) emphasized that half the point of the project is trees in the ground to restore oak woodlands and the other half is to engage park users in the park's restoration.

Public comments on this item

None.

**MOTION:** To approve the Acceptance of the donation of an Oak Planting Program. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood **SECOND:** Richard Ober **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Herrera, Rood).

**4.2. Acceptance of the Caper Acres Renovation Plan**

Due to aging infrastructure, the BPPC included the renovation of Caper Acres in its 2013-2014 Work Plan. The BPPC Natural Resource Committee (NRC) hosted four public meetings to allow opportunities for public input on the project. At the July 10, 2014 meeting the NRC provided input on the draft designs and directed staff to bring forward a completed plan to the full BPPC for consideration. The Consultant, Melton Design Group, and Staff presented a refined design, a list of project priorities and costs, and other information from the Master Caper Acres Renovation Plan. **Recommendation:** *Accept the plan and recommend Council adoption.*

Efseaff provided an overview of the project. With Caper Acres declining over the years, plans are moving forward for a renovation. All needs were considered as well as an opportunity for the public to provide input. A series of meetings were held through the Natural Resources Committee which included a field visit. The footprint of Caper Acres would not change.

Funding will be sought from the community. This also provides the City with opportunities for some grant funding. There are a number of Master Plan goals included in order to assist the Commission with the decision making. This fits well with the overall Master Plan goals.

The next step would be to receive input from the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board (ARHPB), and look at compliance requirements. It will have to go through screening for environmental compliance (CEQA). Because it is an existing footprint, it doesn't change its function and would likely receive a categorical exemption once it reaches the Council level.

It is listed as one of the featured fundraising items on the Annie B's campaign through the North Valley Community Foundation.

Greg Melton presented the highlights of the Caper Acres Renovation Plan.

The project is anticipated to cost \$3.1 million dollars. The pace of community fundraising will determine the pace of the improvements to the site.

The high priority items are those that need to be done sooner rather than later.

Moravec stated that while the conceptual planning is done, the financial piece is not. Your first chance is your best chance to make a first impression. A strong strategy needs to be in place before funds are solicited. He would like to hear how the strategy will be developed.

Efseaff recommended moving forward on a specific project as monies become available.  
Moravec – will be have a standing committee to plan the fundraising campaign?

Ober stressed his eagerness for the full commission to stay involved, even if it means creating another ad hoc committee.

Efseaff – when the Park Services Coordinator position is filled, fundraising will be a major task for that person. The strategy will be shared with the whole commission when it is developed.

Emmerich would like to invite the public in on this project and stressed the importance of collaboration.

Plans will be posted on the City's website.

#### Public Comments on this item

Bill Mash addressed the Commission on this item. He asked about the funding source, the impact of monthly maintenance costs and the idea of vandalism.

**MOTION:** To accept the Caper Acres Renovation Plan as presented, and forward it on to the Council for final adoption. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen

A friendly amendment was made by Lisa Emmerich to accept the Caper Acres Renovation Plan as presented, forward it on to the ARHPB for comments and barring any major renovations that would require any subsequent reevaluation by the commission, it would be forwarded to the Council for final adoption. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 5 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Herrera, Rood).

### **4.3. Adopt Programmatic Tree Removal Permit**

As per BPPC direction, the Tree Committee developed the criteria for a Programmatic Permit program to help expedite requests to remove undesirable trees. The program essentially provides preapproval for tree removal permits that meet certain criteria. All other requests (or requests that Staff does not support) would still come before the BPPC for consideration. Trees removed under this program will be reported to the BPPC and the program is subject to annual revisions by the BPPC. The removals and replanting will be completed at the applicant's expense. **Recommendation:** *Direct staff to complete the AP&P and provide authority for eligible permits.*

Efseaff offered that this issue has been working through the Tree Committee. There have been a lot of tree issues recently, including many branches and larger limbs falling. We have learned that there are better tree choices for Chico than many of what we currently have.

There are certain classes of trees where it makes sense to have them streamlined. Permit issues are invasive roots, sidewalk lifting, dropping branches, and damaging infrastructure. This programmatic approach would provide pre-approval for certain species of trees. There is a list of species the Tree Committee has gone through.

Landowners would be encouraged to remove the trees at their own expense and replace them with a tree on the approved list for that location.

The tree Committee wanted to make sure the full Commission was aware of what trees as they were removed. An Administrative Procedure and Policy has been drafted outlining the conditions and steps involved.

Benefits to city would be to remove non-native invasive plants, woody trees, list of trees explicitly excluded from the tree preservation code and trees that are incompatible as street trees based on local knowledge.

#### Commission comments

Brentwood wanted clarification and consistency in the AP&P when referring to the Public Works Director or Designee.

Ober felt the key issues have been captured in the AP&P but wanted to clarify that they weren't just expediting the removal process, but also mandating the replacement.

Emmerich added that the permit requires that the replacement tree that is put in comes from a list of approved trees that meets the City's specifications. These expedited removal applications will come back to the Commission on a quarterly (at a minimum) basis so as to evaluate how the process is working. If it does not appear the process is working, then it may be returned to the Commission to evaluate on a case by case basis.

Efseaff noted that there are a large of number of species that are not on the list that would go through the regular Bidwell Park and Playground process and are untouched by this AP&P.

#### Public Comments on this item

Charles Withuhn - pleased this is going forward but doesn't remember this going through the Tree Committee. He disagrees with some of the trees on the list.

Bill Mash – concerned about the pre and post inspection process. Asked if there would be a public notice posted.

Ober wanted to clarify that this isn't the list of trees that people can go out and cut down.

Efseaff echoed that there would be considerable staff oversight involved.

Bill Mash asked if this should be called a problematic program rather than a programmatic program.

Efseaff clarified that our code does not speak to a programmatic approach. The intent is for this to apply to a particular category of trees. This program allows the Commission to give staff the ability to run through a process for a certain group of trees that meets certain conditions.

Woody Elliott asked who follows up to see if a tree is removed, that the process is followed.

**MOTION:** That the BPPC direct staff to complete the AP&P and provide authority for eligible permits with the explicit instruction that's written into the policy that this would come to us on at least a quarterly basis for the Commission's review of the program. **MADE BY:** Lisa Emmerich  
**SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Traulsen).  
**NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** (Herrera, Rood).

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Charles Withuhn – would like some way to ensure the life of any tree planted.

## 6. REPORTS

### 6.1 Natural Resources Committee (NRC) – Mary Brentwood

The Committee discussed a revision of the Bidwell Park Natural Resources Management and Trail Plan, specifically for lower Bidwell Park, which is a work in progress. The next step is to organize it at the next NRC meeting.

### 6.2. Parks and Street Trees Division Report – Park & Natural Resource Manager Efsseff

- A. The Bidwell Park Birthday Bash will potentially include a golf tournament, run in the park and a concert at next year's 110<sup>th</sup> celebration.
- B. Steve Carson has written a nice article describing the Hooked on Fishing event in Bidwell Park.
- C. The Lindo Channel bike path bridge has received some improvements.
- D. Lighting at One Mile is being converted to LED and should improve energy consumption and quality of light. The LED lights have a much longer life span.
- E. Rangers have been working with the Police Dept. on encampment cleanups in the parks and greenways.
- F. Chico Velo is moving forward with a functional art piece at One Mile. Details will come before the Commission.
- G. The Five Mile well water level has dropped and is not functioning. Restrooms will reopen when the repair work is complete.
- H. There has been another saving of a life at One Mile.
- I. With water levels so low, the opportunity exists to compile lists of concrete repairs and infrastructure replacement. The proposed repairs could become part of the work plan objectives.
- J. Looking into having some programming at City Plaza to draw visitors to the plaza on lunch hours, etc.

Brentwood asked about the status on the two hires; the Urban Forest Manager and the Park Services Coordinator. Efsseff stated the Park Services Coordinator position is being discussed by the Union and the Urban Forest Manager language is being reviewed by the City Attorney on how that position would be managed.

## 2 ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m. to the next regular meeting on September 29, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved: \_\_/\_\_/\_\_

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**  
Minutes of  
September 29, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood

**Commissioners absent:**

Mary Brentwood  
Drew Traulsen

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager) Shane Romain (Senior Park Ranger) and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**Action:** Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 8/25/14.

**2.2. Permit for Vacation Bible Experience (6/22 - 6/26/14)**

Bidwell Presbyterian Church desires to reserve Children's Playground for a five day youth day camp. The applicant has reserved this area for the event for several years without incident. This event requires BPPC consideration as the request is reserving an area for multiple days.

**Recommendation:** *Approve permit with conditions.*

**2.3. Permit Application for Gobble Wobble 5K – 10K Fun Run (11/8/14)**

The CSU Chico Department of Kinesiology requests a permit to host a race that starts behind the Rod and Gun Club in Middle Park and extends into Upper Park. This permit requires BPPC consideration as it is not an intensive use area. This is the 14<sup>th</sup> year of the event.

**Recommendation:** *Conditional approval of permit.*

**MOTION:** Approve items 2.1, 2.2 and 2.3 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober  
**SECOND:** Janine Rood **AYES:** 5 (Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Rood). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 2 (Brentwood and Traulsen).

**3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None.**

#### 4. REGULAR AGENDA

##### 4.1. Consideration of Revision to Chico Municipal Code 12R

While working with the Butte County District Attorney's office, staff discovered a section of Chico Municipal Code Title 12R that would benefit from some clarification. Staff recommends that 12R.02.040 CMC be amended to specifically state that rangers have a duty to preserve the peace within the parks, rather than the current language that only implies this authority. A copy of the draft resolution is attached. **Recommendation:** *Direct staff to forward a resolution amending CMC 12R.02.040 to Council for final consideration.*

Efseaff advised that the City Attorney has reviewed and approved the proposed language change. This change to the code would strengthen and clarify a Ranger's authority to keep the peace.

Ober questioned the use of the word "however". Efseaff offered to have the City Attorney review it.

Chair Emmerich asked Romain to explain how this change in the code would benefit the rangers.

Romain clarified that this change in the code would clarify their authority. Currently, the authority is implied. From time to time, the rangers do come up against individuals challenging their authority. This change would allow the City code to be consistent with State code.

Public comments on this item - None.

**MOTION:** To direct staff to complete a draft resolution to adopt the revisions to CMC 12R.02.040 and forward to Council for final approval. Any substantive changes should be brought back to the BPPC for consideration. Motion **MADE BY:** Jim Moravac **SECOND:** Richard Ober **AYES:** 5 (Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Rood). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 2 (Brentwood and Traulsen).

##### 4.2 Permit to Remove and Replant Trees (Mission Santa Fe Circle)

Property owners within the Chico Maintenance District (CMD) submitted a request to remove 25 Yarwood Sycamore trees within the City right-of-way and replant with an appropriate species. The homeowner's association noted longstanding concerns associated with 1) sidewalk and irrigation system damage; and 2) regular falling branches. Although the reasons for the request align with the recently adopted "Programmatic Tree Removal Permit", the scope of the request (25 trees) is beyond the intent of the program and requires BPPC consideration. Major costs will be paid from CMD funds (not the City's General Fund). **Recommendation:** *Approval of the permit.*

Efseaff provided the background on this item. The request is from the property owners comprising the Mission Santa Fe Maintenance District. There have been some long-standing concerns with the Yarwood Sycamore trees that were planted in 2000. They are asking for 25 trees to be removed.

While the programmatic tree removal was recently adopted and fits the reasons for removal, this issue is being brought before the Commission because the quantity (25) of trees requesting to be removed is far beyond the scope of which the programmatic program is intended for.

Within seven years of the trees being planted, service requests were beginning to come in for structural pruning because they were growing too fast. Roughly 1/3 of the trees are impacting sidewalks. This is an ongoing cost to the City with serious concerns to the landowners.

Staff did look at the potential of phasing this in. This would allow new trees to reach a sufficient size before cutting down others. The CMD does have adequate funds available to cover the costs of removing all 25 trees, repairing the sprinkler system and replanting with other more appropriate species of trees. From this standpoint, staff felt that the removal at all trees at one time, with repairs to sidewalks and irrigation would be best.

### Comments from the Commission

Emmerich asked if trees were to be taken out all at once, what does staff anticipate what will transpire, what the estimated costs are and who would cover it.

Efseaff stated that there would be a per-tree cost associated and each tree would be replanted. The replacement trees have not been determined. There are some mild disease issues which would be rectified with the removal. Staff would like to get the trees in the ground by this fall. Most of the costs would be borne by the CMD. The sidewalk repair work would be split with the City.

Emmerich asked about a timeframe as to when the trees will be back in.

Efseaff stated that the CMD is a City fund, administered by the City. There should be no delay in the timeline.

Ober emphasized that there needs to be funds available for replanting purposes.

Efseaff stated that while the maintenance costs are covered by the maintenance district funds, any callout for service requests are charged to the City's general fund. Staff feels there are better options available than sticking with the current trees. The homeowners feel there are health issues associated with these trees.

Debra Horton from the HOA spoke. She says there are already three people known to have fallen due to the tree issues. She feels that pruning and trimming the trees is not taking care of the issues. She feels that if the project is done in phases, then every time a phase is tackled, that means repairs again to the watering system as well as the groundcover. Feels it doesn't make sense to keep maintaining the trees when we all know they will be cut down. The sooner they are in, the sooner they will grow.

Ober asked who would be leading the selection process. Staff will use a right tree, right place approach depending on infrastructure and site specific conditions. Efseaff replied that City staff would consult with the landowners on the replacement trees, and that the intent is to plant the trees this fall. Horton emphasized that the homeowners would definitely like to be included in the selection process.

### Public Comments on this item

Mark Stemen (BEC) – asked about the status of the Urban Forest Management Plan.

Chair Emmerich closed the public comment period.

Herrera spoke about the Urban Forest and how the Commissioners' responsibility is to preserve and enhance the park as well as the urban forest. There are tools necessary to do this, one of which is the Urban Forester. Without that tool, the level of service to the community and our urban forest is extremely constrained. The urban forest is being neglected. It is his highest recommendation that the Commission suspend any discussion regarding the urban forest until the role of Urban Forester is filled.

**MOTION:** To table any urban forest discussion, eminent danger aside, until an Urban Forester is on the City staff. **MADE BY:** Mark Herrera **SECOND:** Ober **AYES:** 1 (Herrera). **NOES:** **ABSENT:**

Ober seconded the motion for the sole purpose of discussion. Felt the larger issues were certainly worth discussing.

Efseaff offered that this motion goes counter to what Council had previously directed which was to



contract out the role of the Urban Forester. The Commission needs to vote on the item before us tonight.

Moravec agreed but felt Commissioner Herrera's comments needed to be discussed.

Emmerich asked Herrera to speak to the public safety issue before us.

Herrera feels the safety issues are absolutely paramount to discuss but, also feels the Urban Forester discussion needs to take place before we move forward.

Ober asked if it was the intent of the motion to not have discussions like this tonight.

Herrera responded affirmative, with eminent danger aside.

Efseaff stated that tonight there needs to be either an approval or a denial.

Moravec feels Herrera's motion is inappropriate, however, he feels there definitely is a situation that needs to be remedied. These tree decisions were made by past City of Chico staff. The space these trees were planted in is inadequate.

Herrera wanted to be clear he is not placing blame but simply providing an opportunity to make a change. He, could not, in good conscience, vote on this.

Rood asked Herrera if his motion was saying nothing should be done until we have the position filled. Herrera confirmed this.

Rood asked Efseaff if he knew how many trees with these issues there were City wide. Efseaff stated he could get this information.

Chair Emmerich suggested that the Commission agendaize the discussion of the Urban Forest Plan for the next meeting. With it being properly noticed, it would allow for this discussion to take place in a more focused way.

Commissioner Herrera's motion was entertained again.

**MOTION:** To table any urban forest discussion, eminent danger aside, until an Urban Forester is on the City staff. **MADE BY:** Mark Herrera **SECOND:** Ober **AYES:** 1 (Herrera). **NOES:** 4 (Emmerich, Moravec, Ober and Rood) **ABSENT:** 2 (Brentwood and Traulsen).

The motion by Herrera failed (1-4-2)

Commissioner Herrera stated he could not in good conscience continue this discussion without an Urban Forester on board. He left the meeting.

**MOTION:** To approve the permit as outlined in the staff report that would allow for the removal of the sycamore trees and staff to supervise the replanting of those trees with funds from the CMD. **Motion MADE BY:** Jim Moravac **SECOND:** Janine Rood **AYES:** 4 (Emmerich, Moravec, Ober, and Rood). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 3 (Brentwood, Herrera and Traulsen).

A discussion was had about how a Commissioner goes about getting an item on the agenda.

## 5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Mark Stemen addressed the Commission about the Urban Forest Management Plan and its delay. That is the plan that guides many other actions. Landscape architects look at the plan before planting. He emphasized the need for the Plan.

## 6. REPORTS

**6.1. Sycamore Pool Repair** – Efseaff reported that the pool is deteriorating. Some items needing attention are: repair of the eroded sump area, a vault, replacement of ladders, repair of lifeguard chairs, repair of sidewalk, repair of a section of a concrete wall, and pot holes at the bottom of the pool. With the current low water levels, it is a good time to do the work. It would take about two weeks to complete. Staff will likely seek a supplement appropriation of \$35,000 for the repairs. Commissioners indicated concern about the state of the pool and interest in the repairs moving forward.

**6.2. Parks and Street Trees Division Report** – Efseaff reported the following:

- a. The 109<sup>th</sup> Bidwell Bash event was a success.
- b. Staff met with Cal Trans, BCAG regarding the Hwy 99 viaduct park related concerns. Remedies should be in place in the next few weeks.
- c. The Five-Mile well that went dry is now back and functioning.
- d. There was an extensive encampment found in Upper Park and taken down.
- e. There is a new sign for greenways outlining park rules.
- f. A total of 40,000 lbs. of materials have been cleared at the creek cleanups held this year with BEC.
- g. The Park Services Coordinator position is currently open.
- h. A sampling program has been set up for staff to study the impact of the drought on trees.
- i. BEC and the Native Plants Society are teaming up to hold joint creek cleanup projects on Oct. 29th, Nov. 8th and Nov. 22nd. Information will be available on the City website.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourn to the next regular meeting on October 27, 2014 at 8:18 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved:    /    /   .

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

T:\\_Old drive to be deleted July 2015\Admin\BPPC\BPPC\_Meetings\2014\14\_0929\BPPC\_Minutes\_14\_0929.docx  
5/21/2015

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**  
Minutes of  
October 27, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Emmerich called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Mary Brentwood  
Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Janine Rood

**Staff present:** Ruben Martinez (Public Works Director), Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager) and Nancy Kelly (Administrative Assistant).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

Items 2.1 and 2.2 were pulled from the consent agenda.

**2.3 Permit for Frost or Fog 10 Mile, ¼ Marathon, and 5K Run (1/25/15)**

Under the Sun Events has requested a permit to host a race that starts in Middle Park and extends into Upper Park on Saturday, January 25, 2015. In addition to the 5K and ¼ marathon, the applicant has added a 10 mile race to the event. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

**MOTION:** Approve items 2.3 of the consent agenda as submitted. **MADE BY:** Jim Moravec **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT**

**2.1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

Action: Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 9/29/14.

Chair Emmerich pulled this item from the consent agenda to seek clarification as to why the previously provided minutes were revised. Staff provided clarification.

**MOTION:** Approve the minutes of the BPPC meeting held on 9/29/14 as submitted. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Jim Moravec **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

**2.2. Permit for AMain/Cyclesport Mountain Bike Demonstration (11/08/14).**

AMain/Cyclesport (applicant) has applied for a permit to provide a demonstration with Pivot Cycles to provide bikes for people to test ride. No sales will be made on site. The applicant

has requested use of parking lot B (Easter Cross) and will set up a pop-up tent and park a trailer. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

Commissioner Ober pulled this item from the consent agenda. He was requesting additional information from staff. He was questioning the possibility that that this was a for-profit entity using the park for purposes that seem to be primarily to promote their business at minimal to no cost.

Efseaff provided an overview of this event. He explained that it is a demo day, with no on-site sales taking place. He also pointed out that the Master Management Plan does not have any restrictions for this type of use.

The applicant, Mike Peevy was in attendance at the meeting and answered questions from the Commission.

**MOTION:** Approve a permit for Frost or Fog 10 Mile, ¼ Marathon, and 5K Run on (1/24/15) as recommended by staff. **MADE BY:** Drew Traulsen **SECOND:** Mary Brentwood **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

### 3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – None.

## 4. REGULAR AGENDA

### 4.1. Permit for Rim to Rim Trail Run (6/6/15)

The applicant wishes to host Chico's first ultra-marathon event, featuring a 50 mile distance option. This race will take place on the trails of Middle and Upper Bidwell Park. The revised application avoids the south side of Upper Park except for a creek crossing and use of 10 Mile House Road. The start and finish of the race will be at 5 Mile Picnic Area. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

Efseaff stated that with this being the first 50 mile distance race for Bidwell Park staff worked with the applicant on a revised course route as well as safety considerations and logistics. The applicant was very responsive to the changes and was in attendance at the meeting.

#### Comments from the Commission:

Commissioner Brentwood asked about condition no. 5 regarding vehicle access for aid stations. She asked if there would be aid stations and Efseaff confirmed there would be that could be accessed by bike or foot.

Brentwood then asked about emergency vehicles accessing the park. Efseaff clarified that ranger and emergency vehicles do have access.

Commissioner Ober asked if they would be using the south rim trail. The applicant, Jason Donnell, was in attendance so clarified that the majority of the race will take place on the north side and on the south side.

Ober asked about crossing the creek and any high water level issues. Efseaff stated that for other events the creek crossing was a mandatory walk area which would minimize the impacts.

Ober asked if there would be a cutoff time for the 50 mile run. It was confirmed by the applicant that it would finish prior to sunset.

#### Comments from the Public – None.

**MOTION:** To approve the permit for rim to rim trail run on 6/6/15. Motion **MADE BY:** Mark Herrera **SECOND:** Drew Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen).

NOES: 0 ABSENT: 1 (Rood).

#### 4.2 Appeal of Tree Removal Permit Denial (2780 Camden Court)

On September 5, 2014, staff received an application for a permit to remove a City of Chico street tree. Chief complaints relate to nuisance from bugs and surface roots. The landowner wishes to remove and replace the tree at his own expense. Staff reviewed the request on the Trident maple (*Acer buergerianum*), a small shade tree, and on September 5, 2014 staff denied the application as the tree is in excellent condition. The applicant submitted an appeal letter (received on September 1, 2014). The applicant has requested that the appeal be moved to the October meeting.

Efseaff provided the overview on this item. The main reasons cited from the applicant to remove the tree were exposed roots and a nuisance from bugs. Staff investigated the site and the history of the tree and found that while there were box elder beetles present, the tree could be treated and there was no evidence of any impact on the hardscape area. Given the condition of the tree and the lack of damage to infrastructure, staff denied the approval of the permit. Per the Chico Municipal Code, the applicant is appealing this to the Commission.

##### Comments from the Commission

Commissioner Brentwood asked if the bugs could potentially spread to other trees. Efseaff stated that the bugs are pretty particular to maples are considered a nuisance and not a pest.

Commissioner Ober asked if maples in general tend to be prone to this type of bug. Efseaff confirmed this and added that it is periodic. Ober asked if staff knew how many of these trees were in inventory and if this problem has been observed in other trees around town. Efseaff offered cleaning up leaf litter can minimize the impact of bugs. They are not harmful to the trees. They are common trees in Chico and it is on the tree list for the area.

The applicant was not in attendance at the meeting.

##### Comments from the Public:

Charles Withuhn spoke in favor of denying the appeal.

**MOTION:** To deny the appeal. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober. **SECOND:** Jim Moravec **AYES:** 5 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Ober, Moravec and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSTENTIONS:** 1 (Herrera) **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

#### 4.3 Appeal of Tree Pruning Denial (520 West 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue)

On September 22, 2014, staff received an application to prune (crown reduction) of a City of Chico street tree (a 20' DBH English Walnut (*Juglans regia*) by 25%. On September 24, 2014, staff rejected the application as the extensive pruning does not meet City (ANSI/ISA) standards. The applicant submitted an appeal letter (received on September 29, 2014) citing concerns of the walnuts and tripping hazard, to the BPPC. Staff would consider a 10% crown reduction using ANSI standards. **Recommendation:** *Deny the appeal and permit.*

Efseaff reported that the initial request was for removal which was denied. It was recommended that a 10% reduction would be acceptable. Then, the application came back with a 25% reduction request; however, ANSI standards do not support a 25% reduction for any tree within the City.

The homeowner is citing the reasons for the request as: dropping of limbs, tripping hazard associated with the dropping of walnuts and blocking of solar panels.

Ober asked if a 10% reduction is even acceptable to the homeowner and if so, if that would result in pruning every few years?

The applicant, Franklin Winter was in attendance to answer any questions.

### Comments from the Public:

Charles Withuhn stated he met with the homeowner and his opinion is that the tree hasn't been pruned in probably 20 years. While he empathized with the homeowner, he was unsure as to what would be the best option.

Robyn DeFalco, Butte Environmental Council, stated she would like to see a requirement of tree replacement mitigation guidelines.

**MOTION:** To deny the appeal and the permit and to encourage staff to discuss further options with the homeowner. **MADE BY:** Mary Brentwood. **SECOND:** Richard Ober **AYES:** 5 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSTENTIONS:** 1 (Herrera) **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

## **5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR**

Charles Withuhn expressed his disappointment and frustration in the frequency of cancellation of Tree Committee meetings. He is sorry staff is overworked and offered his assistance.

## **6. REPORTS**

### **6.1. Parks and Street Trees Division Report – Efseaff reported the following:**

- a. The Annie B's Community fundraiser drive is now closed and over \$8,000 has been raised.
- b. Discussions regarding the fundraising plans for the Caper Acres campaign has begun.
- c. Staff met with Cal Trans and discussed the improvements to the Hwy 99 viaduct area.
- d. The Park Services Coordinator position is closed and over 53 qualified applicants have applied.
- e. The tree contracts and approach will be reported on next month.
- f. Council has approved the funding for the Sycamore Pool improvements. The pool will be drained next week and work will begin.
- g. Revisions to Title 12R, the Caper Acres Renovation Plan and the Sycamore tree removal appeal from Mission Santa Fe will be coming before Council at their next meeting.
- h. The Parks Department has a new intern who will assist staff with in variety of areas and weekly events.
- i. The recycling can installation program is now complete.
- j. The 5 mile well is now working again and functioning well.
- k. Volunteer cleanup crews have worked with the Butte Environmental Council and over 40,000 pounds of debris have been removed from the parks and greenways.
- l. An herbicide application for Arundo has been completed from Bruce Road to the pedestrian bridge near Hwy 99 and Forest Avenue. Positive results are already being seen.
- m. There is a long list of sponsors and volunteers that have contributed to the Birthday Bash.
- n. Park Watch volunteers will be honored at the next BPPC meeting.
- o. The new process for the upcoming placement of new Commissioners was discussed.

### **6.2. Commissioner Ober's Request that the BPPC agendize 1) Status of Urban Forester role and 2) Urban Forest Management Plan – Ober requested these items to be agendized and discussed at the next meeting with the full Commission.**

Herrera stated he was in support of agendizing these two items. Emmerich supported it as well. Efseaff stated that while the Urban Forest Management Plan is on the Commission's workplan, personnel-related issues are not.

Public Works Director Martinez offered to have a report with information on the Urban Forester contract and what the priorities are going to be. Ober asked that it be agendized as an action item and not just a report.

**MOTION:** That the Commission agendaize the status of the Urban Forester role, duties, priorities, and timeline for work to be assigned as a discussion item at the November Commission meeting or at the earliest possible convenience. **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Mark Herrera **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

**MOTION:** That the Commission agendaize the Urban Forest Management Plan for discussion and for action to either approve or not approve at the November meeting or earliest possible opportunity. Motion **MADE BY:** Richard Ober **SECOND:** Mark Herrera **AYES:** 6 (Brentwood, Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Rood).

- 6.3. Commission Chair Emmerich's Request to Share a Correspondence on a Bidwell Park Meeting – Emmerich reported she was contacted by Woody Elliott and John Merz about the possibility of creating a meeting to discuss Bidwell Park natural and cultural resource priorities needs, etc. They would like to develop a Bidwell Park discussion summit which would include all members of the community and a variety of constituent groups to discuss the issues. Emmerich was bringing it forward to the Commission as an informational item. Mr. Elliott or Mr. Merz were not in attendance at the meeting and no other information was provided.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 9:13 p.m. to the next regular meeting on November 24, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved:    /    /   .

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC

T:\\_Old drive to be deleted July 2015\Admin\BPPC\BPPC\_Meetings\2014\14\_1027\BPPC\_Minutes\_14\_1027.docx

**CITY OF CHICO**  
**BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION (BPPC)**  
Minutes of  
November 24, 2014 Regular Meeting

**1. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

**1.1. Call to Order**

Chair Ober called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

**1.2. Roll Call**

**Commissioners present:**

Lisa Emmerich  
Mark Herrera  
Jim Moravec  
Richard Ober  
Janine Rood  
Drew Traulsen

**Commissioners absent:**

Mary Brentwood

**Staff present:** Dan Efseaff (Park and Natural Resource Manager), Ruben Martinez (Public Works Director) and Shane Romain (Senior Park Ranger).

**1.3. Special Recognition:** Recognition was given to the following Park Watch Members: Linda Gilmore (May), Elaina McReynolds (June), Mike Priemsburger (July), Sharon Stern and Edgar Ovalle (August), Carla Moreno (October) and Jean Andrews (November).

**2. CONSENT AGENDA**

Item 2.1 was pulled from the consent agenda.

**2.2. Permit to Install a Chanukah Menorah at City Plaza (12/16/14 to 12/24/14)**

The Chabad Jewish Center has requested to install a Menorah on the City Plaza restroom and hold a lighting celebration (12/16/14). As with last year's installation, the applicant will need to have their own contractor install the Menorah with direction from Park staff. This is the 9<sup>th</sup> year of the multiple day event and requires BPPC consideration. **Recommendation:** *Approval of permit with conditions.*

**2.3. Permit for Christmas Tree Lighting Ceremony at City Plaza (12/5/14\*).**

The Downtown Chico Business Association (DCBA) has requested a permit for a Tree Lighting Ceremony and installation of lights on a tree at City Plaza. Crowds will enjoy a musical program and participate in the countdown to light the tree. The tree will remain lighted until the end of December. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.* \* Incorrect date of 12/4/14 was previously provided.

**2.4. Permit for Heart and Sole 5K (3/21/15).**

Under the Sun Events and Enloe Medical Center have requested a permit to host a race that starts and ends at Chico Area Recreation Center. This starting point changes the Standard Course as entry into Bidwell Park will be at the 4th Street entrance and North 1 Mile Entrance at Vallombrosa Way. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

**2.5. Permit for Graduation picnic at Picnic Site #37 (5/16/15).**

The applicant has requested a permit to reserve picnic site #37 for a graduation picnic with family. This picnic site is not an area allowed for reservations without BPPC approval. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*



**2.6. Permit for the Walk to End Alzheimer's (10/10/15).**

The Alzheimer's Association has requested a permit to host the Walk to End Alzheimer's, a stroll through Bidwell Park. The event includes information booths and family friendly activities. Applicant has requested to set up the day before, which requires BPPC consideration for a multi-day event. **Recommendation:** *Conditional approval.*

**MOTION:** Approve Items 2.2 – 2.6 as submitted. **MADE BY:** Herrera **SECOND:** Ober **AYES:** 6 (Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Brentwood).

**ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT**

**2.1 Approval of Meeting Minutes**

Action: Approve minutes of BPPC meeting held on 10/27/14.

Commissioner Moravec pulled this item from the consent agenda to clarify that the permit for AMain/Cyclesport Mountain Bike Demonstration (11/8/14) was approved by the Commission (6-0-1 (Rood absent). Also, on item 4.3, it should be corrected to read that "while ANSI standard do usually support a 25% reduction, staff felt that a reduction of 25% was too severe in this instance and could not support it."

**MOTION:** Approve the meeting minutes for the 10/27/14 meeting as revised and clarified in the above discussion. **MADE BY:** Moravec **SECOND:** Traulsen **AYES:** 6 (Emmerich, Herrera, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0 **ABSENT:** 1 (Brentwood).

**3. NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS – NONE**

**4. REGULAR AGENDA**

**4.1. Permit to Remove and Replace a Street Tree (520 West 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue)**

At the 10/27/14 meeting, the BPPC moved to deny an appeal and permit to prune a Chico street tree (a 20" DBH English Walnut (*Juglans regia*)) by 25% to allow for better solar panel exposure. The BPPC noted that they may be receptive to the removal of the tree with an adequate tree replacement alternative. The BPPC considered an alternative that included the removal of the one tree and the planting of three street trees as replacements. The removal and replanting will be conducted at landowner expense according to City standards. **Recommendation:** *If BPPC approves removal for the landowners' convenience, staff recommends replacement with three street trees.*

Efseaff provided the background information on this item. Staff is proposing replacing the one removed tree with three smaller ones. One tree would be planted on the landowner's property and the other two would be in the neighborhood area.

The landowner, Merle Winter, was in attendance at the meeting.

Comments from the Commission:

Commission Ober was interested in more specific details about the tree replacements—size, species, timing for when to plant the tree.

Ober asked if they can prescribe which trees replace it. Efseaff responded by saying yes of course but trees have to be approved and must be listed in the City's approved street trees list.

Ober stated he would like to be more prescriptive because so many requests come in. The Commission would like more input about removal and replacement. By default, the Commission is being put in the role of Urban Forester.

Efseaff explained it is often premature to determine the species and size of a replacement tree prior to the removal of the old tree. For instance, a utility box may be uncovered during the process which would preclude a certain size tree from being replanted. The intent of the pre-approved street tree list is to allow staff and the citizens to have an appropriate list to draw from. The purview of the BPPC is to approve the list for the City not individual planting sites.

Herrera offered that CMC 14.40.310 Maintenance - states that such work shall be subject to the control and direction of the Commission.

Commissioner Rood offered that she was ok with a selection of a tree off of the pre-approved tree list but she was concerned about the phrase "within a year" that it must be planted. She would like it to be sooner.

Ober wanted specifics—doesn't want to approve permit without species, potential size, etc. He wants further information on prescribing the trees, and the process for tree choosing.

Moravec too, wanted more information on size and species.

Ober suggested amending the code to make it more specific of the process of selecting replacement trees.

Rood ask about the process for selecting a replacement tree species and whether it is the landowner that proposes their tree choice from the list to the arborist or if it is the arborist that tells the landowner what it is going to be. Efseaff stated that the arborist makes the determination but that the landowner does have the opportunity for input.

#### Comments from the public

Mr. Winter, the landowner, stated the only place he can plant the new tree is on his property because the previous location contains sewage lines, old roots, and gravel that would obstruct the growth of a new tree. However, since it will be on his property, commission is concerned that now it will not be considered a City tree, which technically isn't "replacing it."

Charles Withuhn found citizens that would like street trees by their house, which provides options for the other two replacement tree location. He has four applications for trees. He also noted that only four trees on the pre-approved tree list are available in local nurseries.

Woody Elliot stated that an Urban Forester is needed as staff is overworked.

Mr. Winter, the landowner, stated his preference for a tree is an evergreen.

**MOTION:** Approve a permit for the removal of the tree at the landowner's convenience and replace it with three street trees within the period of one year. **MADE BY:** Moravec. **SECOND:** Rood. **AYES:** 5 (Emmerich, Moravec, Ober, Rood, and Traulsen). **NOES:** 0. **ABSTENTIONS:** 1 (Herrera). **ABSENT:** Brentwood.

#### **4.2. Consideration of Urban Forest Management Plan (UFMP)**

At the 10/27/14 meeting, Commissioner Ober requested to agendaize the consideration of the Urban Forest Management Plan (UFMP). The BPPC moved (6-0-1) to agendaize the UFMP for discussion and for action to either approve or not approve at the November meeting or earliest possible opportunity. At the 11/4/14 meeting of the Chico City Council, the Council imposed a 6-month deadline on the Public Works Department to contract out the functions of the Urban Forest Manager and complete the Urban Forest Management Plan. **Recommendation:** *Staff recommends that the BPPC consider and discuss the major unfinished items and refer to the UFMP back to the Tree Committee.*

Efseaff reported that a draft had been completed back in May 2013, but that the Tree Committee had not had a chance to review it before staffing cuts had taken place, where the Urban Forest Manager was lost as well as tree staff.

In 2014, the process was restarted again, and some time-sensitive items were identified that would need to be completed before the Plan could move forward before the full Commission. Staff is recommending the Commission consider the unfinished items and refer it back to the Tree Committee. One item of significant importance is Council's direction to contract with an Urban Forest Manager.

Martinez reported that the process to hire a Park Services Coordinator is close to being complete and that a draft scope of services and draft qualifications for the Urban Forest Manager is in the process and will be brought back to the Commission for review in December.

#### Comments from the Commission

Ober acknowledged the issues and frustrations of the Commission to accomplish their mission are a result of inadequate staffing levels, but he did not recall there being a specific deadline.

Martinez replied that the six month deadline was suggested by Council and Martinez agreed that six months was achievable.

Ober stated that the plan needs to be in place for removal of healthy trees and asked about the timing of hiring an Urban Forest Manager to review the Plan prior to accepting it.

Martinez said that while hiring an Urban Forest Manager will take some time, work can still be done on the document. Staff is trying to get an Urban Forest Manager on board ASAP but does not want to delay work on the Plan.

Efseaff spoke about the tree program. He said tasks can be grouped together and it will foster adaptive management which will be used as a tool kit.

Ober asked about contracting out this role. While it will save the City money because he or she will not be City Staff, he asked about how priorities would be met since it isn't yet known where this person will be or if the contract will turnover.

Martinez explained the Urban Forest Manager will be an individual, who is committed to our community, who signs a professional services agreement for multiple years. He or she would handle risk management issues, tree assessment reports and items that are ongoing and some not ongoing. This person will identify scope of work, share arborist duties and service request duties. He explained that while there will be a dollar amount on the contract, the contract will be guided by the demand for work. He will be working on a mutually agreeable renewal agreement. He is looking for a committed, long-term citizen and as well as a short term person to handle some service requests. He plans to have the prospective contracts and proposals done before January.

Herrera asked how the contracted person will be connected to the commission.

Martinez responded that this person would be in attendance at the meetings to report on tree activities, and as an effort to assist the Commission in making decisions.

Herrera stated that more tree committee meetings would be necessary so as to bring this person up to speed.

Herrera stated that while staff's recommendation is to return to the Tree Commission, he would like to see it return to the full Commission as the Tree Committee meetings don't take place as frequent as the Commission meetings do.

Rood asked when the Tree Committee meetings would start to take place more regularly. Efseaff responded that it would be tied to the contract of the Urban Forest Manager. He reminded the Commission that the Tree Committee meets on an as needed basis.

Ober echoed Herrera's preference to return to the full Commission.

## Comments from the Public

Charles Withuhn addressed the Commission in regards to the UFMP and advised that he will be providing input from local tree advocates to staff.

Herrera commented on the Management goals and objectives. He would like to incorporate more specific and stronger language when referring to the provisions of the Parking Lot Shade Ordinance.

Chair Emmerich directed staff to return to the Commission with the Urban Forest Management Plan to continue working through segments of the document and allow the public to provide input on.

No motion was needed.

## **5. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR**

Woody Elliot (Friends of Bidwell Park), discussed the idea of having a Bidwell Park Review. This would be a community-oriented, half-day discussion with the idea of generating future support for improvement of management and project installations in the park. The Commission was advised that no more than three Commissioners could participate, due to the Brown Act; therefore, the Commission is unable to be a co-sponsor of this group. Elliot said it would be a very informal process with an extremely broad based group, very inclusive, and have an open invitation.

## **6. REPORTS**

### 6.1. PG&E Tree-Removal and Trimming Work Along Utility Corridor on the Comanche Creek Property – Efseaff reported the following:

- a. Explained plan regarding native and not native annual trimmed trees. Some will be removed, some just trimmed within zone.
- b. Some trees will be replaced with shrubs.
- c. Keep larger Valley Oaks trimmed.
- d. Focus on direct pruning instead of topping.
- e. Work with community to get native plants in ground after cutting down trees.

### 6.2. 2014 Annual Report for the Wet Weather Plan – Efseaff reported the following:

- a. Reporting mode – review in five years
- b. A simpler method for closures and re-opening of trails is needed.
- c. Improve communication with public about informing the public when trails are closed (Facebook, hotline, website)
- d. Methods to show public when trails might be open and closed (expectations).
- e. Shane Romain added that there has been more signage and some improvement with compliance. Things are improving.

### 6.3. Parks and Street Trees Division Report - Dan Efseaff, Park and Natural Resource Manager Efseaff reported the following:

- a. Process for new workplan will begin in January.
- b. 12R revisions recommended by staff and BPPC has been adopted by Council.
- c. Sycamore pool is undergoing maintenance.
- d. The lights replaced with LED at One Mile have shown noticeable savings.
- e. Group enforcement of illegal encampments has been successful.
- f. Comanche Creek will be seeing considerable improvements in the near future.
- g. Volunteer and Donor Program is doing well.
- h. Biennial Recruitment is taking place soon.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 9:15 p.m. to the next regular meeting on December 15, 2014 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber of the Chico Municipal Center building (421 Main Street, Chico, California).

Date Approved:   /  /  

Prepared By:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nancy Kelly, Administrative Assistant

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Distribution: BPPC



# CITY OF CHICO BIDWELL PARK AND PLAYGROUND COMMISSION

## ***NOTICE OF CANCELLATION OF MEETING***

The December 15, 2014 meeting of the Bidwell Park and Playground Commission has been cancelled.

The next regular meeting of the Commission is scheduled for Monday, January 26, 2015 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber at 421 Main Street, Chico unless otherwise noticed.

Posted: December 5, 2014

Posting Location: Council Chamber Bldg, 421 Main Street

Prior to: 5:00 p.m.