

CITY OF CHICO
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes of the regular meeting
August 6, 2014

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Chair
Thomas Thomson, Vice Chair
Marci Goulart
Dan Irving
Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: None

City Staff Present: Mark Wolfe, Community Development Director
Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
Michelle Pease, Administrative Assistant

1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

2.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

None.

3.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There are no items for this agenda item.

4.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

None.

5.0 REGULAR AGENDA

5.1 EFFICIENCY MEETING WORKSHOP

An Efficiency meeting workshop was identified as a priority action item in the Board's 2013-2014 Work Plan as follows

Senior Planner Summerville presented the staff report. Items of importance are as follows:

- **Legal Findings:** Making findings (or not making them) is essentially the end task of most discretionary decisions, and should remain the focus of project review and Board deliberations. Findings provide the basis or rational foundation for a discretionary action, to avoid a perception of being otherwise merely an opinion. All staff reports include findings that are necessary for the Board to make as required by the Municipal Code.

- **Professional Rapport and Effective Questioning**
Board Members and staff serve as emissaries of the City of Chico. While polite or casual banter with an applicant or member of the public may encourage a more productive dialogue, maintaining an awareness of professionalism prevents dialogue from eroding into debate or opinion. Questions should focus on gaining the information necessary to make (or not make) a required finding. Staff recommended that all Board Members familiarize themselves with Administrative Procedure & Policy 10-1.
- **Effective Time Management**
It is the responsibility of the Chair to keep the pace of the meeting; however, each Board Member can assist with productive time management of a meeting by limiting discussion to the subtopics noted above.

6.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR
None.

7.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS
None.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT
There being no further business, Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting at 5:40 pm to the adjourned regular meeting of September 3, 2014.

Approved on: _____

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

CITY OF CHICO
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes of the regular meeting
September 3, 2014

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Chair
Thomas Thomson, Vice Chair
Marci Goulart
Dan Irving
Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: None

City Staff Present: Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
Michelle Pease, Administrative Assistant

1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

2.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

Marci Goulart met with Scott Gibson and Gary Lewis to answer questions on what the Board would be looking for.

3.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There are no items for this agenda item.

4.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

4.1 AR14-07(Pour House); 855 East Avenue – A proposal to expand an existing outdoor dining patio.

Associate Planner Sawley presented the staff report and addressed questions from the Board.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:13 p.m. and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Scott Gibson spoke on behalf of the Applicant. He addressed concerns regarding the proposed movie screen, lighting, shade, and connectivity to street. Mr. Gibson also addressed questions regarding the wine bottle fountain, bike racks, seating, sound system, color palette.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing at 5:05 pm.

The Board further discussed the item.

Board Member Zappettini stated she had based her decisions on what was provided in the staff report, but conceptually the drawings have changed and appear to still be in the design process. If conceptual was added to the staff report she'd feel better having more freedom with the approvals.

Board Member Irving wanted clarification regarding bike racks, materials, type of lighting and fixtures will be used. He stated that the renderings all seem to be different, he wants more specific details before he can approve the project.

Board Member Marci Goulart moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board continue this item to allow the applicant to return at a later date with more detailed information regarding the following items:

1. A final proposed color palette will be required.
2. Clarify anticipated changes or positions of landscape urns located in the patio to accommodate different events in the patio. (It was presented at the meeting that the number of new seats in the patio will approximately triple.)
3. Specify all lighting requests including the following, and provide manufacturer cut sheets of new fixtures and lamp types with power levels:
 - All illumination of the water fountain including up-lighting of the stream from the decorative wine bottle. Please be aware that up-lighting is discouraged by City code, policy, and design guidelines to avoid cumulative light pollution of dark night skies. Down-lighting is more supportable.
 - Wall-mounted fixtures;
 - Up-lighting of urns and plants;
 - Accent string lights around the central bar/gazebo;
 - Internal illumination of the decorative wine bottle.
4. Provide line-of-sight diagrams to illustrate the movie screen-wall will not interfere with safe vehicle movements through the East Avenue/Cohasset Road intersection.
5. Provide updated elevations of the central bar/gazebo which was presented at the meeting to be 4 feet higher than originally submitted.

6. Ensure that all drawings are consistent between elevations, plans, and renderings.
7. Clarify material, color, and landscaping along the rear of the movie-screen wall. Consider extending the wings of the screen wall to minimize visibility of the viewing screen from the adjacent streets to avoid distractions to motorists. (It was presented at the meeting that wall colors will match existing colors around the patio.)
8. Clarify finish and color of flatwork within the patio.
9. Clearly illustrate the location of bike parking racks on all plans.
10. Note on all related drawings that the tempered glass walls around the patio will be non-glare glass. Consider introducing other material surfaces (in addition or in-lieu of the tempered glass) that reduce visibility of the viewing screen from adjacent streets and minimize reflective lights and distractions to motorists.
11. Illustrate the design of the cradle supporting the decorative wine bottle.

Board Member Zappettini seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 5-0.

5.0 REGULAR AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

6.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

7.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting at 5:25 pm to the adjourned regular meeting of August 6, 2014.

Approved on: _____

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

CITY OF CHICO
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes of the regular meeting
October 1, 2014

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Chair
Marci Goulart
Dan Irving

Board Members Absent: Thomas Thomson, Vice Chair
Kris Zappettini

City Staff Present: Bob Summerville, Senior Planner

1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Bennett called the meeting to order. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

2.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

None.

3.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

4.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

4.1 AR 14-11 (Tochterman) – 341 Broadway, APN 004-151-007 – Installation of artwork in addition to, or in lieu of, existing business signage.

Senior Planner Summerville presented the staff report and responded to questions from the Board regarding the project.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing.

Board Member Irving moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve AR 14-11 (Tochterman) subject to the recommended conditions, as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

Conditions of Approval for AR 14-11

1. All artwork installed on the exterior walls of 341 Broadway where Chico Paper Company is located shall be consistent with the artwork approved by the Board in conjunction with AR 14-11(Tochterman).

2. All development shall comply with all other State and local Code provisions, including those of the City of Chico Community Development, Public Works, and Fire Departments. The permittee is responsible for contacting these offices to verify the need for compliance.

Chair Bennett seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0-2 (Thomson & Zappettini absent).

5.0 REGULAR AGENDA

- 5.1 **Caper Acres Renovation Plan Input** - As requested by the Bidwell Park & Playground Commission (BPPC), the Board will provide input on the draft Caper Acres Renovation Plan.

The Board provided the following comments and recommendations to the Bidwell Park & Playground Commission for consideration in the Caper Acres Renovation Plan:

1. Fences around the perimeter of Caper Acres should limit brightly colored attachments and be designed to visually transition into the natural Bidwell Park setting.
2. Include design elements of cultural value emphasizing local history of surrounding region including gold rush-era subjects.
3. Utilize Mechoopda Tribal site monitors during construction and ground disturbing activities.
4. Include design elements of educational value on Chico history including Mechoopda Indian Tribe, Ishi, John and Annie Bidwell, and western migration.
5. Keep colors of design elements toned down, and avoid a corporate or “Disney-like” character. Limit use of bright colors to accents.
6. Utilize interpretive and interactive elements on Chico history.
7. Retain existing scale of park entrance to preserve its historic character.
8. Include an area for installations or exhibits of children’s art.
9. Utilize security lighting with attractive design features, full cut-off fixtures, low-intensity lamps, and pedestrian-level scale.

6.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

7.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting to the adjourned regular meeting of October 15, 2014.

Approved on: _____

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

CITY OF CHICO
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes of the regular meeting
October 15, 2014

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Chair
Thomas Thomson, Vice Chair
Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: Marci Goulart
Dan Irving

City Staff Present: Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
Mike Sawley, Associate Planner
Jerry Kotysan, Senior Plan Check Engineer
Jessica Henry, Administrative Analyst

1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

2.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

None.

3.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

4.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

4.1 AR 14-09 (Buffalo Wild Wings) – 845 East Avenue, APN 007-280-061

A proposal to construct a new 6,500 sq. ft. restaurant and parking area at the North Valley Plaza.

Associate Planner Sawley presented the staff report, spoke about the original plan, the changes made, and responded to questions from the Board regarding the project.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:06 pm and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Brian Firth, Landscape Architect, Jack Powers, Architect, and Lucy Parks, North Valley Mall owner, all spoke on behalf of the Applicant.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing at 4:17 pm.

Chair Bennett reopened the public hearing at 4:27 pm and invited the applicant to address the color question posed by Board Member Thompson.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the reopened public hearing at 4:28 pm.

Board Member Thompson moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve AR 14-09 (Buffalo Wild Wings) subject to the recommended conditions, as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

Conditions of Approval for AR 14-09

1. All approved building plans and permits shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 14-09 (Buffalo Wild Wings). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without authorization of Planning staff.
2. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by Planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
3. All parapet caps and other metal flashing shall be painted, consistent with the approved building colors.
4. *Use yellow lettering for the signage, as shown on the approved elevations.*
5. *Use the darker yellow color (California chamois, HLS4205-3), for the building exterior, instead of "citrus" yellow color.*
6. *Add a logo or mural toward the rear of the east elevation, details to be worked out with planning staff.*

Board Member Zappettini seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0-2 (Goulart & Irving absent).

4.2 AR 14-10 (Mechoopda Administration Building) , Lot 303 of Meriam Park Phase 3A, a portion of APN 002-180-053 – A proposal to construct a new 13,740 sq. ft. office building and parking area at Meriam Park.

Associate Planner Sawley presented the staff report and discussed the original plan and the changes made. He also addressed questions regarding the project design.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:40 pm and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Larry Coffman, Northstar Engineering, spoke on behalf of the Applicant. Mr. Coffman the tribe is excited to be in this area, which is in the vicinity that was originally used by their ancestral tribe. Mr. Coffman addressed questions and concerns from the Board.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing at 5:08 pm.

Board Member Zapettini moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve AR 14-10 (Mechoopda Administration Building) subject to the recommended conditions, as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

Conditions of Approval for AR 14-10

1. All approved building plans and permits shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 14-10 (Mechoopda Administration Building). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without authorization of Planning staff.
2. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by Planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
3. Provide a pedestrian connection between the public sidewalk and internal walkway that provides pedestrian access to the off-street parking area.
4. The future planned expansion of 4,000 sq. ft. on the second story shall be subject to administrative review, so long as it is found to be consistent with the approved design.
5. The trash enclosure shall be constructed of six-foot stucco masonry walls with overhanging cap and stone veneer as a wainscot or as pilasters on the corners, matching the style of the approved elevations, as modified by any other conditions.
6. All new light standards shall be limited to 12 feet in height, consistent with Mitigation Measure AES-1.
7. The applicant shall comply with all applicable mitigation measures from the Meriam Park Environmental Impact Report and Mitigation Monitoring Program. These include AES-1, AIR-1a, AIR-1b, AIR-1c, AIR-1d, AIR-

2, BIO-8, CUL-2a, CUL-2b, CUL-3, CUL-4. HYDRO-3, and UTIL-1b, which are incorporated herein by reference.

8. The Board recommends adding surface texture to the six large columns at the front of the building, with specific details to be worked out with Planning staff.
9. The Board recommends using stone on the exterior of the building that more-closely resembles the volcanic rock found in the region.

Board Member Thompson seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0- 2 (Goulart & Irving absent).

5.0 REGULAR AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

6.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

7.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting at 5:17 p.m. to the adjourned regular meeting of November 5, 2014.

Approved on: _____

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.

CITY OF CHICO
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes of the regular meeting
November 5, 2014

Municipal Center
421 Main Street
Conference Room 1

Board Members Present: Dale Bennett, Chair
Dan Irving
Kris Zappettini

Board Members Absent: Thomas Thomson, Vice Chair
Marci Goulart

City Staff Present: Bob Summerville, Senior Planner
Jerry Kotysan, Senior Plan Check Engineer
Mike Sawley, Associate Planner
Greg Redeker, Associate Planner
Jessica Henry, Administrative Analyst

1.0 CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Bennett called the meeting to order at 4:13 pm. Board Members and staff were present as noted above.

2.0 EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

None.

3.0 CONSENT AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

4.0 PUBLIC HEARING AGENDA

4.1 AR 14-14 (Starbucks) – 851 East Avenue, APNs 007-280-060 and -063

A proposal to construct a new 5,200 sq. ft. multi-tenant commercial building on an undeveloped pad site at the North Valley Plaza shopping center in north Chico.

Associate Planner Sawley presented the staff report and spoke about the original plan and the changes made.

The Board asked the following:

- Board Member Irving asked about the signage plan. Bob Summerville and Mike Sawley responded that the planned signage was included in elevation plan and it was unknown who the other tenants would be.
- Chair Bennett asked if there were any changes since staff report. Mike Sawley responded no.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 4:24 pm and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Brian Firth, landscape architect, spoke on behalf of the Applicant, addressing both the building and landscaping plans.

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing at 4:55 pm.

Chair Bennett moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve AR 14-14 (Starbucks) subject to the recommended conditions, as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

Conditions of Approval for AR 14-14

1. All approved building plans and permits shall note on the cover sheet that the project shall comply with AR 14-14 (Starbucks). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without authorization of Planning staff.
2. All wall-mounted utilities and roof or wall penetrations, including vent stacks, utility boxes, exhaust vents, gas meters and similar equipment, shall be screened by appropriate materials and colors. Adequate screening shall be verified by Planning staff prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.
3. All parapet caps and other metal flashing shall be painted, consistent with the approved building colors.
4. *Add a pedestrian connection between the sidewalk along East Avenue and the parking area just westerly of the trash enclosure.*
4. *Signage letter height shall be limited to 24-inches or less.*
5. *Escutcheon plates shall be metal and painted stiletto black.*

Board Member Zappettini seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0-2 (Goulart & Thomson absent).

- 4.2 AR 14-06 (Kibler) – 1910 E. 20th Street, APNs 002-450-003 and -035 – A proposal to construct a new multi-tenant commercial building on the site currently occupied by Marie Callender's at the Chico Mall.**

Associate Planner Redeker reviewed the staff memo recommending continuing the item due to a noticing error for the related Use Permit. Staff recommended this item be continued to the adjourned regular meeting of November 19, 2014.

Board Member Irving moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board continue consideration of AR 14-06 (Kibler) to the Board's adjourned regular meeting on November 19, 2014.

Board Member Zappettini seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0-2 Goulart & Thomson absent).

- 4.3 AR 14-08 (Peitz) – 1105 Stewart Avenue, APN 043-230-011** – A proposal to construct a 6-unit apartment building, including two townhouse units, on vacant property located near the intersection of Stewart and Nord Avenues.

Associate Planner Redeker presented the staff report and spoke about the original plan and the changes made.

Chair Bennett opened the public hearing at 5:16 pm and invited the applicant to make a presentation.

Greg Peitz, Brian Firth and Matt Shelton spoke on behalf of the Applicant

With no other members of the public wishing to address the Board, Chair Bennett closed the public hearing at 5:39 pm.

Board Member Zappettini moved that the Architectural Review and Historic Preservation Board adopt the required findings contained in the agenda report and approve AR 14-08 (Peitz) subject to the recommended conditions, as modified below (changes are denoted by italicized and underlined text):

Conditions of Approval for AR 14-08

1. All approved building plans and permits shall note that the project shall comply with AR 14-08 (Peitz). No building permits related to this approval shall be finalized without prior authorization of Planning Division staff.
2. All structures, landscaping, and improvements shall be in substantial conformance with the plans, diagrams, elevations, color palette, and other materials attached to this staff report, except as modified by any other condition of approval.
3. Final site and landscaping plans shall include a detail for all screening and perimeter fences as required by CMC 19.60.060, taking into account any direction provided by the Board, subject to Planning staff review and approval.
4. All windows shall include off-white frames or other color as directed by the Board.
5. A note shall be placed on all building plans that all flashing and other galvanized metal elements (such as roof vents) shall be stuccoed and/or painted to match adjacent construction.

6. The existing 34" diameter oak tree shall be preserved. Prior to any grading or other work on the site, the applicant shall submit a report from a certified arborist analyzing the proposed improvements within the root zone of the oak. Temporary fencing and other tree preservation measures as established in CMC 19.68 and 16.66 shall be included on all construction drawings and grading plans, and shall be complied with both during and after construction. All paving within the root zone of the oak tree shall be pervious concrete, pavers, or other construction techniques as determined by the arborist which will ensure the long-term health of the tree. If the tree dies or is removed within three years after the project is completed, the property owner shall plant replacement trees and/or pay a tree replacement fee as established in CMC 16.66.
7. Prior to issuance of a final certificate of occupancy, the applicant shall install a sign or signs which state that open containers of alcohol are not permitted in the parking lot. The sign shall comply with the standards and language established in CMC 9.30.
8. Where there are discrepancies between the color elevations and black and white elevations, the color elevations shall control.
9. All bicycle parking spaces shall include a permanent rack which allows for the bicycle frame to be supported at two points (Dero "Hoop" Rack, Madrax "UX", or similar). Guest bicycle parking spaces shall be shifted to the west so that they can be accessed from both adjacent walkways. Covered bicycle parking spaces for the rear ground-floor apartments shall be located as indicated on the landscaping plan.
10. The applicant shall install public improvements as directed by Development Engineering, including either alley improvements or payment of an alley in-lieu fee.
11. All wall-pack lighting shall consist of IES full cutoff fixtures mounted no higher than 12 feet above grade. Parking lot lighting shall also be IES full cutoff fixtures no greater than 12 feet in height. Low intensity non-cutoff architectural light fixtures (800 lumens or less) may be installed near each unit's front door at the applicant's discretion.

Board Member Irving seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 3-0-2 Goulart & Thomson absent).

5.0 REGULAR AGENDA

There were no items for this agenda item.

6.0 BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

7.0 REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

None.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Bennett adjourned the meeting at 6:00 pm to the adjourned regular meeting of November 19, 2014.

Approved on: _____

These minutes were approved by a different Board than the one that presided over the meeting referenced above.