Architectural Review and
Historic Preservation Board
Agenda Report

Meeting Date 5/1/2019

DATE: April 15, 2019

File: AR 18-24

TO: Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board

FROM: Shannon Costa, Associate Planner, (879-6807, shannon.costa@chicoca.gov)
Community Development Department

RE: Architectural Review 18-24 (Springfield Apartments D4) – Block D4, Meriam Park Subdivision S09-01, (APNs 002-180-174 and -173)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve of the project, subject to conditions.

Proposed Motion:

I move that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review 18-24 (Springfield Apartments), subject to the recommended conditions therein.

BACKGROUND

The applicant proposes to construct four new residential apartment buildings on Block D4 of the Meriam Park Tentative Subdivision Map (S 09-01). The site is designated Special Mixed Use on the City of Chico General Plan Land Use Diagram, zoned TND (Traditional Neighborhood Development), and designated TND "Neighborhood Center" (NC) by the approved Regulating Plan (see **Attachment A,** Location Map). The site is bounded by 'C' Avenue to the north, Alcott Avenue to the east, Springfield Drive to the south and 'B' Avenue to the east.

The proposed project includes three new three-story buildings and one clubhouse building with apartments and rooftop terrace. A total of 110 residential units is proposed. The site plan depicts the location of a new landscaping, dog park, trash enclosure, and clubhouse building with a pool, outdoor kitchen, lounge area, fitness room, rooftop terrace and yoga studio (see **Attachment B**, Overall Site Plan and **Attachment C**, Project Description).

TND REGULATIONS

The Traditional Neighborhood Development (TND) zone is designed to encourage positive design features of traditional neighborhoods. The purpose of the TND zones is to create compact neighborhoods with defined neighborhood centers, encourage a mixture of residential and non-residential land uses, promote a mixture of housing types and create a pedestrian friendly environment. TND land use designations provide for the allocation of building types, street types, development and land uses to the subzones. Designations are intended to accommodate a diverse mixture of building and housing types and land uses.

Designation

The NC designation is intended to provide for civic and public assembly uses, small-scale

commercial and mixed-use buildings, together with courtyard housing and other residential buildings at higher densities. This designation is intended to accommodate a variety of activities and services within easy walking distance from homes, including daily convenience shopping and personal service needs, and to provide opportunities for public gathering. Building heights may be a maximum of three stories.

Building Type

The building type standards determine the allowed building disposition and massing, frontage design, primary pedestrian access, vehicle access, parking and services, and open space and landscaping design requirements for each of the building types allowed in the TND zone. The building type for the project is Apartment Building. Apartment Building is a building type with a structure containing five or more dwellings that are accessed from a common entrance. Ground floor units may also be accessed directly from the sidewalk. An Apartment Building may be occupied by other than residential uses where allowed by the applicable TND designation. The proposed project is three residential buildings with a total of 110 residential units. Units would be smaller in size, ranging from 715 square feet (one bedroom, one bathroom) to 1,021 square feet (two bedrooms, two bathrooms). Access to each unit is provided by a common entryway corridor between the building masses.

Frontage Type

The frontage type for the proposed project is Porch and Fence. This frontage type requires that the building façade is set back from the front property line with an attached porch that may encroach into the setback. Ground-floor units for the project include private porches surrounded by a low privacy fence that defines the private space of the yard. The proposed buildings typically have a 12-foot setback from property lines, consistent with the Porch and Fence frontage type. Ground-floor residential units feature a private patios and third-floor awnings encroach over the setback line.

Architecture

The proposed development includes construction of four apartment buildings, each with similar architectural features. The proposed buildings feature a similar architectural style as the previously approved Tank District Apartments, located in Block H of Meriam Park. Buildings B3R, B and B3 are generally rectangular in shape, featuring central corridor entries providing access to the residential units. Building C, which contains ground-floor residential amenities and residential units above, would be smaller in size, with unique architectural elements from the larger residential buildings.

Building facades would feature a variety of color and material types. Buildings A2 and B3 would feature a central mass with cement plaster finish in a neutral brown primary color (see **Attachment D**, Building A2 and B3 Elevations). End masses would feature corrugated metal siding in a light grey or white secondary color with darker grey accent. White vinyl window systems would be accented by a pop of accent color from a variety of color options including red, yellow, orange and blue. Second and third pop-outs in the central mass of the building would feature horizontal siding and cantilevered awning system. Third-floor corner-unit windows would feature a decorative awning and all private balconies would feature a black tube steel railing. The only differentiating feature between Buildings A2 and B3 would be first-floor tuck-under vehicle parking and bicycle lockers featured on the first-floor of Building A2. Building B would be identical to Building A2 and B3 but would feature a butterfly roof system and would omit the third-floor window awnings (see **Attachment E**, Building B Elevations).

Building C would feature ground-floor residential amenities, with second and third story residential units and a rooftop terrace (see **Attachment F**, Building C Elevations). The building exterior would the same material and color palette as the residential buildings, including cement plaster siding in neutral off-white and grey with accents in dark red and black metal balcony railing. The first floor would feature expansive aluminum storefront window systems with white vinyl frames. The third-floor rooftop terrace would feature additional residential amenities including seating areas under a butterfly-roof shade structure. A smaller pavilion building would be located near the outdoor pool area, featuring restrooms and a storage area (see **Attachment G**, Pavilion Building). The pavilion building exterior would be cement plaster finish in off-white and dark red.

Exterior lighting would include building-mounted wall sconces and wall-pack fixtures and parking lot light poles (see **Attachment H**, Photometrics Plan). Attention to lighting is paid to areas between the buildings, pedestrian pathways and within the parking area. The project would include two new trash enclosures; a single enclosure would be located on the southeasterly portion of the parking lot and a double enclosure would be located on the southwesterly portion of the parking lot (see **Attachment I**, Site Details).

Vehicle parking for the units would be provided in a new parking area located central to the project site. Access to the site is provided by two driveways from 'C' Avenue, on the easterly and westerly sides of Building A2. A total of 121 vehicle parking spaces is providing, including 11 tuck-under parking spaces located in Building A2. Parking lot shade is estimated to reach 60-percent at full tree maturity, primarily featuring sawleaf zelkova and Shumard red oak trees. Ample bicycle parking is provided throughout the site, including 70 bicycle lockers in Building A2, 32 covered bicycle rack spaces and 10 uncovered bicycle rack spaces. A total of 112 bicycle parking spaces is provided.

<u>Landscaping and Amenities</u>
The landscape plan calls for a variety of native shrubs, grasses, perennials and trees (see **Attachment J**, Landscape Plan). The perimeter of the project site would include layered rows of trees, including Chinese elm, London plane tree and October glory maple. Smaller trees, shrubs and plants would be located within the interior of the project site, between the proposed buildings and throughout the parking area. The outdoor amenities and pool area would be extensively landscaped with potted palm trees, flax lily, and jade butterfly ginkgo. A lawn area would be located at the westerly portion of the pool patio area. A pet lawn area would be located at the northerly portion of the project site and would include artificial turf, fencing, trash cans, water fountain and seating areas (see **Attachment K**, Amenities Landscape Plan).

The project features extensive residential amenities including an outdoor pool and patio area, clubhouse, rooftop terrace and small pet park with water fountain and pet waste station. The pool and patio area would be located on the southerly portion of the project site, enclosed by a four-foot-tall fence (see **Attachment L**, Enlarged Amenities Plan). A wedge-shaped outdoor pool would be located central to the enclosed area, surrounded by a six-foot-tall tubular steel fence. A steel shade structure mimicking the shape of the pool would be located southerly to the pool, featuring a weaved shade fabric roof (see **Attachment I**). Extensive outdoor facilities on the patio would include fire pit with lounge seating, barbeque island with seating and eat-in counter and lawn area. Building C, located adjacent to the pool area, would feature first-floor indoor amenities and a rooftop terrace. Indoor amenities include a fitness studio, yoga studio

and lounge area as well as leasing and office staff space (see **Attachment M**, Building C Floorplan). The rooftop terrace features lounge chairs, tables and potted plants including New Zealand flax and jade butterfly gingko.

DISCUSSION

The proposal is consistent with General Plan goals and policies that encourage architectural designs that exhibit timeless character and create a culturally relevant sense of place (CD-3.1 and CD-4.1.3). The proposed design promotes pedestrian and bicycle access by directly engaging the public sidewalk, providing safe bike parking, and situating parking toward the side and rear of the site, consistent with policies CD-3.2 and CD-3.3. The native, drought tolerant species selections for the proposed landscaping are consistent with sustainability policies that promote water conservation and energy efficiency (SUS-4.2).

The project is consistent with Design Guidelines (DGs) that call for orienting multi-family residential development to the street and pedestrians by including front porches and balconies that create a sense of community and enliven the streetscape (DG 4.1.11, 4.1.24 and 4.1.13). The variety of building masses and rooflines avoids a monotonous appearance and provides character and style to the buildings (DG 1.2.22 and 4.1.23). Pedestrian walkways provide convenient access to the shared common space and appropriate site lighting are consistent with DGs 4.1.45, 4.1.44 and 4.4.42.

REQUIRED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

Environmental Review

The project falls within the scope of the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Meriam Park Master Plan, which was certified by the City Council on June 19, 2007. The EIR included several mitigation measures that apply to the proposed development, which are provided as **Attachment N,** and referenced in the recommended conditions of approval.

Pursuant to Section 15162 of the California Environmental Quality Act, no subsequent environmental review is necessary, as there have been no substantial changes to the project which would require revisions of the EIR, no substantial changes have occurred with respect to the circumstances under which the project is being undertaken which would require major revisions of the EIR, and no new information has become available which was not known and could not have been known at the time the EIR was completed.

1. *The proposed development is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan, and any applicable neighborhood or area plans.*

   The proposal is consistent with several General Plan goals and policies, including those that encourage architectural designs that create a culturally relevant sense of place, and promote pedestrian-oriented development (CD-3.1, CD-4.1.3, CD-3.2 and CD-3.3). Further, the native, drought tolerant species selections for the proposed landscaping are consistent with sustainability policies that promote water conservation and energy efficiency (SUS-4.2). The site is not located within the bounds of a Neighborhood Plan or area plan.

2. *The proposed development, including the character, scale, and quality of design are*

consistent with the purpose/intent of this chapter and any adopted design guidelines.

The project is consistent with Design Guidelines (DGs) that call for orienting multi-family residential development to the street and pedestrians by including front porches and balconies that create a sense of community and enliven the streetscape (DG 4.1.11, 4.1.24 and 4.1.13). The variety of building masses and rooflines avoids a monotonous appearance and provides character and style to the buildings (DG 1.2.22 and 4.1.23). Pedestrian walkways provide convenient access to the shared common space and appropriate site lighting are consistent with DGs 4.1.45, 4.1.44 and 4.4.42.

3. *The architectural design of structures, including all elevations, materials and colors are visually compatible with surrounding development. Design elements, including screening of equipment, exterior lighting, signs, and awnings, have been incorporated into the project to further ensure its compatibility with the character and uses of adjacent development.*

   The design, materials and colors of the proposed new buildings are anticipated to be visually compatible with future surrounding development in Meriam Park, including the previously approved Tank District Apartments. Roof mounted HVAC units and would be properly screened from view by roof structures and the trash enclosures would be painted to match the main structures. Parking areas, pedestrian pathways and shared common spaces would be appropriately illuminated. Third-floor window awnings are appropriately placed and incorporated into the project.

4. *The location and configuration of structures are compatible with their sites and with surrounding sites and structures, and do not unnecessarily block views from other structures or dominate their surroundings.*

   The proposal is consistent with development anticipated in the Neighborhood Center designation of Meriam Park. As few buildings currently exist in the area, the structures will appear to dominate their surroundings, however, this effect will diminish over time with additional surrounding development. Additionally, the proposed building's size and architecture is compatible with existing off-site development, such as the United Health Care building and Winco. The building would not unnecessarily block views from other existing structures.

5. *The general landscape design, including the color, location, size, texture, type, and coverage of plant materials, and provisions for irrigation and maintenance, and protection of landscape elements, have been considered to ensure visual relief, to complement structures, and to provide an attractive environment.*

   The proposed landscaping will provide a variety of seasonal color, while minimizing irrigation demands. The landscape design offers native plant varieties that are carefully located to ensure visual relief and would provide an attractive environment around the new buildings. Appropriate attention is given to areas surrounding residential amenities, including shade trees, potted plants and minimal lawn area which creates an attractive, usable space. Tree species throughout the site are complimentary of one another, creating seasonal color and tree canopy. The parking lot and bicycle parking is adequately shaded, as well as pedestrian pathways.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The front page of all approved building plans shall note in bold type face that the project shall comply with Architectural Review 18-24 (Springfield Apartments). No building permits related to this approval shall receive final approval without prior authorization of Community Development Department Planning staff.

2. All development shall comply with all other State and local Code provisions, including those of the City of Chico Community Development and Public Works Departments. The permittee is responsible for contacting these offices to verify the need for compliance.

3. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by Planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

4. All new electric, telephone, and other wiring conduits for utilities shall be placed underground in compliance with CMC 19.60.120.

5. The applicant shall comply with all applicable mitigation measures from the Meriam Park Environmental Impact Report and Mitigation Monitoring Program. These include, but are not limited to AES-1, AIR-1a, AIR-1b, AIR-1c, AIR-1d, AIR-2, BIO-8, CUL-2a, CUL-2b, CUL-3, CUL-4. HYDRO-3, and UTIL-1b which are incorporated herein by reference.

PUBLIC CONTACT

A 10-day public hearing notice was mailed to all landowners and residents within 500 feet of the site, a legal notice was published in the *Chico Enterprise Record* and a notice was posted on the project site at least 10 days prior to this ARHPB meeting. As of the date of this report no comments have been received in response to the public notice.

DISTRIBUTION

Internal
Mike Sawley, Senior Planner
Shannon Costa, Associate Planner
File: AR 18-24 (Springfield Apartments)

External
LPAS Architecture, Attn.: Chris Kelly, 2484 Natomas Park Drive, Suite 100, Sacramento, CA 95833 (ckelly@lpas.com)
Gonzales Development Company, 1266 Humboldt Avenue, Chico, CA 95928 (brian@gonzalesdevco.com) and dan@5sun.com

ATTACHMENTS

A. Illustrative Diagram
B. Overall Site Plan
C. Project Description
D. Building A2 and B3 Elevation
E. Building B Elevations
F. Building C Elevations

G. Pavilion Building
H. Photometrics Plan
I. Site Details
J. Landscape Plans
K. Amenities Landscape Plan
L. Building C Floorplan
M. Enlarged Amenities Plan
N. Mitigation Measures

X:\Current Planning\AR\2018\24 D4 Springfield Apts Meriam Park\for ARHPB\AR Staff Report.docx