

4 ERRATA

This chapter contains changes and modifications to the language of the Draft Environmental Impact Report made subsequent to its public release and the public review process. All of these changes are made for clarification purposes and none of them alter the conclusions of the DEIR.

SECTION E3.2.3 CEDAR GROVE AREA CONCEPT PLAN

The following bullet has been added to the Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan description on Pages E3-10 through E3-15 of the DEIR:

- ▶ Establishment of an entry plaza to the group picnic area, including and information kiosk and benches.

SECTION E4.3.1 AESTHETICS

The following sentence has been added the Scenic Road/Resources description on Page E4-6 of the DEIR:

The City of Chico's General Plan identifies local scenic roads. Per General Plan Policy CD-G-10 Vallombrosa, Manzanita & Woodland Avenues are designated as local scenic roads. East 8th Street is also designated a local scenic road between Bruce Road and SR 32.

IMPACT AES-4B

The last paragraph on page E4-11 of the DEIR has been revised to clarify the discussion of impacts on aesthetic resources resulting from the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area project as follows:

Environmental criteria that were included in the design process of the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan included areas that were identified for avoidance and protection. These areas, which included occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom, vernal pools, and ephemeral drainages, also constitute ~~visual resources which would be largely avoided under the conceptual project plan.~~ important aesthetic resources. These resources were inventoried and mapped in support of the DEIR analysis and detailed information about their location and extent was provided to the disc golf course/trailhead area design team. As a result, those resources have either been completely avoided in the current proposed design or impacts on these resources have been minimized to the greatest extent possible while still achieving project objectives. This change presents a considerable improvement over the degraded, existing aesthetic conditions, which do not incorporate site specific knowledge of resources or avoidance measures. As a result, the proposed project is expected to improve the aesthetic conditions of the disc golf site. Impacts on sensitive biological resources (which also provide aesthetic value to the site) that could not be avoided in their entirety are addressed in Section E4.3.3, "Biological Resources." This section includes an extensive set of resource-specific mitigation measures aimed at enhancing biological resources at the site, which, in turn, are expected to enhance the aesthetic character of the site. The design criteria also identified resources for impact minimization, including blue oaks and other native oak species, Bidwell's knotweed populations, native wildflower fields, and the old Humboldt wagon road. All of these resources contribute to the attractive visual character of the project site, and under the conceptual plan, impacts on these resources would be minimized to the greatest extent possible as a result of the proposed course design. The design places structures and trails away from sensitive resources and minimizes the site footprint by providing clearly marked trails. It also provides facilities at a centralized location and demarcates parking, seeking to concentrate certain uses near the parking lot area.

In addition, the second paragraph on page E4-12 had been updated as follows:

The Disc Golf/Trailhead area is currently being utilized for disc golf with minimal infrastructure. This use has resulted in a degradation of the visual character of the site. The degraded aesthetic conditions of the existing circumstances at the disc golf site include and excessive network of unofficial trails, excessively wide trails between tees and targets, and damage to trees and shrubs.

IMPACT BIO-1B

The first sentence in paragraph 3 on Page E4-52 of the DEIR has been modified as follows:

Three potential layouts have been identified for the Disc Golf/Trailhead area. Concept Plan A, the plan with the largest footprint, has the greatest potential to result in indirect impacts on Butte County checkerbloom, because it would result in the construction of two courses at the SR 32 site, an 18-hole beginner course (the short course) and a 21-hole (18 regular and 3 alternative) advanced course (the long course).

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-1B

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-1B on page E4-53 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-1b: Implement Measures to Protect Butte County Checkerbloom in the Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan Area

The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate potential direct and indirect effects on populations of Butte County checkerbloom from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan:

- ▶ As provided in Appendix H of the BPMMP, the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to avoid direct and indirect impacts on known locations of Butte County checkerbloom on the site ~~to the greatest extent feasible~~. All disc golf structures (e.g., tees, targets, fairways) and trails shall be placed a minimum of 50 feet from locations that currently support Butte County checkerbloom wherever possible. Where this cannot be accomplished due to physical site constraints, the buffer may be reduced, but shall remain at a minimum of 25 feet.
- ▶ Before construction of any facility at the Disc Golf/Trailhead area in the vicinity of known locations of Butte County checkerbloom, exclusionary fencing shall be installed along a 25-foot buffer around the outer perimeter of the occurrence. Exclusionary fencing shall be installed under the guidance of a qualified botanist before commencement of construction to keep workers and equipment from disturbing existing Butte County checkerbloom plants. The fencing shall be kept in place and periodically inspected and repaired, if necessary, for the duration of construction.
- ▶ The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall restrict foot traffic to clearly defined trails and disc golf features. Trails shall be constructed as narrow as possible to avoid degradation of suitable habitat for Butte County checkerbloom (and other special status plant species). Where existing disc golf structures and trails in the vicinity of existing locations of Butte County checkerbloom will be decommissioned, barriers (such as boulders) shall be placed to discourage use of these trails and structures.
- ▶ Permanent signage at the trailhead/rest area shall be installed to inform Park users of the presence and sensitivity of Butte County checkerbloom (and other sensitive resources) on the site.

- ▶ As provided in Appendix H of the BPMMP, alternate pin locations for Holes 3 and 4 of the long course shall be used from March 1 through July 1 to provide further assurance that minimize-potential disturbance of nearby checkerbloom plants during the active growth and blooming period of the plants is minimized.
- ▶ Per Plant Objective O. P-8 of the BPMMP, an adaptive management program shall be implemented that relies on periodic data collection on the distribution ~~and progress~~ of Butte County checkerbloom at the Disc Golf/Trailhead site. The goal of this adaptive management program shall be to document and monitor changes in the existing population of Butte County checkerbloom over time. The adaptive management plan is intended to address the fact that, notwithstanding the buffers and signage, the City cannot guarantee that the use of the park will not disturb Butte County checkerbloom.
- ▶ If data collection indicates a decline in existing populations after implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan and Plant Objective 0. P-8 of the BPMMP, relocation of trails or disc golf structures in the vicinity of these populations, or other management strategies that would benefit the plants based on the data collected, shall be implemented. This strategy would implement Plant Objective O. P-7 and Plant Implementation Strategies and Guidelines I. P-3 and I. P-4 of the BPMMP. The overall goal of the adaptive management strategy shall be the long-term maintenance of the same number and approximate extent of occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom on the site as documented during the 2005 surveys.

Applies to: Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before ground-disturbing activities and during ongoing operation

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-1b would reduce potentially significant impacts on Butte County checkerbloom from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-1c

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-1c on page E4-55 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-1c: Implement Measures to Protect Known Occurrences of Butte County Checkerbloom in the Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan Areas

To mitigate the potential direct and indirect effects on known occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom during implementation of the Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan areas, the following measures shall be implemented:

- ▶ Before the start of any ground-disturbing activities, the City shall retain a qualified botanist to identify the locations of previously documented occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom in the Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan Areas. The locations shall be clearly flagged or otherwise marked for avoidance during construction.
- ▶ The flagged occurrences shall be avoided ~~to the maximum extent feasible~~ and a buffer of at least 25 feet shall be established.

- ▶ ~~If complete avoidance of impacts to known occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom is infeasible due to other environmental constraints (e.g., vernal pools) or due to Park Improvement Project goals, then such impacts shall be minimized. In those instances, any loss of Butte County checkerbloom shall be mitigated through preservation and enhancement of remaining occurrences and preservation and enhancement of suitable habitat on-site. As a performance standard, such mitigation shall aim to ensure a no-net loss of the number of Butte County checkerbloom populations/and or habitat within the Park or region. Such measures shall include transplanting and monitoring plants that cannot be avoided. The City shall consult with DFG with respect to such preservation and enhancement measures. This mitigation shall be implemented as part of project implementation, and any monitoring and remedial action requirements specified as part of the consultation shall be implemented by the City.~~
 Mitigation shall aim to ensure a no-net loss of the number of Butte County checkerbloom populations/and or habitat within the Park or region. Such measures shall include transplanting and monitoring plants that cannot be avoided. The City shall consult with DFG with respect to such preservation and enhancement measures. Any mitigation developed through consultation with DFG shall be implemented as part of project implementation, and any monitoring and remedial action requirements specified as part of the consultation shall be implemented by the City.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before ground-disturbing activities and during ongoing operation

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-1c would reduce potentially significant impacts on known occurrences of Butte County checkerbloom from implementation of Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-1D

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-1d on page E4-57 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-1d: Implement Measures to Protect Bidwell's Knotweed at the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area

The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate for potential direct and indirect effect to Bidwell's knotweed at the Disc Golf/Trailhead Plan area:

- ▶ The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to minimize direct and indirect impacts on Bidwell's knotweed habitat on the site. Because Bidwell's knotweed is an annual plant species, population sizes may fluctuate greatly from year to year. Therefore, simply avoiding plants that are present in a given year would not ensure that great numbers of individuals would not be affected in subsequent years. Therefore, a habitat approach shall be taken to minimize impacts on this species. This approach would entail minimizing impacts to wildflower fields, the native plant community that supports Bidwell's knotweed.
- ▶ Consistent with the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, trails shall generally be placed outside of wildflower fields. The Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be implemented to restrict foot traffic to clearly defined trails and disc golf structures. The number of trails dissecting wildflower fields shall be minimized to the fewest number necessary to facilitate reasonable access to the disc golf course and scenic viewpoints, and trails shall be as narrow as possible and have clearly marked edges to reduce widening and discourage users from wandering off the path. Existing trails through wildflower fields that will not be retained as part of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan shall be decommissioned, and barriers (such as boulders) shall be placed just outside any points where trails enter the wildflower field community to discourage use of these trails.
- ▶ Exclusionary fencing shall be installed under the guidance of a qualified botanist before commencement of construction to keep workers and equipment from disturbing wildflower field

habitat intended for preservation. High priority shall be given to preserving those wildflower field communities that contained Bidwell's knotweed during surveys conducted in 2005.

- ▶ Permanent signage at the trailhead/rest area shall be installed to inform Park users of the presence and sensitivity of Bidwell's knotweed and wildflower field habitat and to deter users from disturbing the species.
- ▶ Per Plant Objective O. P-8 of the BPMMP, an adaptive management program shall be implemented that relies on periodic data collection on the distribution ~~and progress of Bidwell's knotweed~~ at the Disc Golf/ Trailhead site. The goal of this adaptive management program shall be to document and monitor changes in the existing population of Bidwell's knotweed ~~Butte County checkerbloom~~ over time.
- ▶ If data collection indicates a decline in ~~the location~~ the number or extent (i.e. square feet) of existing populations after implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, relocation of trails or disc golf structures in the vicinity of these populations, or other management strategies that would benefit the plants based on the data collected, shall be implemented. Seasonal and annual variation of the plants in response to environmental conditions such as rainfall shall be taken into consideration when determining if a decline is occurring. This strategy would implement Plant Objective O. P-7 and Plant Implementation Strategies and Guidelines I. P-3 and I. P-4 of the BPMMP.

Applies to: Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: During construction of Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Plans and during ongoing operation

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-1d would reduce potentially significant impacts on Bidwell's knotweed from implementation of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2B

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2b on page E4-63 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2b: Implement Measures to Protect Elderberry Shrubs, the Host Plant for the Valley Elderberry Longhorn Beetle

The City shall ensure that the following measures are implemented to minimize potential project effects on elderberry shrubs, the host plant for valley elderberry longhorn beetles.

Areas that support elderberry shrubs shall be identified and, to the extent feasible and practicable, project elements shall be designed to avoid direct effects on these areas. Before beginning any ground-disturbing project activities, a qualified biologist shall identify areas that support elderberry shrubs and that could be affected by the given project. The City shall ensure, through coordination with the biologist, that the footprint of project features and construction zones, staging areas, and access routes are designed to avoid disturbance of potential habitat to the extent feasible and practicable.

If impacts to areas supporting elderberry shrubs cannot be avoided, focused surveys shall be conducted. Before the initiation of any ground-disturbing activities, a qualified biologist shall conduct surveys for elderberry shrubs within 100 feet of the impact area, in accordance with USFWS guidelines. All

elderberry shrubs with potential to be affected by project activities shall be mapped and the number of stems greater than 1 inch in diameter on each shrub that may require removal shall be counted. If no elderberry shrubs are found during focused surveys, no further action shall be required.

If potential effects to valley elderberry longhorn beetle cannot be avoided, measures shall be implemented to minimize and mitigate unavoidable effects. Before the initiation of any ground-disturbing project activities within 100 feet of elderberry shrubs that are suitable for use by valley elderberry longhorn beetles, USFWS shall be consulted to develop appropriate measures. Such measures ~~may~~ shall include those described in Conservation Guidelines for the Valley Elderberry Longhorn Beetle (USFWS 1999) and the VELB Programmatic Consultation (USFWS 1996). Minimization measures ~~may~~ shall include implementation of buffers around shrubs that would not be removed, transplanting shrubs to a conservation area, conducting worker awareness training, and periodic biological monitoring. Compensation ~~may~~ shall include planting of elderberry seedling or cuttings and associate native species.

Authorization for take of valley elderberry longhorn beetle under ESA shall be obtained if it is determined that implementation of a program component is likely to result in take, despite implementation of avoidance and minimization measures.

- ▶ All measures developed through informal consultation with USFWS shall be implemented, as well as any additional measures adopted through a formal permitting process, if applicable.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction activities

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-2b would reduce potentially significant impacts on VELB from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2C

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2c on page E4-64 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2c: Implement Measures to Protect and Compensate for Loss of Vernal Pool Invertebrate and Western Spadefoot Habitat

The City shall ensure that the following measures are implemented to avoid, minimize, and mitigate potential project effects on vernal pool invertebrates and western spadefoot:

- ▶ Before any ground-disturbing project activities begin, the City shall retain a qualified biologist to identify and map potential habitat in areas that could be affected by the given project. The City shall ensure, through coordination with the biologist, that the footprint of project features and construction zones, staging areas, and access routes are designed to avoid direct or indirect effects on suitable habitat for vernal pool invertebrates and western spadefoot to the extent feasible and practicable. In addition to vernal pools, suitable habitat for western spadefoot includes the surrounding grassland matrix.
- ▶ If vernal pool invertebrate and western spadefoot habitat cannot be avoided, measures shall be implemented to minimize and mitigate unavoidable effects. Before beginning any ground-disturbing project activities in such habitat, USFWS shall be consulted to identify appropriate measures to minimize and compensate for adverse effects on special-status vernal pool invertebrates; DFG shall

be consulted to identify measures to minimize and compensate for adverse effects on western spadefoot. Avoidance and minimization measures shall include those described in USFWS's vernal pool crustacean Programmatic Consultation (USFWS 1996a). Minimization measures for vernal pool invertebrates shall include, but would not be limited to, fencing of habitat to be avoided, timing of ground disturbance to correspond with the dry season, conducting worker awareness training, and periodic biological monitoring. Compensation may shall include preservation, enhancement, and/or creation of suitable habitat in areas that currently, or could in the future, support special-status invertebrate and/or spadefoot populations.

- ▶ Authorization for take of vernal pool invertebrates under ESA shall be obtained if it is determined that implementation of a program component is likely to result in take, despite implementation of avoidance and minimization measures.
- ▶ All other measures developed through informal consultation with USFWS and DFG shall be implemented, as well as any additional measures adopted through a formal permitting process, if applicable.

Implementing this mitigation measure would reduce the potential impact on special-status vernal pool invertebrates and western spadefoot to a less than significant level.

Applies to: Trails Plan Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction in and near vernal pool habitats and Western spadefoot habitats.

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-2c would reduce potentially significant impacts on vernal pool crustacean and western spadefoot habitat from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2(D)1

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2d(1) on page E4-66 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2d(1): Protect Tree-Nesting Raptors

Before project construction, it shall be determined whether any construction or tree removal is proposed during the raptor nesting season (February 1 to August 31). If no construction or tree removal will occur during the raptor nesting season, no further mitigation shall be necessary.

If construction or tree removal is proposed during the raptor nesting season, a focused survey for special-status and common raptor nests shall be conducted by a qualified biologist during the nesting season to identify active nests within 500 feet of the project area. The survey shall be conducted no less than 14 days and no more than 30 days before the beginning of construction or tree removal.

If nesting raptors are found during the focused survey, impacts shall be avoided by establishment of appropriate buffers. No project activity shall commence within the buffer area until a qualified biologist confirms that the nest is no longer active. ~~The DFG guidelines recommend implementation for a~~ of 500-foot buffers will be implemented, but the size of the buffer may be adjusted if a qualified biologist determines ~~it would not be likely to adversely affect the nest~~ a greater or lesser buffer would be appropriate and DFG concurs with any determination for a lesser buffer. The City shall coordinate with

DFG on the appropriate buffer width for each species documented. Monitoring of the nest by a qualified biologist may be required if the activity has potential to adversely affect the nest or disturb the birds using the nest to the point of causing nest failure.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/ Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction during the breeding season of tree-nesting raptors

Responsible Party: City of Chico

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2D(3)

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2d(3) on page E4-67 of the DEIR. The third bullet in Mitigation Measure BIO-2d(3) on Page E4-67 of the DEIR has been amended as follows:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2d(3): Protect Burrowing Owl

Grassland habitat in Middle and Upper Park provides potentially suitable habitat for burrowing owls. The following mitigation measure shall be implemented to identify suitable habitat and protect burrowing owl from adverse effects of the Park Improvement Projects:

- ▶ Before any ground disturbance related to the Park Improvement Projects that occur within or adjacent to grassland habitat, a qualified biologist shall conduct a preconstruction survey to assess habitat suitability for burrowing owl (e.g., based on grassland structure and presence of burrows) and, in areas determined to be suitable, evaluate use by burrowing owls in accordance with current DFG survey guidelines (CDFG 1995). Surveys shall be conducted within 30 days prior to beginning construction activities and shall include the disturbance footprint and a 500-foot radius of the disturbance footprint perimeter. For construction activities occurring during the burrowing owl breeding season (February 1–August 31), surveys shall document whether burrowing owls are nesting on or directly adjacent to disturbance areas. Survey results shall be valid only for the season during which the survey is conducted. If no burrowing owls are documented during the surveys, no further mitigation shall be required.

If burrowing owls are found, the following additional measures shall be implemented:

- ▶ Project construction shall avoid all burrowing owl nest sites that could otherwise be disturbed by project construction during the breeding season (February 1–August 31) or while the nest is occupied by adults or young. Avoidance shall include establishment of a nondisturbance buffer zone of at least 250 feet around each nest site. The buffer zone shall be delineated by highly visible temporary construction fencing. Construction may occur during the breeding season if a qualified biologist monitors the nest and determines that the nest site is no longer used by burrowing owls.
- ▶ Any artificial burrows created shall be placed in location with minimal public access and thus will be protected from disturbance. If burrowing owls are found during the nonbreeding season (September 1–January 31), project construction shall avoid the owls and the burrows they are using. Avoidance shall include the establishment of at least a 160-foot nondisturbance buffer zone around each burrow being used. The buffer shall be delineated by highly visible temporary construction fencing. If burrowing owls cannot be avoided, the City shall conduct passive relocation by installing one-way doors in suitable burrow entrances that are used or may be used by the owls and that would be collapsed or degraded by construction activities. This measure is described below. Artificial burrows

shall be created in an area of the Park determined suitable by a qualified biologist in coordination with Fish and Game staff. The burrows shall be created according to the conservation measures established for this species.

- ▶ To displace burrowing owls without destroying eggs, young, or adults, one-way doors shall be installed on owl burrows before February 1 prior to disturbance, and each burrow shall be monitored following DFG's protocol (California Department of Fish and Game 1995). This measure includes monitoring the burrow for a 48-hour period after the one-way doors are installed. The doors shall be checked every 24 hours following installation to determine whether they are still intact. If the one-way door is still correctly installed after a continuous 48-hour period (i.e., no animals have dug up the door and rendered it useless), then the one-way door shall be removed and the burrows shall be excavated using hand tools and plastic tubing to maintain an escape route for any animals still inside the burrow.

Applies to: Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction

Responsible Party: City of Chico

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2E

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2e on page E4-69 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2e: Protect Northwestern Pond Turtle: Identify Habitat, Minimize Potential Impacts, and Mitigate in Consultation with DFG as Needed

Before any ground-disturbing project activities begin, a qualified biologist shall ~~identify~~ confirm potential aquatic and nesting habitat in areas that could be ~~altered or identified~~ impacted by affected by the ~~given~~ Park Improvement Project. The City shall ensure, through coordination of the potential project design with the biologist, that the footprint of project features and construction zones, staging areas, and access routes ~~are designed to avoid direct~~ alternation of or indirect effects on suitable habitat for northwestern pond turtle to the extent feasible and practicable.

If effects to pond turtle habitat cannot be avoided, measures shall be implemented to minimize unavoidable effects the amount of habitat affected shall be minimized. Before beginning any project activities in such habitat, DFG shall be consulted to confirm that all feasible identify appropriate measures have been implemented ~~anted to avoid loss of to minimize adverse effects on~~ pond turtles. Such measures ~~are likely to include~~ shall include, but would not be limited to, relocating turtles to appropriate areas, installing fencing to exclude turtles from nesting in areas where ground disturbance would occur, conducting worker awareness training, and periodic biological monitoring. All measures deemed appropriate and feasible during this consultation with DFG shall be implemented.

Applies to: Trails Plan and Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-2e would reduce potentially significant impacts on northwestern pond turtle from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to a less than significant level.

IMPACT BIO-2F

The impact discussion of BIO-2f on Page E4-70 of the DEIR has been modified as follows:

Impact BIO-2f: Adverse Effects of Park Improvement Projects on Other Special-Status Wildlife

Special-status bird species that are known to use the riparian woodland and scrub habitat within Bidwell Park are yellow warbler and yellow-breasted chat, both DFG species of special concern. Some areas of riparian habitat along Big Chico Creek appear to provide biophysical habitat elements that are suitable for the state-listed yellow-billed cuckoo, however, this species has not been documented there despite frequent visits by an active birdwatching community. Loggerhead shrike, a DFG species of special concern, occurs in the Park and likely breeds there. In 2006, black rails were observed in Upper Bidwell Park, near Bear Hole. Yellow warbler, yellow-breasted chat, and loggerhead shrike could be affected during construction of the four Park Improvement Projects directly through loss of habitat and increased localized habitat fragmentation. Substantial habitat loss and fragmentation ~~would~~ could potentially result in the reduction of population sizes and diminished use of the project area by some local wildlife populations, including these special-status species. However, implementation of the four Park Improvement Projects would not substantially reduce nesting, foraging, or migration opportunities for these species in the Park because suitable habitat would not be removed in substantial quantities. Therefore, the amount of suitable habitat removed is not expected to affect the distribution, reproductive success, or population viability of these species. Black rails in Upper Park occur in association with marsh habitat. Because this habitat type will be avoided during implementation of the Trails Plan (the only Park Improvement Project that may involve activities near black rail habitat), implementation of the Park Improvement Projects is not expected to result in adverse effects on black rails.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-2F

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-2f on page E4-71 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-2f: Implement Measures to Protect Other Special-status Nesting Birds

The following measures shall be implemented to minimize and mitigate the potential disturbance of nesting special-status birds (February to August).

- ▶ The City shall design Park Improvement Projects to minimize disturbance and removal of nesting habitat for special-status nesting birds to the extent feasible and practicable. Nesting habitat that cannot be avoided shall be removed during the non-nesting season, to the extent feasible and practicable.
- ▶ To avoid potential impacts to active nests of special-status birds, a qualified biologist shall conduct preconstruction surveys to identify active special-status bird nests within 500 feet of construction areas. The survey shall be conducted no more than 10 days before project activities begin. If an active nest is found, an appropriate buffer to minimize impacts shall be determined by a qualified biologist in coordination with DFG. No project activities shall commence within the buffer area until a qualified biologist confirms that the nest is no longer active or the birds are not dependent upon it. The size of the buffer may vary, depending on the nest location, nest stage, and construction activity.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan, and the Disc Golf/ Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction during the breeding season of yellow warbler, yellow-breasted chat, and loggerhead shrike.

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-2f would reduce potentially significant impacts on neotropical migrant landbirds from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-3C

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-3c on page E4-76 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-3c: Implement Measures to Protect Oak Woodland

The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate potential impacts on oak woodlands resulting from implementation of the Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan:

- ▶ Where possible, trails, improvements, and facilities shall be constructed outside of oak woodlands. The number of trails dissecting oak woodlands shall be minimized to the fewest number necessary to accomplish the goals of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects. The width of trails through oak woodlands shall be minimized and trails shall have clearly marked edges that discourage trail widening and deter users from straying off the designated trail.
- ▶ Trails through oak woodlands that are decommissioned as part of a site-specific Park Improvement Project shall be reclaimed using barriers (such as boulders) to discourage continued use of these trails.
- ▶ Grading, trenching, equipment storage, and other soil-disturbing or compacting activities shall not occur within the driplines of oak trees. New structures and impervious-surface materials shall not be placed in the driplines of oaks, except where deemed necessary to reduce the footprint size of tees as part of the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan and to reduce soil compaction.
- ▶ To ensure that the driplines of oaks are not disturbed during construction, protective fencing shall be installed, under the guidance of a qualified botanist, certified arborist, or Registered Professional Forester, at least 1 foot beyond the outer edge of the driplines of all oaks that grow within the construction zones of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects, and no project activities shall be allowed within these exclusion zones, unless specifically required as part of project construction.
- ▶ The oak woodland management guidelines contained in Section 3 of the NRMP (Appendix C of the BPMMP) shall be implemented. These guidelines include recommendations for sustaining oak woodlands, initiating a burning program, and maintaining the oak landscape.

In addition to the measures outlined above, the following additional measures shall be implemented in connection with development and ongoing maintenance of the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead Concept Plan to protect oaks and to mitigate for any unavoidable loss resulting from mortality over time. These measures are based on site observations, oak woodland management guidelines provided by DFG, and measure recommended in the tree assessment (Appendix E4):

- ▶ Any modification to the proposed design and layout of the site shall be subject to the same impact avoidance and minimization criteria as the initial design;

- ▶ Information describing the value of native oak trees and the importance of the preservation and protection of oak woodland for wildlife habitat and the aesthetic values of Bidwell Park shall be provided at the informational kiosk at the Disc Golf/Trailhead area site. The information shall discuss the importance of avoiding direct impacts resulting from bark and limb damage as well as indirect effects such as soil compaction/root damage and shall encourage site users to act responsibly and prevent adverse effects.
- ▶ In cases where disc golf pins are located within groves of oak trees or oak trees are within fairways, measures to protect the tree trunks such as the installation of shielding pole structures shall be implemented. Installation shall be implemented without damage to the root zone, and in a manner that preserves the visual character of the site.
- ▶ In cases where tees or trails are located within driplines of oaks or in the immediate vicinity of driplines, a 6 inch layer of woodchip mulch shall be applied to a 20' radius around the tees and on the trails to minimize soil compaction; this layer shall be maintained on an ongoing basis, as needed, to ensure continued protection of the root zones.
- ▶ Periodic monitoring of the oaks at the site shall be conducted to determine if any unavoidable impacts are occurring as a result of site use, in spite of the impact minimization measures.
- ▶ Any unavoidable impacts to oaks resulting from construction, or tree mortality resulting from ongoing use of the site shall be mitigated by replanting oak woodland habitat at the Disc Golf/Trailhead site in areas located outside of the footprint of facilities and trails in areas not currently occupied by other sensitive resources and suitable to support blue oak woodland.
 - Oak planting should be from seeds (acorns) or seedlings that are obtained from the local genetic stock and should be of the same species as those targeted for replacement. Replacement ratios shall be at least 5:1 for trees lost/replaced that are greater than 5 inches diameter at breast height.
 - Oak plantings shall be protected from browsing, planted on the north and east side of existing trees, and irrigated during the first few years as outlined in the oak assessment (Appendix E4) to enhance their chance of survival.
 - Replacement plantings shall be monitored for their success for a period of five years or until the desired performance criterion of 5:1 is achieved, whichever is longer. If planting does not succeed, remedial actions such as replanting shall be implemented.
 - If requested, community/user group stewardship of the plantings shall be allowed to contribute to restoration/revegetation efforts under guidance and supervision by City staff.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and during construction activities within or in the immediate vicinity of oak woodland habitat; ongoing for site management of the Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan site.

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-3c would reduce potentially significant impacts on oak woodland from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to a less than significant level.

MITIGATION MEASURE BIO-4

The following changes have been made to mitigation measure BIO-4 on page E4-82 of the DEIR:

Mitigation Measure BIO-4: Implement Measures to Protect Jurisdictional Wetlands

The following measures shall be implemented to mitigate impacts on waters of the United States:

- ▶ Before the implementation of specific components of the Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan that occur in the immediate vicinity of wetlands or other waters of the United States, a delineation of waters of the United States, including wetlands, that would be affected by the proposed projects shall be made by qualified biologists through the formal Section 404 wetland delineation process. The delineation shall be submitted to and verified by USACE.
- ▶ If, based on the verified delineation, it is determined that fill of waters of the United States would result from implementation of any of the site-specific Park Improvement Projects, authorization for such fill shall be secured from USACE through the Section 404 permitting process.
- ▶ The acreage of waters of the United States, including wetlands, that would be adversely affected by project construction shall be replaced or restored/enhanced on a “no net loss” basis in accordance with USACE regulations and City General Plan Policy OS. G-9. Habitat restoration, enhancement, and/or replacement shall be at a location and by methods agreeable to USACE, as determined during the Section 404 permitting process.
- ▶ Purchasing credits at a mitigation bank is the City’s preferred method of mitigation.
- ▶ Concurrently with the CWA Section 404 permit, the City shall obtain CWA Section 401 Clean Water Certification from the Central Valley RWQCB before project implementation.
- ▶ The City shall also coordinate with the Central Valley RWQCB regarding any wetland features that are not subject to USACE jurisdiction under Section 404 of the CWA, but may be subject to State regulation under the Porter Cologne Act. All conditions required by the RWQCB as part of the Section 401 Water Quality Certification process or Porter Cologne permitting process shall be implemented.

Applies to: Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

Timing/Implementation: Before and concurrent with any component of the Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan that involve ground-disturbing activities in or near jurisdictional wetlands and/or waters of the state

Responsible Party: City of Chico

Implementation of Mitigation Measure BIO-4 would reduce potentially significant impacts on wetlands subject to USACE jurisdiction and wetland subject to the State’s Porter Cologne Act resulting from implementation of Park Improvement Projects to less than significant.

IMPACT BIO-6

The following information has been added to the first paragraph on Page E4-84 of the DEIR:

Impact Bio-6: Fragmentation of Wildlife Habitat

Habitat fragmentation is a central issue of concern in conservation biology (Meffe and Carroll 1997). Several definitions of habitat fragmentation have been proposed (see Franklin et al. 2002); in general, however, fragmentation is the disintegration or subdivision of resources, ecological conditions, or habitat blocks into smaller, less continuous units. Fragmentation can result from land conversion, certain land uses (e.g., intensive timber harvest), and road development. However, the degree to which a landscape is considered “fragmented” is a complex issue and is species- and scale-dependent (Franklin et al. 2002). Furthermore, implementation of the Trails Plan and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan as well as the Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan would lead to an overall gain in habitat when compared with existing conditions, as many unofficial trails would be closed and allowed to revegetate, or actively be restored. The overall footprint of the area affected by disc golf play would be reduced and currently uncontrolled parking would be limited to smaller formalized parking areas as a result of implementation of any of the alternatives.

Habitat fragmentation can exacerbate more direct effects of habitat loss by diminishing the value of remaining resource conditions or habitat units. This loss in value applies particularly to species that are positively associated with interior habitats, are negatively associated with biophysical characteristics of habitat edges or abrupt transition zones, require core areas, and are sensitive to the size and spatial distribution of habitat blocks.

The hydrologic, topographic, and elevation gradients in Bidwell Park support a diverse mix and distribution of plant communities and wildlife habitats, including riparian corridors along streams, oak woodland, pine-oak woodland, chaparral, and grassland. In addition to biophysical gradients, several other factors affect the existing distribution and quality of wildlife habitats, abundance and distribution of species, and animal community structure in Bidwell Park: recreation use, land use patterns and management activities, livestock grazing, natural disturbances (e.g., fire history), and demographic processes. The BPMMP includes goals and guidelines to ensure protection of natural resources and is not expected to substantially change the spatial distribution of habitats or contribute to habitat fragmentation. The Trails Plan and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan would be implemented in areas where habitat fragmentation could be an issue. However, the amount of habitat lost with implementation of these two Park Improvement Projects would be small relative to the overall size of Bidwell Park, the existing extent and distribution of wildlife habitats within the Park and regionally, and the spatial (area) requirements of most wildlife species within the Park. The Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan and Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan are not expected to result in habitat fragmentation, as the elements contained in these places present upgrades to facilities that, for the most part, already exist.

Potential fragmentation of wildlife habitat resulting from implementation of the BPMMP and Park Improvement Projects would be less than significant both individually and cumulatively. No mitigation is required.

Applies to: BPMMP, Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, Cedar Grove Area Concept Plan, Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan

IMPACT BIO CUM-1

The discussion of cumulative impacts on biological resources on page E4-85 of the DEIR has been revised as follows:

Impact BIO Cum-1

Implementation of the goals, objectives, and implementing strategies and guidelines of the BPMMP would ~~not result in~~ avoid adverse effects on biological resources. While some impacts to biological resources would occur as a result of implementation of the Park Improvement Projects, these impacts are relatively minor and would only affect small areas of resources when compared with the overall size of the Park. In several cases, such as with implementation of the Trails Plan, Horseshoe Lake Area Concept Plan, and Disc Golf/Trailhead Area Concept Plan, implementation of the Park Improvement Projects would reduce impacts to sensitive biological resources when compared to current conditions, because these projects have been designed to avoid or minimize impacts on these resources and would offsite a certain degree of resource damage currently resulting from unmitigated trail use and unofficial use of the Disc Golf/Trailhead site for disc golf. This analysis contains mitigation measures that would reduce all impacts to biological resources resulting from implementation of the Park Improvement Projects to less than significant. Bidwell Park provides a large, continuous habitat for many plant and wildlife species. It also functions as a migration corridor for wildlife. These functions will be preserved and enhanced.

Regarding impacts to sensitive biological resources in the surrounding area, it appears that areas adjacent to Upper Park, barring the Canyon Oaks subdivision, largely consist of large tracts of undeveloped grazing lands. The City is currently involved in the process of transforming the 750 acre Bidwell Ranch site adjacent to Upper Park near Wildwood Park into a wetland mitigation and conservation bank. This will further enhance high quality contiguous habitat on the City's east side, resulting in and urban growth boundary. The City also has entered into the BCAG-sponsored development of a Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) for Butte County. This process will result in long-term protection of the most sensitive biological resources which are predominantly found on the City's eastern edge and consist of vernal pools and associated Butte County meadowfoam and other vernal pool associated species. The HCP process is being used to inform the City's General Plan Update, which is identifying new areas to accommodate and estimated additional populations of 50,000 by 2030.

Based on the analysis presented above, by implementation of the proposed corridor and no cumulative impacts to biological resources are expected to result from project implementation.

IMPACT CUL-1B

The impact discussion of CUL-1b on Page E4-94 of the DEIR has been modified as follows:

Impact CUL-1a: Change in Resource Significance with Implementation of the BPMMP

Construction of the proposed parking lot and associated facilities as outlined in the concept plans would directly affect a segment of the Humboldt Wagon Road, approximately 700 feet in length under Alternatives A and B, a segment approximately 500 feet in length under Alternative B C. The entire length of the recorded segment of the wagon road is approximately 1,900 feet, therefore direct impacts would compromise 26 to 37 percent of the route in this area. Based upon the intrusion of the associated facilities, the proposed Disc Golf/Trailhead has the potential to indirectly impact (or adversely change) the setting of other portions of the wagon road. A light scatter of historic artifacts associated with the route appears to be outside of the project footprint and will not be directly impacted by facilities construction.

SECTION E4.3.6 HAZARDS AND HAZARDOUS MATERIALS

The following changes have been made on Page E4-109 of the DEIR:

STEEP SLOPES

Many of the hiking trails (~~both official and unmitigated~~) in Bidwell Park are located on the rims of the canyon walls. If one goes off-trail, there is the danger of slipping and falling down one of these slopes, as evidenced by the spring 2003 death of an individual intent on retrieving a disc at the disc golf course, and another injury that occurred in spring 2003 when an individual fell off a steep cliff while watching the sunrise.

FORMER MILITARY PRACTICE RANGE

According to Bruce Gray, a board member of the Chico Rod and Gun Club, a military practice range existed near the current Easter ~~Day~~ cross.

IMPACT PS-1: FIRE PROTECTION

The following change has been made to Impact PS-1: Fire Protection on Page E4-153 of the DEIR:

Fire protection in Bidwell Park is provided by the City of Chico Fire Department, with the Butte County Fire Department and California Department of Forestry (CDF) also providing response for the more remote areas of the Park under mutual aid agreements. CDF also operates an Air Attack Base Station on property leased from the Chico Municipal Airport. The risk of ~~wildlife~~ wildfire in Bidwell Park, and especially in Upper Park is generally considered high.