Minutes of the adjourned regular meeting February 6, 2013

Municipal Center 421 Main Street Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Marci Goulart, Chair

Dale Bennett Dan Irving Tom Thomson Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: None

City Staff Present: Bob Summerville, Senior Planner

Greg Redeker, Associate Planner Mike Sawley, Associate Planner

## 1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Goulart called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

# 2.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda.

#### 3.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda.

#### 4.0 REGULAR AGENDA

# The Board toured the following projects:

- A. Michael C. Gabriel 794 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street (CA 11-01)
- B. <u>Bidwell Park Apartments</u> 1197 East 8<sup>th</sup> Street/1190 East 9<sup>th</sup> Street (AR 10-04)
- C. Dutch Brothers Coffee 1733 Esplanade (AR 10-07)
- D. State Farm Insurance 1915 Esplanade (AR 11-10)
- E. Reed Apartments 1141 West 5<sup>th</sup> Street (AR 11-16)
- F. Bank of America 400 Broadway (AR 09-17)
- G. <u>Dolce Homes</u> 127 Main Street (AR 12-08)
- H. Grana/North Rim Sports 178 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street (AR 11-02)

# 5.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

There was no business from the floor.

#### 6.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

# **7.0**

ADJOURNMENT
There being no further business, Chair Goulart adjourned the meeting at 5:35 p.m. to the regular meeting of March 6, 2013.

Approved on:	
I I	

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

Minutes of the adjourned regular meeting March 6, 2013

> Municipal Center 421 Main Street Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Marci Goulart, Chair

Dale Bennett
Dan Irving
Tom Thomson
Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: None

City Staff Present: Brendan Vieg, Principal Planner

Mike Sawley, Associate Planner

#### 1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Goulart called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

### 2.0 SWEARING-IN OF NEWLY APPOINTED BOARD MEMBER

City Clerk Debbie Presson administered the Oath of Office to the appointed Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board members Dale Bennett, Marci Goulart, Dan Irving, and Thomas Thomson.

#### 3.0 <u>SELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR</u>

Board Member Marci Goulart was elected Chair and Board Member Dale Bennett was elected Vice-Chair.

## 4.0 <u>CONSENT AGENDA</u>

There were no items for this agenda.

#### 5.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

# 5.1 <u>Subdivision/Planned Development 12-01 (Deer Park Subdivision) East 8<sup>th</sup> Street/Forest Avenue, APNs Various</u>

Associate Planner Mike Sawley presented the staff report and responded to questions from the Board.

# Chair Goulart opened the public hearing.

Tom DiGiovanni, R. John Anderson, Carol DiGiovanni, and Jim Stevens addressed the Board regarding this project.

#### Chair Goulart closed the public hearing.

Motion was passed that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and recommend approval of the Deer Park Subdivision and Planned Development (S/PDP 13-01), subject to conditions therein as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

#### Recommended Conditions of Approval for S/PDP 13-01

- 1. All approved building plans and permits shall note that the project shall comply with the Deer Park Subdivision and Planned Development Permit (S/PDP 13-01). No building permits related to this approval shall be finaled without prior authorization of Planning staff.
- 2. The approval documents for this project include the following exhibits:
  - a. Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map Deer Park (S/PDP 13-01), 2 sheets,
  - b. Off-street Parking and PD Exceptions,
  - c. Wildwood Court Plan & Details,
  - d. Exclusive Use Easements.
  - e. Typical House Elevations One Story,
  - f. Typical House Elevations Two Story,
  - g. Color Board, and
  - h. Conceptual Landscape Plans, 2 sheets.
- 3. Building permit grading plans for each lot shall demonstrate accordance with the City's Tree Preservation Standards set forth in Section 19.68.060 of the Chico Municipal Code, which is included herein by reference. The plans shall include or reference a report from a certified arborist (commissioned by developer) which assesses conformance of the plans with the City's Tree Preservation Standards. The arborist's report shall be subject to review and approval by the City's Urban Forest Manager, with the City retaining the right to obtain a third-party review, if deemed necessary.
- 4. Prior to grading or other major ground-disturbing activities on any of the subject lots, the developer shall install temporary tree protection fencing (or other approved means of tree protection), around the drip-line of the trees scheduled for retention. The physical means of tree protection shall be reviewed and approved by the Urban Forest Manager prior to commencement of grading or other construction activities.
- 5. Final building permit plans for all residential units shall be reviewed and approved by Planning staff for substantial conformance with the approved development plans.
- 6. <u>Clearly indicate on the plans where four-foot fencing versus six-foot fencing is proposed.</u>

- 7. Ensure that the homes facing East 8<sup>th</sup> Street use non-repetitive color schemes and different roof lines where the same floor plans are located adjacent to one another.
- 8. <u>Include the digital elevation renderings of the proposed homes (presented at the Board meeting) when the project goes before the Planning Commission.</u>
- 9. <u>Limit rear/side yard fence heights to the standard six feet with optional one foot</u> of lattice.

# 5.2 <u>Architectural Review 13-01 (Colebrook Place Apartments) 2925 Godman</u> Avenue, APN 007-220-013

Senior Planner Bob Summerville presented the staff report.

Chair Goulart opened the public hearing and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Community member Jim Stevens spoke on behalf of the project and responded to Board questions.

There being no further comments, the public hearing was closed.

The Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board continued the project to a future meeting date, to allow the design team time to address the following issues and conditions:

- 1. Provide manufacturer cut sheets for wall mounted light fixtures (illustrated as a "lantern" style on the architectural elevations). Include lamp type and wattage.
- 2. Add architectural features to all buildings that enhance interest and color. (Provide new color/material sample boards as necessary. Illustrate the enhancements on revised elevations.)
- 3. Provide architectural screening around all ground-mounted HVAC units, and enhance with landscaping as necessary. (As discussed with Greg Melton today, wire screens will be installed with creeping vines along the base of each screen).
- 4. Specify light fixtures and lamp types at carports, including a valence (or similar architectural feature) that shields clear views of the lamps and directs glare downward. (Also discussed with Greg, the lamps will be changed from fluorescent to LED to reduce the blue light spectrum that concerned some Board members.)
- 5. Specify larger columns at carports. (Greg also clarified that the columns will be larger and support a canti-levered roof.)

- 6. Relocate the trash enclosures further from the north and south property lines (away from existing residential uses). In discussing with Greg today, it may be best to clarify on the new site and/or landscape plans that the trash enclosures were moved 6 feet further than was illustrated on the plans provided to the Board in their report packets.
- 7. Illustrate a new trash enclosure in Phase II, close to the Godman Avenue frontage.
- 8. The Board asked to clarify the location of emergency access bollards and the fence separating project phases. Greg clarified that the bollards will be removed from the proposal to allow through access during both phases. Please illustrate this on a revised site and landscape plan, and note the location of fencing to separate the phases.
- 9. Clearly note the location of covered bike parking proposed beneath certain stairwells. (Building plans submitted for permits should include a plan and section detail of the related stairwells noting adequate space and height in accordance with CMC 19.70.080.)
- 10. Clearly illustrate the location of bench seating areas (or other passive recreation features) that are proposed throughout the site.
- 11. Clearly note on all final building plans that the central water feature will be 18 inches or less in depth.

# 6.0 REGULAR AGENDA

None.

#### 7.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

#### 8.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

#### 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Goulart adjourned the meeting to the regular meeting of April 3, 2013.

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

Minutes of the Adjourned Regular Meeting April 17, 2013

> Municipal Center 421 Main Street Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Vice Chair

Dan Irving Tom Thomson Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: Marci Goulart, Chair

City Staff Present: Brendan Vieg, Principal Planner

Mike Sawley, Associate Planner

#### 1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Vice Chair Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

# 2.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda.

#### 3.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

# 3.1 <u>Architectural Review 13-01 (Colebrook Place Apartments) 2925 Godman Avenue, APN 007-220-013 – Continued from previous meeting.</u>

Associate Planner Sawley provided the staff report and answered questions from the Board.

Ex parte communication: Vice Chair Bennett reported he had discussed project changes with Jim Stevens.

Vice Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:20 p.m. and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Project landscape architect Greg Melton presented revisions and answered questions regarding the project. Jim Stevens also addressed the Board on behalf of the applicant responded to Board questions.

Community members Trudy Vaughn, Doug Hasse, Mary Old-Kooi, and Sherry Prater spoke in opposition to the project, mostly regarding potential traffic impacts. A neighborhood petition in opposition to the project was presented to the Board.

There being no further comments, the public hearing was closed at 4:50 p.m.

Board Member Zappettini moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review 13-01 (Colebrook Place Apartments) subject to the conditions therein as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

#### **Conditions of Approval for AR 13-01**

- 1. All approved building plans and permits shall note that the project shall comply with AR 13-01 (Colebrook Place Apartments). No building permits related to this approval shall be finaled without prior authorization of Planning Services Department staff.
- 2. Note on related building and landscape plans to repair and replace existing wood fence boards along the north and south property lines as necessary. Install batten strips and a top rail detail for all fencing.
- 3. Illustrate on all applicable plan drawings structural screening of all ground-mounted HVAC units in conjunction with landscape screening.
- 4. Note on all building plans black wrought iron fencing along both street frontages (in accordance with development of both phases).
- 5. Note on all site and landscape plans consistent solid wood fencing with battens and a cap detail between Phase I and Phase II development areas.
- 6. Note on all building plans that all flashing at stairwells and balconies shall be stuccoed, covered with matching trim, and/or painted to match as necessary.
- 7. Security wall lights shall be mounted no higher than 10-feet.
- 8. Note on all building plans that all wall sconce light fixtures shall direct lighting downward only.
- 9. The permittee shall comply with CMC 16.66 regarding tree preservation and replacement, either planting onsite replacement trees or paying an off-site tree replacement fee for those trees to be removed which are subject to the City's tree preservation regulations. Onsite replacement trees shall be in areas directed by the Board, or as determined by Planning staff in consultation with the Urban Forest Manager. Any required arborist reports and recommendations shall be provided to Planning staff and the Urban Forest Manager prior to the issuance of grading or building permits.
- 10. Phase II of the project may be developed in accordance with this approval.

- 11. All building plans shall specify the roof colors of each building.
- 12. The vehicular and pedestrian gates for the site entrance off Godman Avenue shall use similar materials and design as the Joshua Tree Road entrance gate (as indicated on "Entry Gate" detail).
- 13 Revise the carport design to incorporate architectural design elements of the Community Building, specifically addressing the support posts.
- 14. Add more covered bike parking for the 8-plex buildings, subject to review and approval by Planning staff in conjunction with building permits.
- 15. Add a water table on the front and side elevations of the storage buildings.

  The water table shall be located approximately two-thirds of the way up
  the wall and be a dark color similar to the belly band on the main
  buildings.

Board Member Irving seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 4-0-1 (Goulart absent).

## 4.0 REGULAR AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda.

# 5.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

There was no business from the floor.

## 6.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

## 7.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Acting Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting at 5:35 p.m. to the regular meeting of May 1, 2013.

Approved on:	
--------------	--

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

Minutes of the regular adjourned meeting **February 21, 2018** 

Old Municipal Building 441 Main Street 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Conference Room

Board Members Present: Sheryl Campbell-Bennett, Chair

Rod Jennings Thomas Thomson

Board Members Absent: Georgie Bellin, Vice-Chair

Dan Irving

City Staff Present: Bruce Ambo, Principal Planner

Mike Sawley, Senior Planner Shannon Costa, Assistant Planner Robyn Ryan, Administrative Assistant

#### 1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Campbell-Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:02 pm. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

# 2.0 ELECTION OF NEW CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Board member Thomson moved to postpone the election of a new Chair and Vice-Chair to the next meeting on March 21, 2018 when more of the Board members will be present.

Board member Jennings seconded the motion, which passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

## 3.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

None.

#### 4.0 <u>CONSENT AGENDA</u>

#### 4.1 Approval of Minutes

Board member Thomson moved to approve the minutes from May 15, 2013, June 19, 2013, July 17, 2013, and November 15, 2017.

Board member Jennings seconded the motion, which passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

# 4.2 Review of Certified Local Government Program (CLG) 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 Annual Reports (Presented by Principal Planner Bruce Ambo)

Board member Jennings moved to approve the CLG Annual Reports for the years 2015-2016 and 2016-2017.

Board member Thomson seconded the motion which passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

### 5.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

5.1 Architectural Review 17-46 (Moore Duplexes); 1429 Sheridan Avenue, APN 003-480-034 – A proposal to contruct a 4-unit multi-family housing development on a 0.30-acre lot at 1429 Sheridan Avenue, on the southwest corner of Sheridan Avenue and East 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

Assistant Planner Shannon Costa provided the staff report and answered questions from the Board.

Chair Campbell-Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:06 PM and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Architect Greg Peitz addressed the Board on behalf of the applicant and answered questions.

Landscape Architect Jason Bisho addressed the Board and answered questions.

Connor Gilmartin, a student at Chico State addressed the Board and asked City Staff why this project is exempt from CEQA.

Assistant Planner Shannon Costa addressed the Board and Mr. Gilmartin and answered his question.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Campbell-Bennett closed the public hearing at 4:20 pm.

Board Member Thomson moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review AR 17-46 (Moore Duplexes), subject to the following conditions (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

- 1) All building plans shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 17-46 (Moore Duplexes). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without authorization of planning staff.
- 2) The proposed landscape plan may be modified as necessary to comply with Low Impact Development (LID) requirements, as promulgated under Chico Municipal Code Section 15.50.

- 3) All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
- 4) The applicant shall install four (4) additional bicycle racks on the site within proximity of the main entrance of the units.
- 5) The applicant shall provide additional architectural design elements to the rear building elevation along Sheridan Avenue.
- 6) All new electric, telephone, and other wiring conduits for utilities shall be placed underground in compliance with CMC 19.60.120.
- 7) As required by CMC 16.66, trees removed shall be replaced as follows:
  - a) On-site. For every six inches in DBH removed, a new 15-gallon tree shall be planted on-site. Replacement trees shall be of similar species, unless otherwise approved by the urban forest manager, and shall be placed in areas dedicated for tree plantings. New plantings' survival shall be ensured for three years after the date of planting and shall be verified by the applicant upon request by the director. If any replacement trees die or fail within the first three years of their planting, then the applicant shall pay an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council.
  - b) Off-site. If it is not feasible or desirable to plant replacement trees on-site, payment of an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council shall be required.
  - c) Replacement trees shall not receive credit as satisfying shade or street tree requirements otherwise mandated by the municipal code.
  - d) Tree removal shall be subject to the in-lieu fee payment requirements set forth by Chico Municipal Code (CMC) 16.66 and fee schedule adopted by the City Council.
  - e) All trees not approved for removal shall be preserved on and adjacent to the project site. A tree preservation plan, including fencing around drip lines and methods for excavation within the drip lines of protected trees to be preserved shall be prepared by the project developer pursuant to CMC 16.66.110 and 19.68.060 for review and approval by planning staff prior to any ground-disturbing activities.

The Motion was seconded by Board Member Jennings and passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

Board member Thomson then moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board rescind his previous motion to adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review AR 17-46 (Moore Duplexes), subject to the

#### conditions previously listed.

The Motion was seconded by Board Member Jennings and passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

Board Member Thomson then moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve Architectural Review AR 17-46 (Moore Duplexes), subject to the following conditions (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

- 1) All building plans shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 17-46 (Moore Duplexes). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without authorization of planning staff.
  - 2) The proposed landscape plan may be modified as necessary to comply with Low Impact Development (LID) requirements, as promulgated under Chico Municipal Code Section 15.50.
  - 3) All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
  - 4) The applicant shall install four (4) additional bicycle racks on the site within proximity of the main entrance of the units.
  - 5) <u>The applicant shall provide additional architectural design elements to the rearbuilding elevation along Sheridan Avenue.</u>
  - 6) All new electric, telephone, and other wiring conduits for utilities shall be placed underground in compliance with CMC 19.60.120.
  - 7) As required by CMC 16.66, trees removed shall be replaced as follows:
    - a) On-site. For every six inches in DBH removed, a new 15-gallon tree shall be planted on-site. Replacement trees shall be of similar species, unless otherwise approved by the urban forest manager, and shall be placed in areas dedicated for tree plantings. New plantings' survival shall be ensured for three years after the date of planting and shall be verified by the applicant upon request by the director. If any replacement trees die or fail within the first three years of their planting, then the applicant shall pay an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council.
    - b) Off-site. If it is not feasible or desirable to plant replacement trees on-site, payment of an in-lieu fee as established by a fee schedule adopted by the City Council shall be required.
    - c) Replacement trees shall not receive credit as satisfying shade or street tree requirements otherwise mandated by the municipal code.

- d) Tree removal shall be subject to the in-lieu fee payment requirements set forth by Chico Municipal Code (CMC) 16.66 and fee schedule adopted by the City Council.
- e) All trees not approved for removal shall be preserved on and adjacent to the project site. A tree preservation plan, including fencing around drip lines and methods for excavation within the drip lines of protected trees to be preserved shall be prepared by the project developer pursuant to CMC 16.66.110 and 19.68.060 for review and approval by planning staff prior to any ground-disturbing activities.

The Motion was seconded by Board Member Jennings and passed 3-0 with 2 absent.

None.

#### 7.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

#### 8.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Senior Planner Mike Sawley addressed the request from Board member Irving to revisit the restriping of Sacramento Avenue. This was not the Board's request but an individual request and not in the purview of this Board. This is a street maintenance issue.

## 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Campbell-Bennett adjourned the meeting at 4:30 pm to the regular meeting of March 21, 2018.

Approved on:	
approved on.	